# REMEDIATION OF SEDIMENTS

- Metro and the City each agree to pay into the Registry Account established under paragraph 4 of this Decree:
  - The sum of six million dollars (\$6,000,000); or a.
- b. As permitted by the Panel pursuant to paragraph 13, a sum of funds that in combination with in-kind services has a total value of six million dollars (\$6,000,000), to be applied to the costs of sediment remediation. The Panel shall use these funds and services only for sediment remediation, which shall include administering, planning, designing, implementing, and monitoring the results of sediment remediation projects, in Elliott Bay and the Duwamish River, except as specifically provided in paragraph 22 of this Decree. provided for herein shall be paid in accordance with paragraphs 20 and 21 of this Decree.
- This Decree obligates Metro and the City each to pay 18 || only up to the following amounts in each of the identified calendar years for the costs of sediment remediation, except as otherwise provided for in this paragraph:

```
1992 -
       $ 500,000 - Five Hundred Thousand Dollars;
```

1993 -\$1,000,000 - One Million Dollars;

1994 -\$1,500,000 - One Million Five Hundred Thousand Dollars;

1995 -\$1,500,000 - One Million Five Hundred Thousand Dollars;

1996 -\$1,500,000 - One Million Five Hundred Thousand Dollars ; and

Balance of Six Million Dollar contribution.

If Metro's or the City's annual payment in any given year is less

25 26

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16 (

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

U.S. Department of Justice Environmental Enforcement Section c/o GC-DOJ DARC 7600 Sand Point Way N.E. Seattle, Washington 98115-0070

27

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

25

26

than that year's annual maximum, its annual maximum in the successive year may be increased by the difference between the annual maximum and the annual payment from the preceding year. Metro and the City may at their discretion waive any one or all of their respective annual maximums by increasing the amount paid. Any such payments in excess of the amounts shown above shall in no way increase the sum total of amounts to be paid by either Metro or the City beyond its respective six million dollar (\$6,000,000) obligation.

- Metro and the City agree to each pay a minimum sum of one hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$150,000) into the Account on January 15 and on July 15 in each of the years 1992, 1993, 1994, 1995 and 1996 for funding costs of sediment remediation. Such payments shall constitute partial payment of the maximum amounts as set forth in paragraph 19 of this Decree. Metro and the City shall pay any additional amount for sediment remediation, over and above the minimum sum referenced herein, only as the Panel budgets for such expenses. Metro and the City shall pay any such additional amount into the Account on January 15 of the calendar year for which the Panel plans to incur such an expense.
- The Panel may use funds paid into the Account for sediment remediation for expenses of habitat development, including costs of monitoring, if such habitat development is incidental to sediment remediation projects, or is specifically required as conditions of permits for sediment remediation

U.S. Department of Justice Environmental Enforcement Section c/o GC-DOJ DARC 7600 Sand Point Wav N.E.

Seattle, Washington 98115-0070

CONSENT DECREE - 27

- 23. The Pancl shall, to the greatest extent practicable, select sites for sediment remediation projects that are geographically and physically associated with Metro or City CSOs or storm drain outfalls.
- 24. The Panel shall use, if available, Ecology's list of sites requiring sediment cleanup as a basis for selecting sites for sediment remediation projects under this Decree, but shall not be bound by any priorities developed by Ecology for addressing the list of sites. Metro and the City shall provide to Ecology all information in their possession useful and relevant to Ecology's hazard assessment of station clusters of potential concern.
- 25. For each sediment remediation project, the Panel shall conduct a site cleanup study, determine the site-specific cleanup standard, and select a site cleanup action. In no event shall the Panel set a site specific cleanup standard for a project that is less stringent than the minimum cleanup level as set forth in the State of Washington's Sediment Management Standards,

  Chapter 173-204 WAC, as that standard exists at the time the Panel selects a project. In establishing site-specific cleanup standards, the Panel shall, consistent with the purposes of this Decree, set a cleanup objective of no adverse effects pursuant to

25

22

23

3

4

5

6

7 |

8

10

11

12 |

13

14

15

16

17

27

28 CONSENT DECREE - 28

The Panel may grant Metro and the City credit against their respective financial obligations under paragraph 19 for the Pier 53 sediment remediation project, so long as the site would otherwise have been on Ecology's list of sites requiring sediment cleanup, the site would otherwise have been selected as a site for sediment remediation by the Panel, and the level of remediation meets the cleanup standard selected by the Panel for 14 that site. If the Panel decides to grant credit, and after review of detailed operational and financial information regarding this project, the Panel shall determine the amount of credit to be applied.

# HABITAT DEVELOPMENT AND REAL ESTATE ACQUISITION

- Metro and the City each agree to pay into the Registry Account, established under paragraph 4 of this Decree:
- The sum of two million five hundred thousand dollars (\$2,500,000); or
- As permitted by the Panel pursuant to paragraph 13, a sum of funds that in combination with in-kind services has a total value of two million five hundred thousand

26

7

8 |

13 |

15

17 |

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

U.S. Department of Justice Environmental Enforcement Section c/o GC-DOJ DARC 7600 Sand Point Way N.E.

27

Seattle, Washington 98115-0070

dollars (\$2,500,000), to be applied to the costs of habitat development. The Panel shall use these funds and services only for habitat development, which includes acquiring living natural resources for the purpose of habitat restoration and replacement and administering, planning, designing, constructing, and monitoring the results of habitat development projects, in Elliott Bay and the Duwamish River. Solely for the purposes of habitat development, the Panel may consider the Duwamish River to include tributaries to the Duwamish River. The sums provided for herein shall be paid in accordance with paragraphs 28 and 29 of this Decree.

28 This Decree obligates Metro and the City each to pay only up to the following amounts in each of the identified calendar years:

1992 - \$200,000 - Two Hundred Thousand Dollars;
1993 - \$200,000 - Two Hundred Thousand Dollars;
1994 - \$500,000 - Five Hundred Thousand Dollars;
1995 - \$800,000 - Eight Hundred Thousand Dollars;
1996 - \$800,000 - Eight Hundred Thousand Dollars; and
1997 - Balance of Two Million Five Hundred Thousand Dollar contribution.

If Metro's or the City's annual payment in any given year is less than that year's annual maximum, its annual maximum in the successive year may be increased by the difference between the annual maximum and the annual payment from the preceding year. Metro and the City may at their discretion waive any one or all of their respective annual maximums by increasing the amount paid. Any such payments in excess of the amounts shown above

U.S. Department of Justice Environmental Enforcement Section c/o GC-DOJ DARC 7600 Sand Point Way N.E.

Seattle, Washington 98115-0070

- 29. Metro and the City agree to each pay a minimum sum of sixty-two thousand five hundred dollars (\$62,500) into the Account on January 15 and on July 15 in each of the years 1992, 1993, 1994, 1995 and 1996 for funding costs of habitat development. Such payments shall constitute partial payment of the maximum amounts as set forth in paragraph 27 of this Decree. Metro and the City shall pay any additional amount for habitat development, over and above the minimum sum referenced herein, only as the Panel budgets for such expenses. Metro and the City shall pay any such additional amount into the Account on January 15 of the calendar year for which the Panel plans to incur such an expense.
- 30. In addition to the contribution specified in paragraph 27 of this Decree, Metro and the City each shall make permanently available real property with a value of up to two 19 million five hundred thousand dollars (\$2,500,000) for use as sites for habitat development projects selected by the Panel. Metro and the City each shall receive credit toward its respective maximum obligation under this paragraph for any donation by Metro or the City of any right of access, lease, easement, fee title, or any other real property interest, sufficient to permanently secure a site for any habitat

27

1

3

4

11

12

13

15

16

171

20 l

22

23

24

U.S. Department of Justice Environmental Enforcement Section c/o GC-DOJ DARC 7600 Sand Point Way N.E.

Seattle, Washington 98115-0070

development project under this Decree. The Panel shall attempt  $2 \parallel$  to determine by consensus the value of any property interest made available pursuant to this paragraph. If the Panel cannot so determine the value of any such property, then the value of the property shall be determined by the following procedure. Trustees and donor of the property shall each retain or select a qualified real estate appraisor to determine the value of the property. Within sixty (60) days thereafter, the two appraisers shall attempt in good faith to reach agreement on the value of the donated property. If these appraisers cannot agree, then they shall within thirty (30) days select a third appraiser. This third appraiser shall determine within thirty (30) days which of the two appraisals most closely approximates the value of the selected property and he or she shall select that appraisal value as the value of the donated property. All appraisers retained or selected shall be competent, impartial and members of the American Institute of Real Property Appraisers (or successor association or body of comparable standing). parties agree that the value established by this procedure shall be final, and there shall be no further review or appeal. public access to such areas shall be preserved to the maximum extent practicable, except as restrictions are necessitated by construction activities.

The Panel shall, to the greatest extent practicable consistent with the goal of creating or enhancing aquatic or

26

11

12 !

13 l

14

15 l

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

U.S. Department of Justice Environmental Enforcement Section c/o GC-DOJ DARC 7600 Sand Point Way N.E. Scattle, Washington 98115-0070

benthic habitat for natural resources, select sites for habitat development projects that are geographically and physically associated with existing public facilities, such as parks and fishing piers, in Elliott Bay and the Duwamish River.

32. Metro and the City each agree to pay NOAA the sum of one hundred twenty-five thousand dollars (\$125,000) within sixty (60) days of entry of this Consent Decree to reimburse NOAA for the costs of natural resource damage assessment and habitat restoration planning for Elliott Bay and the Duwamish River incurred prior to the entry of this Decree. NOAA will provide Metro and the City with documentation describing the manner in which the funds are applied.

## SOURCE CONTROL

protect natural resources and prevent recontamination of sites selected for sediment remediation or habitat development in the covered area. Metro and the City shall determine for their respective source control programs what actions or changes, if any, are needed in addition to, or from, their ongoing source control programs to achieve such goals. Metro and the City shall propose such additional actions or changes to the Panel for its review, comment and approval. Metro and the City shall then take such actions approved by the Panel. The Panel shall not require Metro and the City to use or undertake any type or manner of source control that is beyond Metro's and the City's authority,

CONSENT DECREE - 33

or otherwise inconsistent with law.

34. Metro and the City each shall make available in-kind services with a value of up to one million dollars (\$1,000,000) to cover the costs of the additional actions or changes needed to achieve the Panel's goals and to monitor the effectiveness of such source control efforts. Metro and the City each may fulfill its entire and respective obligation under this paragraph by providing in-kind services. Within ninety (90) days after the close of each calendar year in which such in-kind services have been provided, Metro and the City shall cause an accounting of such services to be prepared and made available to all members of the Panel.

## INDEPENDENT CONTRACTOR

35. It is understood and agreed that Metro, the City, and the agents, officers, employees, and contractors of either of them, in the performance of the work and services provided under this Decree as in-kind contributions shall act as independent contractors and not as agents or employees of any other party to this Decree.

#### COVENANTS NOT TO SUE

36. Except as specifically provided in paragraphs 39 and 40, the United States, the State of Washington, the Suquamish Indian Tribe and the Muckleshoot Indian Tribe covenant not to sue or to take any other civil or administrative action against the City or Metro for covered matters.

CONSENT DECREE - 34

10 11

12 | 13

15

16

17 18

19

20 21 |

22

23 |

26 27

CONSENT DECREE - 35

37. Except as specifically provided in paragraph 41, the City and Metro hereby covenant not to sue or to take any other civil or administrative action against the United States, the State of Washington, the Suquamish Indian Tribe and the Muckleshoot Indian Tribe for any claims relating to or arising from the filing of the United States' complaint referenced herein, the conduct of this litigation, including but not limited to any claims for contribution or indemnification, and the negotiation, terms, approval, and implementation of this Consent Decree.

These covenants not to sue and the following reservation of rights shall take effect upon entry of this Consent Decree by the Court, subject to the parties' rights to void the Consent Decree pursuant to paragraph 54 if the Court declines to approve the Consent Decree as presented. covenants not to sue remain in effect so long as the City and Metro are fulfilling or have fulfilled their obligations under this Consent Decree.

## RESERVATION OF RIGHTS

Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States, the State of Washington, the Suquamish Indian Tribe and Muckleshoot Indian Tribe reserve the right to institute proceedings against Metro and the City in this action or a new action for the following claims: (a) claims for recovery of natural resource damages in the covered area based on

- Decree, the State of Washington reserves its right to institute proceedings against Metro and the City for claims pursuant to the Model Toxics Control Act, Chapter 70.105D RCW, based, in whole or in part, on factors not known at the time of entry of this Consent Decree that indicate a previously unknown threat to human health or the environment.
- 41. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent
  Decree, Metro and the City reserve the right to institute
  proceedings against the United States, the State of Washington,
  the Suquamish Indian Tribe and the Muckleshoot Indian Tribe for
  the following claims: (a) claims based on a failure by the
  United States, the State of Washington, the Suquamish Indian
  Tribe and the Muckleshoot Indian Tribe to fulfill their
  obligations under this Decree; and (b) claims based on a
  challenge to any decision by the Panel. Metro's and the City's
  reservations of rights pursuant to this paragraph do not include
  claims against the Trustees for monetary relief. Nothing in this
  paragraph is intended to constitute a waiver of any sovereign

U.S. Department of Justice Environmental Enforcement Section c/o GC-DOJ DARC 7600 Sand Point Way N.E. Seattle, Washington 98115-0070

CONSENT DECREE - 36

The United States' consent to this Decree and participation in this settlement is solely on its own behalf and not as a trustee for any Indian Tribe.

# CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION

- The United States, the State of Washington, the Suquamish Indian Tribe and the Muckleshoot Indian Tribe acknowledge and agree that the payments to be made and commitment of work by Metro and the City pursuant to this Decree represent a good faith settlement and compromise of disputed claims and that the settlement represents a fair, reasonable and equitable discharge of liability for covered matters. Metro and the City shall have the benefits of Section 113(f) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f), and any other applicable statute or other law limiting or extinguishing their liability to persons not a party to this Decree or affording them rights of contribution or other rights to recover from such persons costs or damages.
- The United States, the State of Washington, the Suquamish Indian Tribe and the Muckleshoot Indian Tribe certify that the payments to be made and the work to be undertaken by Metro and the City pursuant to this Decree will be appropriate actions necessary to protect and restore the natural resources allegedly damaged by the release by Metro and the City of hazardous substances in the covered area and that the payments and work satisfy the requirements of Section 122(j)(2) of CERCLA,

25 | 26

1

2

3

4

5

6

14

15

16 l

17

18

1<del>9</del>

21

27

5 6

7 8

Λ

11

12 13

14 15

16

17 18

19 20

21

22

23

2526

27

CONSENT DECREE - 38

#### GENERAL

- 45. If for any reason the Court should decline to approve this Consent Decree in the form presented, any statements made in negotiation and the terms herein may not be used as evidence in any litigation or administrative proceeding.
- 46. This Consent Decree shall not be construed in any way to relieve the parties to this Decree or any other person or entity from the obligation to comply with any federal, state or local law.
- 47. This Consent Decree does not relieve or otherwise satisfy any obligation or liability of any person or entity not party to this Decree.
- 48. The Consent Decree may be executed in any number of counterparts and each executed counterpart shall have the same force and effect as an original instrument.
- 49. Each undersigned representative of the parties to the Consent Decree certifies that he or she is fully authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of the Consent Decree and to legally execute, and bind such party to, this Consent Decree.

#### MODIFICATION

50. The terms of this Consent Decree may be modified only by a subsequent written agreement by all of the parties signatory hereto, and approved by the Court as a modification to this Consent Decree.

6

7

8

11

12 1

13 !

14 |

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

51. If a court of competent jurisdiction finds unlawful any provision of this Consent Decree, including subparagraphs a-c of paragraph 4, the parties shall return the Decree to the Court for reformation consistent with the intent of the parties at the time they lodged the Decree with the Court.

# PUBLIC COMMENT

- period in accordance with Section 122(d)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9622(d)(2), and 28 C.F.R. 50.7. The United States reserves the right to withdraw its consent to the Decree if comments received disclose facts or considerations which show that the Decree is inappropriate, improper or inadequate. Metro and the City consent to the entry of this Consent Decree without further notice.
- Tribe and the State of Washington each reserve the right to withdraw their consent from this Decree and from participation in this settlement if comments received during the public comment period disclose facts or considerations which show that the Decree is inappropriate, improper or inadequate as to the Suquamish Indian Tribe, the Muckleshoot Indian Tribe and the State of Washington, respectively. To exercise its right to withdraw, each of these parties shall file with the Court a written statement expressly indicating its intent to withdraw. These parties must exercise their right to withdraw before the

26

25

27 CONSENT DECREE - 39

I United States Department of Justice files its motion to enter this Decree with the Court. Withdrawal by any one or all of these parties shall not in any way affect the rights and obligations of any other party to this Decree. If any one or all of these parties withdraws, any and all references to such a party or parties in the Decree, except those in paragraphs L, M(3), 15, 24, 25 and 26, shall by implication be stricken from the Decree and shall have no meaning or bearing on the operation of any term of this Decree. Withdrawal by any of these parties shall not impose any obligation on any other party to also withdraw nor shall any inference be made as to the propriety of any other party's continued consent to this Decree and participation in this settlement. If either or both the Suguamish Indian Tribe or the Muckleshoot Indian Tribe withdraws, the continued participation by the United States in this settlement is not intended to nor shall it constitute a settlement or waiver of any rights under statute, treaty or common law of such Tribe or Tribes.

#### VOIDABILITY

If for any reason the Court should decline to approve this Decree in the form presented, this Decree and the settlement embodied herein shall be voidable at the sole discretion of any party and the terms herein may not be used as evidence in any litigation.

25

24

5

7

8

11

12

13

15

16

18

19

20

21

22

23

26

27

CONSENT DECREE - 40

7 8

...

CONSENT DECREE - 41

55. This Consent Decree shall be effective upon the date of its entry by the Court.

## DENIAL OF LIABILITY

56. Metro and the City both deny each of the allegations of the complaint filed by the United States and further deny responsibility for the natural resources damages and any other costs or relief sought by the Trustees. The parties agree that actions undertaken by the City and Metro in accordance with this Consent Decree do not constitute an admission of any violation of treaty, federal or state law or an admission of any liability by the City or Metro to the United States, the State of Washington, the Suquamish Indian Tribe and Muckleshoot Indian Tribe. Nor shall this Consent Decree be used as evidence or as collateral estoppel against any party to this Decree in any action or proceeding other than an action or proceeding to enforce the terms of this Consent Decree.

#### RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

- 57. The Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of entering such further orders, direction, or relief as may be appropriate for the construction, implementation, or enforcement of this Decree.
- 58. By signature below, all parties consent to this Decree.

For King County

Pam Bissonette

Seattle, WA 98104

400 Yesler Way, Room 700

King County Department of Natural Resources

Director

CONSENT DECREE - 42

4/26/99

Date / /

## FOR THE CITY OF SEATTLE

City of Seattle Municipal Building, 10th Floor

City Attorney

600 Fourth Avenue

Seattle, Washington

CONSENT DECREE - 43

april 19, 1999

# 1 FOR THE SUQUAMISH INDIAN TRIBE

Suquamish, Washington 98392

Chairman

Suquamish Tribal Council 15838 Sandyhook Road P.O. Box 498 

CONSENT DECREE - 44 24 May /999
Date

# FOR THE MUCKLESHOOT INDIAN TRIBE

Muckleshoot Indian Tribe 39015 172nd Avenue S.E. Auburn, Washington 98002

4 John Daniels, Chairman 5 Muckleshoot I

**7** 

CONSENT DECREE - 45

4/23/99

Date

1	FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
2	
3	J/16/59
4	Lois J Schiffer Date Assistant Attorney General
5	Environment and Natural Resources Division U.S. Department of Justice
6	washington, D.C. 20530
7	
8	J. Nin- 10/7/99
9	James L. Nicoll Date Date
0	Environmental Enforcement Section Environment and Natural Resources Division
1	U.S. Department of Justice c/o NOAA GC/DOJ Damage Assessment Center
2	7600 Sand Point Way N.E. Seattle, Washington 98115-0070
3	Betterie, masiring
14	711-
15	Brian C. Kipnis Date
16	Assistant United States Attorney
17	3600 SeaFirst Fifth Avenue Plaza 800 Fifth Avenue
18	Seattle, Washington 98104
19	
20	
21	So ordered.
22	Oct. 13, 1999.
23	
24	helban L. Korger
25	Cl.S. District Julga

U.S. Department of Justice
Environmental Enforcement Section

c/o GC-DOJ DARC 7600 Sand Point Way N.E.

Seattle, Washington 98115-0070

CONSENT DECREE - 47