

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	2
II. FINDINGS	8
III. SUMMARY OF INVESTIGATIVE STEPS	10
IV. FACTUAL SUMMARY	12
A. Bernard Nussbaum's Involvement in the Hiring of Craig Livingstone Was Very Limited and Did Not Include Discussions with Mrs. Clinton Regarding Mr. Livingstone	12
1. Mr. Livingstone Recalled Meeting with Christine Varney, Cheryl Mills, Bernard Nussbaum, and William Kennedy	13
2. Ms. Mills Recalled That She and Mr. Foster Met with Mr. Livingstone.	16
3. Mr. Kennedy Recalled That Mr. Livingstone Was Already in Place at OPS When He Arrived.	17
4. Craig Livingstone Wrote Memoranda to Cheryl Mills and William Kennedy Regarding OPS Operations	19
B. The Evidence of a Relationship Between Mrs. Clinton and Mrs. Livingstone Is Limited to the Insert and Testimony That Mr. Kennedy and Mr. Livingstone Told Others of Such a Relationship	22
1. Former FBI Agent Gary Aldrich Asserted That Mrs. Clinton and Mr. Livingstone Had a Personal Relationship.	23
2. Agent Sculimbrene Told Senate Investigators and the OIC His Understanding Was Derived from Mr. Kennedy and Possibly From Mr. Livingstone Himself	25

3.	Mr. Livingstone Admitted That it Was Possible That He Told Agents Aldrich or Sculimbrene or Others That President and Mrs. Clinton Were Involved in Hiring Him	27
C.	Mr. Nussbaum Testified That He Was Unaware of a Relationship Between Mrs. Clinton and Mrs. Livingstone Who Also Denied a Personal Relationship	28
1.	Mr. Nussbaum Testified That He Was Unaware of a Personal Relationship Between Mrs. Clinton and Mrs. Livingstone.	29
2.	Mr. Livingstone's Mother, Gloria Livingstone, Denied Any Personal Relationship With Mrs. Clinton	29
3.	Mrs. Clinton Denied Knowing Mrs. Livingstone and Having Any Involvement in Hiring Craig Livingstone	30
D.	The Circumstances Surrounding the Preparation of the Insert Do Not Corroborate its Accuracy.	30
1.	Agent Sculimbrene Had No Independent Recollection of the Interview with Mr. Nussbaum or Preparing the Insert	31
2.	Mr. Nussbaum Had No Independent Recollection of the Interview with Agent Sculimbrene.	33
3.	Former White House Counsel's Office Detailee Francis Sobol Did Not Recall Being Interviewed by Agent Sculimbrene.	34
V.	ANALYSIS OF POTENTIAL STATUTORY VIOLATIONS	35
A.	There Is No Evidence, Other Than the Insert, That Mr. Nussbaum's Limited Involvement in the Hiring of Craig Livingstone Included a Discussion With Mrs. Clinton About Mr. Livingstone or That He Knew Who Hired Mr. Livingstone.	36

	Page
B. Even Assuming That Mr. Livingstone and Mr. Kennedy Told Others of Mrs. Clinton's Involvement in the Hiring of Mr. Livingstone, There Is No Other Evidence, Except the Insert, of Such Involvement or Any Relationship Between Mrs. Clinton and Mrs. Livingstone.	37
C. The Insert's Probative Value is Limited Because of the Absence of Corroboration of the Circumstances of Its Preparation . . .	38
VI. SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS	40