Holocene Vegetation History from Fossil Rodent Middens near Arequipa, Peru

Camille A. Holmgren

Department of Geosciences, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona 85721 E-mail: holmgren@geo.arizona.edu

Julio L. Betancourt and Kate Aasen Rylander

U.S. Geological Survey, 1675 W. Anklam Rd., Tucson, Arizona 85745 USA

Jose Roque and Oscar Tovar

Department of Monocotiledóneas y Gimnospermas, Museo de Historia Natural de la Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos, Avenida Arenales 1256, Jesús María, Apartado 14-0434, Lima, Peru

Horacio Zeballos and Eliana Linares

Departamento de Ciencias Biológicas y Agropecuarias, Universidad de San Agustín, Avenida Carrión, Arequipa, Peru

and

Jay Quade

Department of Geosciences, University of Arizona, Tucson, Arizona 85721

Received January 4, 2001

Rodent (Abrocoma, Lagidium, Phyllotis) middens collected from 2350 to 2750 m elevation near Arequipa, Peru (16°S), provide an \sim 9600-yr vegetation history of the northern Atacama Desert, based on identification of >50 species of plant macrofossils. These midden floras show considerable stability throughout the Holocene, with slightly more mesophytic plant assemblages in the middle Holocene. Unlike the southwestern United States, rodent middens of mid-Holocene age are common. In the Arequipa area, the midden record does not reflect any effects of a mid-Holocene mega drought proposed from the extreme lowstand (100 m below modern levels, >6000 to 3500 yr B.P.) of Lake Titicaca, only 200 km east of Arequipa. This is perhaps not surprising, given other evidence for wetter summers on the Pacific slope of the Andes during the middle Holocene as well as the poor correlation of summer rainfall among modern weather stations in the central Andes-Atacama Desert. The apparent difference in paleoclimatic reconstructions suggests that it is premature to relate changes observed during the Holocene to changes in El Niño Southern Oscillation modes. © 2001 University of Washington.

Key Words: paleovegetation; Holocene; Atacama Desert.

INTRODUCTION

Paleoclimatic records from the central Andes and Atacama Desert are vital to understanding the history of the South American summer monsoon (SASM), and hence the role of the tropics in South American climate variability. The northern Atacama Desert in southern Peru, downwind of key paleorecords such as sediment records from Lake Titicaca (Wirrmann and De Oliveira, 1987; Cross et al., 2000; Rowe et al., in press) and ice core records from Nevado Sajama (Thompson et al., 1998) and at the southern end of the tropical rainfall belt, is especially well situated for such investigations. To date, paleoclimate records from high-altitude lakes, salt lake basins (salars), glacial landforms, ice cores, and alluvial and wetland deposits have provided data on the hydrologic history of the central Andes. Very little is known, however, about the vegetation history of the central Andes south of Lago Junín (11°S, Hansen et al., 1994), with the exception of palynological studies at Lake Titicaca (Ybert, 1992) and Laguna Seca (Baied and Wheeler, 1993). Here, we report on rich plant macrofossil assemblages from fossil rodent middens near Arequipa, the first such midden study in Peru.



As in western North America and other arid regions of the world (Betancourt *et al.*, 1990), rodent middens are abundantly preserved in rock crevices and shelters of the Atacama Desert (Betancourt *et al.*, 2000b). Radiocarbon chronologies from terrestrial plant material in middens are unaffected by reservoir effects that typically afflict lacustrine studies in the central Andes. These deposits also provide higher taxonomic and spatial resolution than other paleobotanical records but are stratigraphically discontinuous, thus representing only "snapshots" of floral assemblages through time. The excellent preservation of plant remains affords high taxonomic resolution, thus also providing an opportunity for biogeographic inferences at the species level, and possibly to the genome level with current advances in molecular biology.

In southern Peru, rodent middens akin to North American packrat middens are made by Lagidium peruanum (Mountain Viscacha: CHINCHILLIDAE), Abrocoma cinerea (ABROC-OMDAE), and several species of Phyllotis (Lear-eared mice: CRICETIDAE) including P. xanthopygus, P. limatus, and P. magister (Steppan, 1998). The large L. peruanum, weighing 900–1600 g, normally inhabits dry, rocky areas between \sim 3000 and 5000 m (spotted as low as 2500 m during our field season), has a foraging range of 75 m, and eats most plant species growing within its range (Pearson and Ralph, 1978). *Phyllotis* (20–100 g) live in rocky or brushy habitats between 0 and 5000 m and have foraging ranges of \sim 35–70 m (Pearson and Ralph, 1978). Like Lagidium, Phyllotis has a varied diet consisting of grasses, forbs, seeds, and insects (Pizzimenti and De Salle, 1980). Generalized diets, along with the collection of plant materials for nest and den construction, ensure that midden assemblages are fairly representative of hillslope vegetation within the foraging ranges of the animals.

STUDY AREA

The study area is located at intermediate elevations on the Pacific slope of the Cordillera Occidental of the Andes, near the city of Arequipa (2350 m) and within 100 km of the sea (Figs. 1 and 2). Elevation increases rapidly to more than 4000 m to the north and northeast within the 30 km² study area. The area is underlain by Cretaceous and Tertiary igneous intrusive rocks and marine sediments, Tertiary and Quaternary volcanic rocks (primarily ignimbrites), and Quaternary eolian and alluvial sediments. Several volcanoes rising more than 6000 m punctuate the landscape.

Precipitation in the northern Atacama $(15^{\circ}-24^{\circ}S)$ occurs primarily during the austral summer and corresponds to the seasonal development of the SASM. During summer, the Intertropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ) migrates southward following the thermal equator, and deep convective heating occurs over the Amazon Basin. A thermally induced low in the lower troposphere intensifies the moisture-laden easterly trade winds, which cross the equator, develop a north–northwesterly flow along the eastern slope of the Andes, and turn cyclonically over



FIG. 1. Map of the subtropical Andes with the location of Arequipa and other study sites mentioned in the text.

the Gran Chaco from 20° to 30° S (Zhou and Lau, 1998). The Bolivian High, an upper tropospheric anticyclone, develops over the Bolivian Altiplano as a result of latent heat released by the convective activity in the Amazon, Central Andes, and South Atlantic Convergence Zone (SACZ; Lenters and Cook, 1997). Interannual variability in summer precipitation is partly influenced by El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO) and the strength and position of the Bolivian High and SACZ (Lenters and Cook, 1999). By contrast, rainfall in the southern Atacama (25° – 30° S) occurs primarily during winter when weakening of the southeast Pacific anticyclone allows polar fronts and cutoff low-pressure cells to penetrate northward (Miller, 1976).

Arequipa receives an annual average of 100 mm of precipitation. Seasonal and interannual variability is evident in a threedimensional graph of historical monthly precipitation for Arequipa constructed from Global Historical Climatology Network 16°5' S

OF

AREQUIPA

16°23

71 33 8

FIG. 2. Map of the study area northwest of Arequipa, Peru. Circles indicate midden locations.

CONTOUR INTERVAL 400 METERS

(GHCN; http://ncdc.noaa.gov/ghcn/ghcn.SELECT.html) data (Fig. 3). Most of the region's moisture originates from SASM storms spilling over the Andes between December and March (percentage of mean annual rainfall is 80% at 4495 m and 91% at 2150 m). The lower percentage of precipitation occurring between December and March at higher elevations is due to an extension of the summer rainy season into November and April. If these months are included, >90% of mean annual precipitation falls during the summer at all sites. An exception is the brief period in the 1950s and 1960s when significant amounts of win-



FIG. 3. Three-dimensional graph of monthly precipitation for Arequipa. White strip in center of graph reflects years for which no data were available.

ter precipitation occurred in Arequipa. This precipitation also appears to have originated primarily from the Amazon Basin, with the largest winter rainfall events in Arequipa corresponding to large peaks in monthly precipitation at one or more Altiplano stations (La Paz, Juliaca, Cuzco, Puno). Precipitation gradients with elevation are primarily a function of distance from the Andean crest. This is due to a lack of rising air masses on the Pacific slope of the Andes, while the few depleted orographic storms that cross the Andes rain out at high elevations, creating a steep decrease in precipitation with decreasing elevation. For every ~ 100 -m decrease in elevation there is a 26-mm decrease in precipitation $[y = 3.8225x + 2343 (r^2 = 0.94, p < 0.01)]$. Vegetation in the area is primarily limited by precipitation, and plant communities change rapidly along the steep elevation-precipitation gradient. Vegetation classification and characteristic species follow Linares (1996). A list of plant taxa and families appears in Table 1.

Below \sim 2400 m the hyperarid "Absolute Desert" is marked by the near absence of vegetation. Matorral Desert with columnar cacti occurs between 2400 and 2800 m. Xerophytic shrubs (Ambrosia fruticosa, Gochnatia arequipensis, Encelia canescens, Balbisia weberbaueri, Krameria lappaceae), columnar cacti (several species of Corryocactus, Oreocereus, Haageocereus, and Weberbauerocereus), and small herbs and grasses (Monnina ramosa, Mastigostila sp., Eragrostis peruviana, Urocarpidium sephardae, and Spergularia stenocarpa) characterize this community. Between 2800 and 3300 m, vegetation consists of Matorral (shrubland) Desert with columnar cacti and Pajonal. This community contains the shrubs Tarasa operculata, Diplostephium tacorense, and Adesmia spinossissima in addition to a mixture of species from the Matorral Desert and Pajonal (grassland). The Pajonal, a high-altitude grassland found between 3300 and 4000 m, is characterized by Stipa obtusa, Baccharis, Parastrephia, Tetraglochin strictum, Plantago monticola, Urocarpidium sephardae, and Cardionema ramossisima. Between 4000 and 4300 m the bunch grasses Festuca orthophylla and Stipa ichu dominate the Pajonal-Pastizal vegetative community. The Pajonal-Pastizal gives way to Tolar-Pajonal above 4300 m. The vegetation in this zone includes Stipa ichu, Calamagrostis, and spiny shrubs known as Tolar with species in the geneara Parastrephia, Senecio, Baccharis, and Tetraglochin. Finally, above 4500 m dispersed cushion plants (Azorella compacta), grasses (Stipa, Festuca, Calamagrostis), and shrubs (Parastrephia and Senecio) form the Almohadillada-Caespitosa community.

METHODS

Fifty-nine rodent middens were collected within a 30-km^2 area northwest of Arequipa, Peru (Table 2). Middens were collected from 2350 to 2600 m and 2600 to 2750 m (Matorral Desert) and processed and analyzed according to well-established procedures (Spaulding *et al.*, 1990). Macrofossil abundances were quantified on a relative scale of 1 to 5. Plant reference materials used to identify midden taxa were collected

Gramadal

Quebrada

icillos

DESERT

 TABLE 1

 List of Plant Taxa and Families Mentioned in Text

Aizoaceae	Caryophyllaceae	Poaeae
<i>Tetragonia</i> sp.	Cardionema ramosissima	Andropogon flavescens
Anacardiaceae	Spergularia stenocarpa	Aristida peruviana
Schinus molle	Chenopodiaceae	Bouteloua simplex
Apiaceae	Atriplex sp.	Bromus trinii
Azorella compacta	Chenopodium sp.	Calamagrostis sp.
Asteraceae	Cyperaceae	Enneapogon desvauxii
Ambrosia fruiticosa	Cyperaceae	Nassella pubiflora
Baccharis sp.	Ephedraceae	Munroa decumbens
Bidens sp.	Ephedra americana	Poa sp.
Chuquiraga sp.	Fabaceae	Eragrostis peruviana
Diplostephium	Adesmia spinosissima	Festuca orthophylla
tacorense	Adesmia sp.	Stipa ichu
Encelia canescens	Crotalaria incana var.	Stipa annua
Galinsoga cf.	incana	Stipa macbridei
parviflora	cf. Hoffmannseggia sp.	Stipa obtusa
Gochnatia arequipensis	Lupinus sp.	Stipa sp.
Grindelia sp.	Geraniaceae	Polygalaceae
Parastrephia sp.	Balbisia weberbaueri	Monnina ramosa
Senecio sp.	Hydrophyllaceae	Polygonaceae
Tagetes multiflora	Nama dichotomum	Chorizanthe sp.
Boraginaceae	<i>Phacelia</i> sp.	Portulacaceae
Cryptantha sp.	Iridaceae	Calendrinia sp.
Pectocarya laterifolia	Mastygostila sp.	Cistanthes sp.
Tiquilia sp.	Krameriaceae	Rosaceae
Brassicaceae	Krameria lappaceae	Tetraglochin strictum
Descuriana sp.	Malvaceae	Rubiaceae
Lepidium sp.	Cristaria sp.	Galium cf. aparine
Sisymbrium sp.	Tarasa operculata	Scrophulariaceae
Bromeliaceae	Urocarpidium sephardae	<i>Castilleja</i> sp.
Tillandsia sp.	Urocarpidium sp.	Solanaceae
Cactaceae	Nyctaginaceae	Lycopersicon sp.
Arequipa hempeliana	Allionia incarnata	Solanum sp.
Corryocatus cf.	Mirabilis sp.	Urticaceae
brevistylus	Plantaginaceae	Parietaria debilis
Erdisia meyenii	Plantago monticola	
Haageocereus sp.	Plantago sp.	
Neoraimondia	~ 1	
arequipensis		
Opuntia sphaerica		
Opuntia ignescens		
Oreocereus sp.		
1		

from field sites and from the herbarium at the Museo de Historia Natural de la Universidad Nacional Mayor de San Marcos in Lima, Peru. Plants presently growing within 100 m of the midden sites were identified in the field or collected and later identified at the Museo de Historia Natural. Calib 4.0 (Stuiver and Reimer, 1993) was used to correct for ¹³C fractionation and convert all corrected dates to calibrated ages.

RESULTS

Radiocarbon dates from 38 middens provide a record of vegetation history in southern Peru spanning \sim 9600 cal yr B.P. (Table 2). The macrofossil record from the rodent middens provides one of the first paleovegetation records from the northern Atacama. More than 50 taxa from 23 families were identified, comparable in taxonomic resolution to recent packrat midden studies in North America (e.g., Betancourt *et al.*, 2000a). The relative abundances of macrofossils from the middens (after Spaulding *et al.*, 1990) are shown in Figure 4. The sites are divided into elevations above and below 2600 m. This division corresponds to a transition within present Matorral Desert, with vegetation above ~2600 m characterized by a noticeable increase in plant cover, especially large shrubs.

Several patterns characterize the vegetation history of both the lower and higher elevation sites. Most notable is the stability and dominance of cacti throughout the Holocene, especially Corryocactus cf. brevistylus, Opuntia sphaerica, Arequipa hempeliana, and the Cereus cacti (Weberbaurerocereus, Oreocereus, and Haageocereus were indistinguisable in midden materials). Pectocarya laterifolia, Plantago sp., Solanum sp., and Tagetes multiflora, are also persistent and abundant in the midden record at all elevations. In addition, many species occur only during the periods where middens are clustered, from 0 to 1000 cal yr B.P. and 2800 to 9560 cal yr B.P. These include annuals (Castilleja sp., Cryptantha sp., Galinsoga cf. parviflora, Lepidium sp., Monnina ramosa, Parietaria debilis, Sisymbrium sp.), small cacti (Erdisia meyenii, Opuntia ignescens), C₄ annual grasses (Bouteloua simplex, Munroa decumbens, Stipa ichu), and perennials (Allionia incarnata, Baccharis sp., Chorizanthe sp., Encelia canescens, Crotalaria incana var. incana, Grindelia sp., Phacelia sp., and Tillandsia sp.).

At the lower-elevation sites, vegetation changes noticeably around 2800 cal yr B.P. with the disappearance or increased rarity of *Galium* cf. *aparine*, *Urocarpidium* sp., *Allionia incarnata*, *Chenopodium* sp., *Chorizanthe* sp., *Lycopersicon* sp., *Tetragonia* sp., *Bromus trinii*, and *Mirabilis* sp. All of these species, however, persisted at higher elevation sites except for *Allionia incarnata*, *Chorizanthe* sp., and *Mirabilis* sp., which are rare or absent above 2600 m during the entire Holocene. At or shortly after 2800 cal yr B.P., *Tiquilia* sp., *Munroa decumbens*, *Stipa annua*, and *Ephedra americana* first appear, while *Opuntia sphaerica*, *Tarasa operculata*, *Enneapogon desvauxii*, and *Krameria lappaceae* increase markedly in abundance. *Ambrosia fruticosa* and *Atriplex* sp. are present and abundant throughout the Holocene at these sites.

Vegetation at higher elevation sites appears more stable than at the lower sites. Here, *Galium* cf. *aparine*, *Lycopersicon* sp., *Calandrinia* sp., *Chenopodium* sp., *Tagetes multiflora*, *Urocarpidium* sp., and *Bromus trinii* all persist during the Holocene. However, a lack of middens between 3380 and 670 cal yr B.P. from higher sites makes it impossible to assess whether vegetation remained stable or experienced change comparable to the lower elevation sites during this period. One noticeable occurrence at higher elevation sites is the appearance of *Stipa ichu* and *Opuntia ignescens* during the mid-Holocene around 5000– 4500 cal yr B.P. Both of these species are characteristic of higher elevations and represent the largest shifts in species distributions (450 m and 750 m, respectively) in our study.

Midden Designation	Material dated	¹⁴ C age (yr B.P.)	SD	δ ¹³ C (‰)	(2σ) age range (yr B.P.)	Lab No.	Latitude (°S)	Longitude (°W)	Elevation (m)	Slope aspect	Rock type	Vertebrates
Conthueve Mine 730 A	anace ctame	6080	02	185	7076 7500	A A 3 1 5 1 1	16°09''	710 /0//	7850	/11	5 1	Thing Aboi Dhli TD
Canihuayo Mine 739B	fecal pellets	3240	0 08 08	-23.5	3625-3172	GX25846	$16^{\circ}08''$	71°49″	2850	: A	LS LS	Phli
Canihuayo Mine 739C	fecal pellets	6870	100	-22.7	7820-7476	AA34598	$16^{\circ}08''$	71°49″	2850	M	ΓS	UR
Cerro Gramadal 735	fecal pellets	815	45	-20.9	773-571	AA34596	$16^{\circ}14.601'$	71°43.569′	2515	SW	SS	UR
Cerro Sombrerayoc 771B	fecal pellets	150	40	-25.8	270-0	GX26355	$16^{\circ}07.662'$	$71^{\circ}49.084'$	2750	NNE	LS	UR
Cerro Sombrerayoc 772	grass florets	195	40	-23.8	283-0	AA36327	$16^{\circ}07.685'$	71.49.126′	2750	MNW	LS	UR
Cerro Sombrerayoc 773	grass florets	735	40	-22.0	671-551	AA36328	$16^{\circ}07.861'$	71°49.154′	2750	Э	LS	UR
Cerro Sombrerayoc 775	fecal pellets	120	95	-24.2	293–0	GX25844	$16^{\circ}07.861'$	71°49.154′	2750	Е	LS	Abci
Cerro Sombrerayoc 776B	fecal pellets	4870	60	-23.0	5647-5328	AA34542	$16^{\circ}07.861'$	71°49.154′	2750	Э	LS	Phli
Cerro Sombrerayoc 776D	fecal pellets	5400	55	-24.8	6278–5935	AA34539	$16^{\circ}07.861'$	71°49.154′	2750	Э	LS	Aksu
Cerro Sombrerayoc 774	fecal pellets	415	40	-24.2	504-302	AA34536	$16^{\circ}07.861'$	71°49.154′	2750	Э	LS	UR
Quebrada Chilcane 758B	fecal pellets	0	N/A	-26.0	N/A	GX25838	$16^{\circ}07.816'$	$71^{\circ}48.920'$	2750	SSE	LS	Phli
Quebrada Chilcane 759A	fecal pellets	3290	60	-23.9	3627–3273	GX26356	$16^{\circ}07.825'$	$71^{\circ}48.846'$	2750	SSE	LS	UR
Quebrada Chilcane 759B	fecal pellets	3715	90	-22.5	4234–3694	AA34599	$16^{\circ}07.825'$	$71^{\circ}48.846'$	2750	SSE	LS	Thpa, Phli
Quebrada Chilcane 759C	fecal pellets	<i>1</i> 70	09	-25.3	729–550	GX26356	$16^{\circ}07.825'$	71°48.846′	2750	SSE	LS	TR
Quebrada Chilcane 760A	grass stems	4375	50	-22.0	5025-4825	AA34540	$16^{\circ}07.768'$	71°48.790′	2750	ESE	LS	UR, TR
Quebrada Chilcane 760B	grass stems	4365	50	-10.1	4968-4713	AA34541	$16^{\circ}07.768'$	71°48.790′	2750	ESE	LS	Thpa, TR
Quebrada Chilcane 765	cactus seeds	450	45	-26.7	514-309	AA34597	$16^{\circ}07.719'$	$71^{\circ}49.002'$	2750	WNW	LS	Phli, Chsa, UR
Quebrada Chilcane 769	fecal pellets	140	40	-24.9	267–0	AA36323	$16^{\circ}07.419'$	$71^{\circ}49.000'$	2750	WNW	LS	UR
Quebrada Ojule 730A	grass stems	8465	75	-22.4	9532–9146	AA34545	16°12.177′	71°48.930′	2580	MM	CONG	Phli
Quebrada Ojule 730B	wood	8470	65	-10.9	9530–9155	AA36325	$16^{\circ}12.177'$	71°48.930′	2580	MM	CONG	Phli
Quebrada Ojule 730D	fecal pellets	6560	70	-25.3	7559–7267	AA34595	$16^{\circ}12.177'$	71°48.930′	2580	MM	CONG	UR
Quebrada Ojule 731	fecal pellets	5920	55	-21.0	6790–6498	AA34537	$16^{\circ}12.177'$	71°48.930′	2580	MM	SS	Phli
Quebrada Ojule 732	fecal pellets	110	40	-18.3	255-0	AA36322	16°12.177′	71°48.930′	2580	MM	SS	UR
Quebrada Ojule 733	grass florets	3445	40	-9.6	3693–3473	AA36324	16°12.177′	71°48.930′	2580	MM	SS	TR
Quebrada Ojule 734	cactus seeds	4930	45	-10.3	5657-5485	AA36326	$16^{\circ}12.177'$	71°48.930′	2580	MM	SS	Phli
Quebrada Ojule 756A	boow	8560	75	-23.9	9552–9327	AA34601	$16^{\circ}12.177'$	$71^{\circ}48.930'$	2580	MN	CONG	Abci, Phma
Quebrada Ojule 756B	wood	7010	190	-17.3	8159–7432	GX25839	16°12.177′	71°48.930′	2580	MN	CONG	Abci, Phli, UR
Quebrada Saucillos 711B	fecal pellets	2800	45	-20.0	2922–2751	AA34538	16°15.256′	71°47.361′	2350	SSW	IG	Phli
Quebrada Saucillos 740A	fecal pellets	845	70	-24.2	881-565	GX25843	$16^{\circ}14.896'$	71°47.669′	2378	Щ	IG	UR
Quebrada Saucillos 757	fecal pellets	825	70	-22.3	789–560	AA34600	16°15.913′	71°47.492′	2351	ESE	IG	UR
Yura 750	fecal pellets	515	65	-23.1	617-315	GX25840	$16^{\circ}16.357'$	$71^{\circ}40.063'$	2600	MNN	IG	Aksu
Yura 751	fecal pellets	910	65	-22.7	921–661	GX25841	$16^{\circ}16.307'$	$71^{\circ}40.063'$	2600	MNW	IG	Phli, UR, TR
Yura 752	fecal pellets	1090	110	-23.3	1173–692	GX25847	$16^{\circ}16.252'$	71°39.919′	2600	MN	IG	UR
Yura 753	fecal pellets	330	70	-23.7	481–1	GX25835	$16^{\circ}16.252'$	71°39.919′	2600	MM	IG	UR
Yura 754	fecal pellets	1420	110	-22.7	1507–994	GX25836	$16^{\circ}16.167'$	71°40.42′	2600	MN	IG	Abci, Phli
Yura 755	fecal pellets	330	100	-22.8	511-0	GX25837	$16^{\circ}16.167'$	71°40.42′	2600	MM	IG	UR

TABLE 2 Radiocarbon Dates and Locations of Rodent Middens

ens

Midden ages show a clustering between 0–1000 cal yr B.P. and 2800–9560 cal yr B.P. In other midden studies (Webb and Betancourt, 1990; Betancourt *et al.*, 1993; Spaulding, 1995), clusters of radiocarbon dates have been interpreted as either sampling bias for middens of a particular age or variability in ecosystem productivity and midden formation. In Peru, we sampled all middens encountered in the field, thus offsetting any sampling bias. As a first approximation, we suggest that greater abundance of middens during certain times reflects wetter, more productive periods. We recognize that this interpretation will be tested as more middens are collected and dated in southern Peru.

Among vertebrate remains in the middens (Table 2), *Phyllotis limatus* and *Abrocoma cinerea* are the most common. No remains of *Lagidium peruanum* were found, suggesting that it may be less responsible for midden building than *P. limatus* and *A. cinerea. Chinchillula sahamae* and *Neotomys ebriosus*, found in only a few middens, are rare at elevations below 3500 m today. Likewise, *Oligoryzomys andinus* is restricted to areas adjacent to water and *Phyllotis magister* and *Akodon subfuscus*, although more independent of water, are not found in dry sites.

DISCUSSION

Elevational displacements of plant species found in middens should reflect shifts in easterly trade-wind intensity and tropical rainfall that spills over to the Pacific slope of the Andes. In this study, we found that several species were remarkably stable during the Holocene. Many species present in southern Peru have very large ecological amplitudes (i.e., broad elevational ranges), which may explain the observed stability. Across 500 m in elevation (\sim 130-mm difference in precipitation) the more noticeable changes may be in community structure (species abundances) rather than community composition (species presence or absence). Macrofossil relative abundance, subject to several filters (animal preferences, distance to plants, duration of depositional episode, etc.), may or may not be sensitive to changes in plant community structure. Hence, the apparent stability in Holocene midden floras may mask actual instabilities in plant community structure. In addition, no middens were encountered from the Pleistocene-Holocene transition where the greatest instability in vegetation is expected.

Despite the relative stability, however, there does appear to be evidence for a wetter middle Holocene consistent with the greater frequency in midden ages and, hypothetically, ecosystem productivity during this time. Because productivity is limited primarily by rainfall in the Atacama, clusters of midden ¹⁴C dates should represent wetter periods during the Holocene, and a lack of dates should represent drier periods. This is supported by evidence from the southwestern United States, where the paucity of middens during the mid-Holocene (Webb and Betancourt, 1990) corresponds to a well-documented period of winter drought (Webb and Betancourt, 1990; Betancourt *et al.*, 1993; Spaulding, 1995). The occurrence of many species in middens only during these periods also indicates increased moisture, because an increase in species richness would be expected to occur during more productive periods. Finally, it appears that several higher elevation species retreated from lower elevations after 2800 cal yr B.P., implying increasing aridity from middle to late Holocene.

There is considerable disagreement among regional paleoclimate records regarding mid-Holocene precipitation levels, especially between high- and low-altitude sites (see Fig. 1 for locations of sites). Ice cores from Nevado Sajama, the highest altitude record at 6542 m, display high δ^{18} O values and dust concentrations between 9000 and 3000 yr B.P., interpreted as indicating aridity (Thompson et al., 1998). Likewise, multiproxy studies of Lake Titicaca (3800-m elevation) show lake levels were about 100 m lower between >6000 and 3800 yr B.P. (Wirrmann and De Oliveira, 1987; Cross et al., 2000; Rowe et al., in press). A mid-Holocene arid phase (undated, but correlated to the Titicaca record) is inferred for Laguna Seca (4500 m) based on δ^{18} O results from ostracods and authigenic carbonates (Schwalb et al., 1999). Pollen analyses from this lake suggest aridity from about 7000-5000 yr B.P. and a moister period from 5000-3500 yr B.P. (Baied and Wheeler, 1993). This moist period is also seen in the Rio Desaguadero, Lake Titicaca's outlet into Lago Poopó and Salar de Coipasa and Salar de Uyuni. Fluvial terraces in the northern Rio Desaguadero valley mark an interval of high water from 4500 to 3900 yr B.P., which could be due to either spillover from the lake or local changes in precipitation when Titicaca was below the spill level (Baucom and Rigsby, 1999). Thus, while many Altiplano records indicate a mid-Holocene drought, others indicate increased moisture.

Evidence of a wet mid-Holocene is more common at sites on the Pacific slope of the Andes than on the Altiplano. A wet phase from 7100 to 3500 cal yr B.P. is seen in fossil rodent middens (2400–3200 m) and wetland deposits (2500–2700 m) near the Salar de Atacama in the central Atacama ($22^{\circ}-24^{\circ}S$) Desert (Betancourt *et al.*, 2000b). In addition, paleoshorelines of Lago Aricota (2800 m), on the Pacific slope ~170 km south of Arequipa, were highest between >7100 and 3500 cal yr B.P. (Placzek *et al.*, 2001). The catchment for Lake Aricota spans from 5000 to 2800 m, so this record integrates both highand low-altitude precipitation. Thus, the mid-Holocene drought inferred from several Altiplano records is not visible in these records nor in our midden record of vegetation from southern Peru.

The discrepancies among records, especially between the Altiplano and Pacific slope, call into question assumptions about the regional coherence of summer precipitation in the central Andes. The predominance of summer-flowering plants in middens throughout the Holocene indicates that precipitation seasonality did not change. Changes in the strength of the SASM could be invoked to explain precipitation variability within the region during the mid-Holocene if storms have strong local, but not regional, effects. Linear regression of GHCN historical



FIG. 4. Relative abundance of macrofossils through time for sites above and below 2600 m, where 0 = absent, 1 = rare, 5 = most abundant. Short horizontal bars within the abundance curves indicate midden dates. The horizontal lines spanning the width of the graphs indicate vegetation patterns discussed in text.



FIG. 4—Continued

summer (December–March) precipitation values from Arequipa and Puno (Lake Titicaca) shows little similarity ($r^2 = 0.17$, p = 0.128) between stations. The apparent greater correlation during some winter months (August, $r^2 = 0.695$, p < 0.0001) is due to the fact that Arequipa and Puno receive no winter precipitation except during rare years when a few frontal storms bias the correlation. Juliaca and Puno, located only 50 km apart on the shores of Lake Titicaca, exhibit no better correlation than do Arequipa and Puno ($r^2 = 0.18$, p = 0.120).

As in other monsoonal areas of the world, the sparse weather station network in the central Andes may be inadequate to capture regional-scale patterns in summer precipitation. Convective storms with narrow tracks (<10 km wide) can easily miss one station and hit another, particularly when stations are more than 100 km apart. Thus, the SASM may have highly variable local effects that confound regional interpretations. Changes in SASM storm tracks during the mid-Holocene could explain why precipitation increased in some areas and decreased in others. It is also possible that the disparities between the records may be due to dating problems or differing response times of the various systems—oceans, big and small lakes, rivers, water tables, and vegetation.

Precipitation variation in the central Andes also has been linked to long-term ENSO behavior. El Niño episodes during the austral summer produce rainfall anomalies over most of tropical South America, with flooding common along the coasts of Ecuador, Peru, and central Chile but reduced rainfall at higher elevations (>1000 m) on the Pacific slope and Altiplano. Paleoclimatic studies in the area consistently show that sea-surface temperatures were lower and ENSO variability was weak or absent during the mid-Holocene (Keefer *et al.*, 1998; Fontugne *et al.*, 1999; Rodbell *et al.*, 1999; Cane *et al.*, 2000; Cole, 2001). One exception is the thermally anomalous molluscan assemblages, attributed to warm tropical water as far south as 10° S during the mid-Holocene by one author (Sandweiss *et al.*, 1996), but to local changes in coastal geomorphology by others (DeVries and Wells, 1990).

We recognize that the scarcity of weather stations and the strong local effects of convective precipitation render historical station data inadequate to capture regional patterns. Precipitation data from Arequipa, however, show that only three of the five wettest years occurred during El Niño events and none of the driest years occurred during La Niña events. The limited correspondence between ENSO and precipitation, in addition to the discordance between regional paleorecords, suggests that the relation between precipitation variation and long-term ENSO behavior remains speculative. These results indicate that continued investigation of paleoclimate records from the central Andes and Atacama Desert is necessary to fully understand regional climate variability and its large-scale forcing during the Holocene. In this study, well-dated fossil rodent middens provide the first paleobotanical record of its kind for Peru. This study also indicates great potential for future midden studies in the northern Atacama Desert and adjoining regions, which could play a key

role in clarifying past patterns of vegetation and climate variability in the central Andes.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank M. Betancourt, J. Dohrenwend, C. Latorre, H. Paisley, and C. Placzek for field assistance; A. Cano for logistical support and permission to sample herbarium specimens at the Museo de Historia Natural in Lima; J. Dohrenwend for map support; M. Dillon for assistance in determining plant flowering seasons; O. Davis for valuable comments; the Instituto Nacional de Recursos Natural (INRENA) for permission to collect plant and other samples in Peru; Geochronology Laboratory for conventional ¹⁴C dates; and the University of Arizona National Science Foundation (NSF) Accelerator Facility for accelerator mass spectrometry ¹⁴C dates. This study was supported by an Inter-American Institute grant to J. L. Betancourt and V. Markgraf and a NSF grant to J. Quade and J. L. Betancourt.

REFERENCES

- Baied, C. A., and Wheeler, J. C. (1993). Evolution of high Andean puna ecosystems: Environment, climate, and culture change over the last 12,000 years in the Central Andes. *Mountain Research and Development* 13, 145–156.
- Baucom, P. C., and Rigsby, C. A. (1999). Climate and lake-level history of the northern Altiplano, Bolivia, as recorded in Holocene sediments of the Rio Desaguadero. *Journal of Sedimentary Research* 69, 597–611.
- Betancourt, J. L., Van Devender, T. R., and Martin, P. S., Eds. (1990). "Packrat Middens: The Last 40,000 Years of Biotic Change" Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson.
- Betancourt, J. L., Pierson, E. A., Rylander, K. A., Fairchild-Parks, J. A., and Dean, J. S. (1993). Influence of history and climate on New Mexico piñonjuniper woodlands. USDA Forest Service General Technical Report RM-23, 42–62.
- Betancourt, J. L., Rylander, K. A., Peñalba, C., and McVickar, J. L. (2000a). Late Quaternary vegetation history of Rough Canyon, south-central New Mexico, USA. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*. 165, 71–95.
- Betancourt, J. L., Latorre, C., Rech, J. A., Quade, J., and Rylander, K. A. (2000b). A 22,000-yr record of monsoonal precipitation from northern Chile's Atacama Desert. *Science* 289, 1542–1546.
- Cane, M. A., Clement, A., Gagan, M. K., Ayliffe, L. K., and Tudhope, S. (2000). ENSO through the Holocene, depicted in corals and a model simulation. *Pages Newsletter* 8, 3–7.
- Cole, J. (2001). A slow dance for El Niño. Science 291, 1496-1497.
- Cross, S. L., Baker, P. A., Seltzer, G. O., Fritz, S. C., and Dunbar, R. B. (2000). A new estimate of the Holocene lowstand level of Lake Titicaca, central Andes, and implications for tropical palaeohydrology. *The Holocene* 10, 21–32.
- DeVries, T. J., and Wells, L. E. (1990). Thermally-anomalous Holocene molluscan assemblages from coastal Peru: Evidence for paleogeographic, not climatic change. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 81, 11–32.
- Fontugne, M., Usselmann, P., Lavallée, D., Julien, M., and Hatté, C. (1999). El Niño variability in the coastal desert of southern Peru during the mid-Holocene. *Quaternary Research* 52, 171–179.
- Hansen, B. C. S., Seltzer, G. O., and Wright, H. E., Jr. (1994). Late Quaternary vegetational change in the central Peruvian Andes. *Palaeogeography*, *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* **109**, 263–285.
- Keefer, D. K., deFrance, S. D., Moseley, M. E., Richardson, J. B. III, Satterlee, D. R., and Day-Lewis, A. (1998). Early maritime economy and El Niño events at Quebrada Tacahuay, Peru. *Science* 284, 1833–1835.

- Lenters, J. D., and Cook, K. H. (1997). On the origin of the Bolivian high and related circulation features of the South American climate. *Journal of the Atmospheric Sciences* 54, 656–677.
- Lenters, J. D., and Cook, K. H. (1999). Summertime precipitation variability over South America: Role of the large-scale circulation. *Monthly Weather Review* 127, 409–431.
- Linares, E. L. (1996). "Estructura vegetacional de la transecta Yura–Chivay (2600–4800 M.S.N.M.) Arequipa 1987–1991." Bachelor's thesis, Universidad de san Agustin, Peru.
- Miller, A. (1976). The climate of Chile. In "Climates of Central and South America" (W. Schwerdfeger, Ed.), World Survey of Climatology Vol. 12, pp. 113–145, Elsevier, Amsterdam.
- Pearson, O. P., and Ralph, C. P. (1978). The diversity and abundance of vertebrates along an altitudinal gradient in Peru. *Memorias del Museo de Historia Natural "Javier Prado"* 18, 5–80.
- Pizzimenti, J. J., and De Salle, R. (1980). Diet and morphometric variation in some Peruvian rodent communities: The effect of feeding strategy on evolution. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society* 13, 263–285.
- Placzek, C., Quade, J., and Betancourt, J. L. (2001). Holocene lake-level fluctuations of Lake Aricota, southern Peru. *Quaternary Research*. 56, 181.
- Rodbell, D. T., Seltzer, G. O., Anderson, D. A., Abbott, M. B., Enfield, D. B., and Newman, J. H. (1999). An ~15,000-year record of El Niño-driven alluviation in southwestern Ecuador. *Science* 283, 516–519.
- Rowe, H. D., Dunbar, R. B., Mucciarone, D. A., Seltzer, G. O., Baker, P. A., and Fritz, S. (in press). Insolation, moisture balance and climate change on the South American Altiplano since the Last Glacial Maximum. *Climate Change*.
- Sandweiss, D. H., Richardson, J. B., III, Reitz, E. J., Rollins, H. B., and Maasch, K. A. (1996). Geoarcheological evidence from Peru for a 5000 years B. P. onset of El Niño. *Science* 273, 1531–1533.
- Schwalb, A., Burns, S. J., and Kelts, K. (1999). Holocene environments from stable isotope stratigraphy of ostracods and authigenic carbonate in Chilean

Altiplano lakes. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **148,** 153–168.

- Spaulding, W. G. (1995). Environmental change, ecosystem responses, and the late Quaternary development of the Mojave Desert. *In* "Late Quaternary Environment and Deep History: A Tribute to Paul S. Martin" (D. W. Steadman and J. I. Mead, Eds.), pp. 139–164. The Mammoth Site of Hot Springs, South Dakota, Inc., Hot Springs, SD.
- Spaulding, W. G., Betancourt, J. L., Croft, L. K., and Cole, K. L. (1990). Packrat middens: Their composition and methods of analysis. *In* "Packrat Middens: The Last 40,000 Years of Biotic Change" (J. L. Betancourt, T. R. Van Devender, and P. S. Martin, Eds.), pp. 59–84. Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson.
- Steppan, S. J. (1998). Phylogenetic relationships and species limits within *Phyllotis* (Rodentia: Sigmodontinae): Concordance between mtDNA sequence and morphology. *Journal of Mammology* **79**, 573–593.
- Stuiver, M. and Reimer, P. J. (1993). Extended ¹⁴C database and revised CALIB radiocarbon calibration program. *Radiocarbon* 35, 215–230.
- Thompson, L. G., Davis, M. E., Mosley-Thompson, E., Sowers, T. A., Henderson, K. A., Zagorodnov, V. S., Lin, P.-N., Mikhalenko, V. N., Campen, R. K., Bolzan, J. F., Cole-Dai, J., and Francou, B. (1998). A 25,000-yr tropical climate history from Bolivian ice cores. *Science* 282, 1858–1864.
- Webb, R. H., and Betancourt, J. L. (1990). The spatial and temporal distribution of radiocarbon ages from packrat middens. *In* "Packrat Middens: The Last 40,000 Years of Biotic Change" (J. L. Betancourt, T. R. Van Devender, and P. S. Martin, Eds.), pp. 59–84. Univ. of Arizona Press, Tucson.
- Wirrmann, D., and De Oliveira Almeida, L. F. (1987). Low Holocene level (7700 to 3650 years ago) of Lake Titicaca (Bolivia). *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 59, 315–323.
- Ybert, J. P. (1992). Ancient lake environments as deduced from pollen analysis. *In* "Lake Titicaca, A Synthesis of Limnological Knowledge" (C. Dejoux and A. Iltis, Eds.), pp. 49–62. Kluwer Academic, Dordrecht.
- Zhou, J., and Lau, K.-M. (1998). Does a monsoon climate exist over South America? *Journal of Climate* 11, 1020–1040.