

records global ice volume, ocean temperature, and the mixing ratio of fresh water and seawater. To separate out the freshwater input, Maslin and Burns removed the ice volume and ocean temperature components by subtracting an independent planktonic oxygen isotope record south of the Amazon and upstream in the NBCC. The residual was further adjusted for the effects of temperature and rainfall amount on the oxygen isotope composition of river water.

The net result is an indirect measure of Amazon River outflow that is broadly consistent with the global methane curve from the Greenland Ice Sheet Project 2 (GISP2)



Retrieving sediment and ice cores. The JOIDES Resolution drilling ship took the core analyzed by Maslin and Burns (11). (Inset) The site of GISP2, one of the Greenland ice cores used to measure past methane concentrations.

ice core (see the figure) (5, 6). The best match is during the Younger Dryas (13,000 to 11,600 years ago), when ice-core methane and reconstructed Amazon discharge both dropped to 60% below modern values (2, 11). Both records exhibit anomalous peaks, which occur 11,600 years ago in the methane record and 11,800 years ago in the Amazon outflow. The latter was probably due to increased rainfall in the lowlands rather than meltwater from Andean glaciers.

The overall trend in Amazon outflow tracks summertime solar insolation at 10°S, which reached a minimum between 12,000 and 10,000 years ago and a maximum in the past 3000 years. These insolation differences are thought to regulate the intensity of convection over the Amazon Basin and the Central Andes, which in turn affects westward penetration of Atlantic moisture and southern extension of the Intertropical Convergence Zone (ITCZ). On page 2291 of this issue, Mayle *et al.* (15) also summon increasing summer insolation at 10°S to explain southern expansion of Amazonian rainforests in eastern Bolivia during the past 3000 years.

Maslin and Burns' elegant study is probably not the final word. The authors make several key but unproven assumptions to quanti-

fy Amazon discharge from the foraminiferal record. For example, the dependence of the oxygen isotope composition of rainfall on temperature and rainfall amounts over the Amazon Basin can be complicated by changes in the position of the ITCZ, which may push isotopically depleted moisture inland (16). Trade wind intensities along the northern South American coastline, which changed dramatically during deglaciation (17), also could have modulated the position and width of the Amazon freshwater plume,

affecting its mixing with the NBCC (18). Furthermore, little attempt has been made to allow for the effects of rising sea level on the extent of Holocene wetlands. During the last ice age, when sea level was 100 m below that of today, the increased gradient caused the Amazon and its tributaries to incise tens of meters below their floodplains. Ten thousand years ago, sea level was still 25 m below

modern levels, and it rose only gradually throughout the Holocene. Incised valleys slowly backfilled with sediment, but tributaries originating in sediment-starved lowlands could not keep up with the rising water, resulting in large freshwater lakes (19). These lakes are only now being drowned in sediment, implying that the maximum extent of methane-producing wetlands in the Amazon Basin may depend more on rising sea level than on increasing rainfall.

Finally, it remains unclear how orbital modulation of seasonal insolation might force tropical precipitation. During the

past 1 million years, increases in lowland Amazon Basin precipitation have coincided with ice-melting events and maximum June insolation at 65°N (20), not maximum January insolation at 10°S. Physical mechanisms for high-latitude forcing of the tropics could involve changes in oceanic heat transport, as well as remote teleconnections with the Asian Monsoon and Pacific climate (21, 22).

References and Notes

1. T. P. Guilderson, R. G. Fairbanks, J. L. Rubensonte, *Science* **263**, 663 (1994).
2. L. G. Thompson *et al.*, *Science* **269**, 46 (1995).
3. M. Stute *et al.*, *Science* **269**, 379 (1995).
4. P. Colinvaux *et al.*, *Science* **274**, 85 (1996).
5. J. P. Severinghaus, E. J. Brook, *Science* **286**, 930 (1999).
6. D. Raynaud *et al.*, *Quat. Sci. Rev.* **19**, 9 (2000).
7. I. Ferrera *et al.*, *Clim. Dyn.* **15**, 823 (1999).
8. G. O. Seltzer, D. Rodbell, S. J. Burns, *Geology* **28**, 35 (2000).
9. L. G. Thompson, *Quat. Sci. Rev.* **19**, 19 (2000).
10. J. L. Betancourt *et al.*, *Science* **289**, 1542 (2000).
11. M. A. Maslin, S. J. Burns, *Science* **290**, 2285 (2000).
12. R. H. Meade, *Quat. Int.* **21**, 29 (1994).
13. The site is located at 6°N, 49°W, 3346-m water depth. It is one of 17 sites drilled on the Amazon Fan during ODP Leg 155.
14. M. A. Maslin *et al.*, *J. Quat. Sci.* **15**, 419 (2000).
15. F. E. Mayle, R. Burbridge, T. J. Killeen, *Science* **290**, 2291 (2000).
16. K. Rozanski, L. Araguás-Araguás, R. Gonfiantini, in *Climate Change in Continental Isotopic Records*, P. K. Swart *et al.*, Eds., vol. 78 of *Geophysical Monograph Series* (American Geophysical Union, Washington, DC, 1993), pp. 1–36.
17. K. A. Hughes, J. T. Overpeck, L. C. Peterson, S. Trumbore, *Nature* **380**, 51 (1996).
18. P. W. Jewell, R. F. Stallard, G. L. Mellor, *J. Sediment. Petrol.* **63**, 734 (1993).
19. G. Keim *et al.*, paper presented at *Manaus '99—Hydrological and Geochemical Processes in Large-Scale River Basins*, Manaus, Brazil, 15 to 19 November 1999.
20. S. E. Harris, A. C. Mix, *Quat. Res.* **51**, 14 (1999).
21. Z. Liu, J. Kutzbach, L. Wu, *Geophys. Res. Lett.* **27**, 2265 (2000).
22. A. C. Clement, R. Seager, M. A. Cane, *Paleoceanography* **14**, 441 (1999).