

TF  
23  
.U68  
A34  
no.  
FRA-  
ORD&D-  
75-48

REPORT NO. FRA-OR&amp;D 75-48

Dept. of Transportation
JUN 7 1976
Library

# A METALLURGICAL ANALYSIS OF FIVE STEEL PLATES TAKEN FROM A TANK CAR ACCIDENT NEAR CRESCENT CITY, ILLINOIS

C. G. Interrante  
G. E. Hicho  
D. E. Harne



**MARCH 1972  
FINAL REPORT**

DOCUMENT IS AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC  
THROUGH THE NATIONAL TECHNICAL  
INFORMATION SERVICE, SPRINGFIELD,  
VIRGINIA 22161

Prepared For  
**DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION**  
**FEDERAL RAILROAD ADMINISTRATION**  
**Office of Research and Development**  
**Washington, D.C. 20590**



TF  
 23  
 u68A34  
 FRA-  
 OR&D D-

Technical Report Documentation Page

1. Report No. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> FRA-OR&D 75-48	2. Government Accession No.	3. Recipient's Catalog No.
4. Title and Subtitle A METALLURGICAL ANALYSIS OF FIVE STEEL PLATES TAKEN FROM A TANK CAR ACCIDENT NEAR CRESCENT CITY, ILLINOIS		5. Report Date March 1972
6. Performing Organization Code		7. Author(s) C.G. Interrante, G.E. Hicho, D.E. Harne
8. Performing Organization Report No. 312.01/39		9. Performing Organization Name and Address National Bureau of Standards Washington, D.C. 20234
10. Work Unit No. (TRAIS)		11. Contract or Grant No. DOT-AR-10023
12. Sponsoring Agency Name and Address U.S. Department of Transportation Federal Railroad Administration Office of Research and Development Washington, D.C. 20590		13. Type of Report and Period Covered FINAL REPORT
14. Sponsoring Agency Code		
15. Supplementary Notes		
16. Abstract  A metallurgical analysis of five steel samples (numbered FRA-1 through FRA-5) was requested by the Bureau of Railroad Safety, Federal Railroad Administration, Department of Transportation. These steel samples were taken from two tank cars (numbered SOEX 3037 and SOEX 3219) which had been involved in an accident near Crescent City, Illinois. Samples FRA-1, FRA-4, and FRA-5 were reported to be shell plates and sample FRA-3, a head plate. Sample FRA-2 was a welded sample of head plate and shell plate and it was used for most of the mechanical properties determinations in this report.		
17. Key Words Metallurgy, Tank Cars		
18. Distribution Statement Documents is available to the public through the National Technical Information Service, Springfield, Virginia 22161		
19. Security Classif. (of this report) Unclassified	20. Security Classif. (of this page) Unclassified	21. No. of Pages 95
22. Price		

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

1. The Crescent City samples investigated in this report include two M128-B steels numbered FRA-3, and -4; and four A 212-B steels, numbered FRA-1, -2 shell, -2 head, and -5.
2. The chemical compositions of the four samples of A 212-B steels and one of the M128-B steels met the chemical requirements for their respective grades of steel. However, the other M128-B steel (FRA-3) contains carbon at a level that is high for M128-B steel, but the amount by which it exceeds the specified maximum plus tolerance is marginal. In addition, the producer's ladle analysis for this steel does not agree with the NBS check analyses for carbon and manganese.
3. The results of tensile tests conducted on sample FRA-2 indicated that the head plate, the shell plate and the weld met the tensile requirements for A 212-B steel, and that the weld joint efficiency is 1.
4. The results of bend tests conducted on sample FRA-2 indicated that this A 212-B steel shell plate passed the bend requirements for plates and the weldment passed the guided-bend test for welds.
5. The results of thickness measurements and observations of the fracture mode of the five failed plates indicated that substantial plate thinning occurred near the fracture surfaces of samples that failed with a shear failure mode, FRA-2, FRA-4, and FRA-5; whereas in samples FRA-1 and FRA-3 substantial plate thinning did not occur near the fracture surfaces and the profile views of FRA-1 and FRA-3 respectively showed that fracture occurred either on a plane perpendicular to the plate surfaces or in a step-like shear mode.
6. A region of high hardness was observed near the plate surface of a sample of head plate (M128-B) steel taken from FRA-3. This region is believed to be an improperly stress-relieved heat-affected-zone of a weldment.

7. The results of Charpy V-notch impact tests conducted on the A 212-B steel samples of head and shell plate contained in sample FRA-2 indicated that:
  - a. The shell plate is anisotropic with a ratio of longitudinal to transverse energy absorption values of about 2, indicating that this plate did not receive substantial cross-rolling.
  - b. The head plate is also not isotropic, but it may be more isotropic than the shell plate of FRA-2.
  - c. The transition temperatures for the shell plate are above 34 F and for the head plate are above 70 F, by any of three arbitrarily selected criteria.
  - d. The upper-shelf energy absorption values for the shell and head plates are near the expected values for steels of their respective strength levels. This observation was consistent with other observations and data given on these steels in this report.

## Appendix A Specifications

AAR M128-65, -69 and -70; ASTM A212-65

M-2

JANUARY 1, 1969  
AAR APPENDIX M

### M128.05 Tensile properties

(a) The material as represented by the test specimens shall conform to the requirements as to tensile properties prescribed in Table M128.05(a).

TABLE M128.05(a) TENSILE REQUIREMENTS

Property	Grade A and Grade B
Tensile strength, psi	81,000 to 101,000
Yield point, psi	50,000
Elongation in 8 inches, percent	Min.
Elongation in 2 inches, percent	16.0%
Elongation in 2 inches, percent	Min.
	19.0

\* For material under  $\frac{3}{4}$  inch thick a reduction from the specified percent of elongation of 1.25 percent shall be made for each decrease of  $\frac{1}{16}$  inch of thickness below  $\frac{3}{4}$  inch. For material over  $\frac{3}{4}$  inch thick a reduction from the specified percent elongation of 0.5 percent shall be made for each increase of  $\frac{1}{16}$  inch of the thickness above  $\frac{3}{4}$  inch; this deduction shall not exceed 3 percent.

### M128.06 Bending properties

(a) The bend test specimens shall stand being bent cold through  $180^\circ$  without cracking on the outside of the bent portion through an inside diameter which shall have the relation to the thickness of the specimen prescribed in Table M128.06(a). When the test is made on a specimen reduced in thickness, the rolled surface shall be on the outer curve of the bend.

TABLE M128.06(a) BEND DIAMETERS

Thickness of Material, inches	Ratio of Bend Diameter to Thickness of Specimen
1 and under	2

### M128.07 Test specimens

(a) Test specimens shall be prepared from the material in the as-rolled condition.

### M128.08 Number of tests

(a) One tension test and one bend test shall be made from each plate as-rolled.

Note: The term "plate as rolled" used here refers to the unit plate rolled from a slab or directly from an ingot in its relation to the location and number of specimens, not to its condition.

### M128.09 Inspection

(a) The inspector representing the purchaser shall have free entry, at all times while the work on the contract of the purchaser is being performed, to all parts of the manufacturer's works which concern the manufacture of the material ordered. The manufacturer shall afford the inspector, free of charge, all reasonable facilities and necessary assistance to satisfy him that the material is being furnished in accordance with these specifications. Tests and inspection shall be made at the place of manufacture prior to shipment, unless otherwise specified.  
(b) The purchaser may make tests to cover the acceptance or rejection of the material in his own laboratory or elsewhere. Such tests shall be made at the expense of the purchaser.

### M128.10 Rejection

(a) Material represented by samples which fail to conform to the requirements of these specifications will be rejected.

(b) Material which shows injurious defects subsequent to its original inspection and acceptance at the manufacturer's works, or elsewhere, will be rejected, and the manufacturer shall be notified.

### M128.11 Rehearing

(a) Samples tested in accordance with these specifications which represent rejected material, shall be held for a period of fourteen days from date of the test report. In case of dissatisfaction with the results of the tests, the manufacturer may make claim for a rehearing within that time.

TABLE M128.04(a) CHEMICAL REQUIREMENTS

Element	Ladle Analysis, Percent	
	Grade A	Grade B
Carbon	Max. 0.25	0.25
Manganese, For plates $\frac{3}{4}$ " and under in thickness	Max. 1.35	1.35
For plates over $\frac{3}{4}$ " to 1" incl. in thickness	1.50	1.50
Phosphorus	Max. 0.040	0.040
Sulfur	Max. 0.050	0.050
Silicon	Max. 0.30	0.30
For plates $\frac{3}{4}$ " and under in thickness	0.50	0.50
For plates over $\frac{3}{4}$ " to 1" incl. in thickness	0.50	0.50
Vanadium	Min. 0.02	—
Copper *	Max. —	0.35
Nickel *	Max. —	0.25
Chromium *	Max. —	0.25
Molybdenum *	Max. —	0.08

\* These elements will be reported when requested by the purchaser.

**M128.00 SPECIFICATION FOR HIGH STRENGTH CARBON MANGANESE STEEL PLATES FOR TANK CARS - AAR TC128-70.**

**M128.01 SCOPE**

(a) This specification covers two grades of high strength carbon-manganese steel plate of flange quality. The maximum thickness shall be 1 inch. Moderately high manganese content, together with small amounts of other elements provide for high strength with limited carbon content. The steel shall be made to fine grain practice. Welding technique is of fundamental importance, and it is presupposed that welding procedure will be in accordance with good practice.

(b) The material shall be furnished in the as-rolled condition. When specified for low temperature service the material shall be furnished normalized to meet requirements of ASTM Specification A300-68, Class 1, except that impact specimens shall be Type A Charpy V-Notch as shown in ASTM Specification A370-68 and meet impact requirements at the temperature specified in the tank car specification.

**M128.02 GENERAL CONDITIONS FOR DELIVERY**

(a) Material furnished under this specification shall conform to the applicable requirements of ASTM Specification A20-69a titled, "General Requirements for Delivery of Steel Plates for Pressure Vessels."

(b) See M128.01(b).

**M128.03 PROCESS**

(a) The steel shall be made by one or more of the following processes:

- (1) Open-hearth,
- (2) Electric furnace, or
- (3) Basic oxygen.

**M128.04 CHEMICAL COMPOSITION**

(a) The steel shall conform to the requirements as to chemical composition prescribed in Table M128.04(a).

**TABLE M128.04(a) CHEMICAL REQUIREMENTS**

Element	Ladle Analysis, Percent	
	Grade A	Grade B
Carbon	Max. 0.25	0.25
Manganese,	Max.	
For plates 3/4" and under in thickness	1.35	1.35
For plates over 3/4" to 1" incl. in thickness	1.50	1.50
Phosphorus	Max. 0.040	0.040
Sulfur	Max. 0.050	0.050
Silicon	Max.	
For plates 3/4" and under in thickness	0.30	0.30
For plates over 3/4" to 1" incl. in thickness	0.50	0.50
Vanadium a/	0.02 Min.	0.08 Max.
Copper a/	Max. ...	0.35
Nickel a/	Max. ...	0.25
Chromium a/	Max. ...	0.25
Molybdenum a/	Max. ...	0.08

a/ These elements will be reported when requested by the purchaser.

**M128.05 TENSILE PROPERTIES**

(a) The material as represented by the test specimens shall conform to the requirements as to tensile properties prescribed in Table M128.05(a).

**TABLE M128.05(a) TENSILE REQUIREMENTS**

Property	Grade A and Grade B
Tensile strength, psi	81,000 to 101,000
Yield point, psi	Min. 50,000
Elongation in 8 inches percent	Min. 16.0 a/
Elongation in 2 inches percent	Min. 12.0

a/ For material under 5/16 inch thick a reduction from the specified percent of elongation of 1.25 percent shall be made for each decrease of 1/32 inch of thickness below 5/16 inch. For material over 3/4 inch thick a reduction from the specified percent elongation of 0.5 percent shall be made for each increase of 1/8 inch of the thickness above 3/4 inch; this deduction shall not exceed 3 percent.

**M128.06 BENDING PROPERTIES**

(a) The bend test specimens shall stand being bent cold through 180° without cracking on the outside of the bent portion through an inside diameter which shall have the relation to the thickness of the specimen prescribed in Table M128.06(a). When the test is made on a specimen reduced in thickness, the rolled surface shall be on the outer curve of the bend.

**TABLE M128.06(a) BEND DIAMETERS**

Thickness of Material, Inches	Ratio of Bend Diameter to Thickness of Specimen
1 and under	2

**M128.07 TEST SPECIMENS**

(a) Test specimens shall be prepared from the material in the as-rolled condition.

**M128.08 NUMBER OF TESTS**

(a) One tension test and one bend test shall be made from each plate as rolled.

Note: The term "plate as rolled" used here refers to the unit plate rolled from a slab or directly from an ingot in its relation to the location and number of specimens, not to its condition.

**M128.09 INSPECTION**

(a) The inspector representing the purchaser shall have free entry, at all times while the work on the contract of the purchaser is being performed, to all parts of the manufacturer's works which concern the manufacture of the material ordered. The manufacturer shall afford the inspector, free of charge, all reasonable facilities and necessary assistance to satisfy him that the material is being furnished in accordance with these specifications. Tests and inspection shall be made at the place of manufacture prior to shipment, unless otherwise specified.

(b) The purchaser may make tests to cover the acceptance or rejection of the material in his own laboratory or elsewhere. Such tests shall be made at the expense of the purchaser.

**M128.10 REJECTION**

(a) Material represented by samples which fail to conform to the requirements of these specifications will be rejected.

(b) Material which shows injurious defects subsequent to its original inspection and acceptance at the manufacturer's works, or elsewhere, will be rejected, and the manufacturer shall be notified.

**M128.11 REHEARING**

(a) Samples tested in accordance with these specifications which represent rejected material, shall be held for a period of fourteen days from date of the test report. In case of dissatisfaction with the results of the tests, the manufacturer may make claim for a rehearing within that time.





**Specification for Plates for Fusion-Welded Pressure Vessels (A 516) 617**

**S. Test Specimens**

9.1 For plates 1½ in. and under in thickness, the test specimens shall be prepared from material in the condition it is furnished except as provided otherwise in Sections 4.2 and 9.3.

9.2 For plates 1½ in. and under in thickness requiring heat treatment, or for plates over 1½ in. in thickness, the test specimens shall be prepared from the material in its heat-treated condition, or from full thickness samples

similarly and simultaneously treated, except as noted in 4.2 and 9.3.

9.3 When so specified in the purchase order, test specimens representing the plates shall be stress-relieved by gradually and uniformly heating them to a temperature between 1100 and 1200 F (or a temperature range otherwise agreed upon between the manufacturer and the purchaser), holding at temperature for at least 1 hr per inch of thickness and cooling in still atmosphere to a temperature not exceeding 600 F.

**SUPPLEMENTARY REQUIREMENT**

The following supplementary requirement shall not apply unless specified in the purchase order.

A list of standardized supplementary requirements for use at the option of the purchaser is included in Specification A 20. Those which are considered suitable for use with this specification are given below.

Others enumerated in Specification A 20 may be used with this specification subject to agreement by the supplier.

and cooling rates shall be as specified in the order.

S4.1 *Outer Thin Cored and Thicker Plates*—In addition to the required single tension test, a second tension test shall be made on a specimen taken from a corner of the plate as rolled on the end opposite the single specimen and in a direction parallel to the single specimen. The results obtained on testing this second specimen shall conform to the requirements of the specification.

**S2. Product Analysis**

S2.1 A product analysis shall be made of each plate as rolled. The specimens for analysis shall be taken adjacent to or from a broken tension test specimen.

S3. Simulated Post-Weld Heat Treatment of Mechanical Test Corpus

S5.1 Charpy V-notch impact tests shall be conducted in accordance with ASTM Specification A 593, for Charpy V-Notch Testing Requirements for Steel Plates for Pressure Vessel<sup>1</sup>, except that the plate shall be thermally treated after the final heat treatment for mechanical properties to simulate heat treatments below the critical temperature which the plate may receive during fabrication after heat treatment for mechanical properties. The temperature range, time

and the required acceptance criteria, shall be

**618 Specification for Plates for Fusion-Welded Pressure Vessels (A 516)**

as agreed upon between the purchaser and the manufacturer. The recorded results shall include both absorbed energy and lateral expansion at the base of the notch in accordance with the procedures provided in Methods A 370.

S6. Drop-Weight Test (for Plates 0.625 in. (15.8 mm) and Over in Thickness)

S6.1 Drop-weight tests shall be made in accordance with the requirements of ASTM F 208, for Conducting Drop-Weight Test to Determine Nil-Ductility Transition Temperature of Ferrous Steels.<sup>2</sup> The specimens shall be taken from the same location with respect to plate pattern as is specified for the tension tests and shall present the plates in the final condition of heat treatment. Agreement shall be reached between the purchaser and the manufacturer as to the number of plates to be tested and whether a maximum NDT temperature is mandatory or if the test results are for information only.

S7. Flight-Temperature Tension Tests

S7.1 A short-time elevated-temper-

ature tension test as specified by the purchaser shall be made to represent each plate or each heat of steel as indicated by the purchaser. The material for testing shall be obtained as required for the room temperature tension tests specified in this specification. The hot tests shall be made in accordance with ASTM Recommended Practice E 21, Short-Time, Specification A 20.

**S8. Charpy V-Notch Impact Test**

S5.1 Charpy V-notch impact tests shall be conducted in accordance with ASTM Specification A 593, for Charpy V-Notch Testing Requirements for Steel Plates for Pressure Vessel<sup>1</sup>, except that orientation of the test bars (whether transverse or longitudinal to the direction of final rolling), the test temperature, and the required acceptance criteria, shall be



**S.3** When so specified in the purchase order with the mill, test specimens representing the plates shall be stress-relieved by gradually and uniformly heating them to a temperature between 1100 and 1200 F (or a temperature not exceeding 600 F).

#### **SUPPLEMENTARY REQUIREMENT**

The following supplementary requirement shall apply only when specified in the purchase order.

A list of standardized supplementary requirements for use at the option of the purchaser is included in Specification A 20. Those which are considered suitable for use with this specification are given below. Others enumerated in Specification A 20 may be used with this specification subject to agreement by the supplier.

#### **S1. Vacuum Treatment**

S1.1 The steel shall be made by a process which includes vacuum degassing while molten. Unless otherwise agreed upon with the purchaser, it is the responsibility of the manufacturer to select suitable process procedures.

#### **S2. Product Analysis**

S2.1 A product analysis shall be made of each plate as rolled. The specimens for analysis shall be taken adjacent to or from a broken tension test specimen.

#### **S3. Simulated Post-Weld Heat Treatment of Mechanical Test Coupons**

S3.1 The test specimens representing the plate shall be thermally treated after the final heat treatment for mechanical properties to simulate heat treatments below the critical temperature which the plate may receive during fabrication after heat treatment for mechanical properties. The temperature range, time and cooling rates shall be as specified in the order.

#### **S4. Additional Tension Test**

S4.1 *Other Than Quenched and Tempered Plates*—In addition to the required single tension test, a second tension test shall be made on a specimen taken from a corner of the plate as rolled.

Taken from the same locations with respect to plate pattern as is specified for the tension tests and shall represent the plates in the final condition of heat treatment. Agreement shall be reached between the purchaser and the manufacturer as to the number of plates to be tested and whether a maximum NDT temperature is mandatory or if the test results are for information only.

#### **S7. High-Temperature Tension Tests**

S7.1 A short-time, elevated temperature tension test as specified by the purchaser shall be made to represent each plate or each heat of steel as indicated by the purchaser. The material for testing shall be obtained as required for the room temperature tension tests specified in this specification. The hot tests shall be made in accordance with ASTM Recommended Practice E 21, Short-Time, Elevated-Temperature Tension Tests of Materials. Mandatory conformance with specified properties shall be a matter for agreement between the manufacturer and purchaser.

#### **S9. Magnetic Particle Examination**

S9.1 All plate edges shall be examined by magnetic particles in accordance with the procedures covered in ASTM Method E 109, for Dry Powder Magnetic Particle Inspection. The acceptability of defects revealed by this examination shall be judged in accordance with the requirements for quality in 7.3 of Specification A 20.

#### **S9. Magnetic Particle Examination**

S9.1 All plate edges shall be examined by magnetic particles in accordance with the procedures covered in ASTM Method E 109, for Dry Powder Magnetic Particle Inspection. The acceptability of defects revealed by this examination shall be judged in accordance with the requirements for quality in 7.3 of Specification A 20.

#### **S5. Charpy V-Notch Impact Test**

S5.1 Charpy V-notch impact tests shall be conducted in accordance with ASTM Specification A 509, for Charpy V-Notch Testing Requirements for Steel Plates for Pressure Vessels, except that orientation of the test bars (whether transverse or longitudinal) to the direction of final rolling, the test temperature, and all required acceptance criteria, shall be as agreed upon between the purchaser and the manufacturer. The recorded results shall include both absorbed energy and lateral expansion at the base of the notch in accordance with the procedures provided in Methods A 370.

#### **S6. Drop-Weight Test (for Plates 0.625 in. (15.8 mm) and Over in Thickness)**

S6.1 Drop-weight tests shall be made in accordance with the requirements of ASTM Method E 215, for Conducting Drop-Weight Test to Determine Nilductility Transition Temperature of Ferritic Steels. The specimens shall be