



Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences

U.S. Climate Change Science Program Synthesis and Assessment Product 1.1

> DRAFTSUBSEQUEN FROM PUBLIC REVIE

EDITORAL TEAM

| Chief Editor: | Thomas R. Karl, NOAA |
|--------------------|---|
| Associate Editors: | Susan J. Hassol, STG, Inc. Christopher D. Miller, NOAA William L. Murray, STG, Inc. |
| Graphic Design: | Sara W. Veasey, NOAA |
| Technical Support: | Erin E. McKay, STG, Inc. |

FEDERAL EXECUTIVE TEAM

| Director, Climate Change Science Program: | James R. Mahoney |
|---|-----------------------|
| Director, Climate Change Science Program Office: | Richard H. Moss |
| NOAA Assistant Administrator, Program Planning and Integration Office: | Mary M. Glackin |
| Director, NOAA Climate Goal: | Chester J. Koblinsky |
| Director, NOAA National Climatic Data Center: | Thomas R. Karl |
| Project Director, NOAA Climate Change Data and Detection: | Christopher D. Miller |

This document, the first of the Synthesis and Assessment Products described in the U.S. Climate Change Science Program (CCSP) Strategic Plan, was prepared in accordance with Section 515 of the Treasury and General Government Appropriations Act for Fiscal Year 2001 (Public Law 106-554) and the information quality act guidelines issued by the Department of Commerce and NOAA pursuant to Section 515 (<http://www.noaanews.noaa. gov/stories/iq.htm>). For purposes of compliance with Section 515, the Climate Change Science Program is an "interpreted product" as that term is used in NOAA guidelines, and this Synthesis and Assessment product is classified as "highly influential". This document does not express any regulatory policies of the United States or any of its agencies, or provide recommendations for regulatory action.

DRAFT SUBSEQUENT FROM PUBLIC REVIEW





Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere

Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences





Synthesis and Assessment Product 1.1 Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research

> EDITED BY: Thomas R. Karl, Susan J. Hassol, Christopher D. Miller, and William L. Murray

> > DRAFT SUBSEQUENT FROM PUBLIG REVIEW









CCSP office to provide a letter to go on this page

Members of Congress:





CHAPTER

Annondix A





Preface/Motivation for Report......V

Executive Summary......1

29 What kinds of atmospheric temperature variations can the current observing systems measure and what are their strengths and limitations, both spatially and temporally?

Why do temperatures vary vertically (from the surface to the stratosphere) and what do we understand about why they might vary and change over time?



4.....**7**I What is our understanding of the contribution made by observational or methodological uncertainties to the previously reported vertical differences in temperature trends?





| Statistical Issues Regarding Trends | |
|-------------------------------------|---|
| Glossary and Acronyms | 0 |
| References | 3 |

120

AUTHOR TEAM FOR THIS REPORT

| Preface | Thomas R. Karl, NOAA; Christopher D. Miller, NOAA; William L. Murray, STG, Inc. |
|-------------------|--|
| Executive Summary | Convening Lead Author: Tom M. L. Wigley, NSF NCAR Lead Authors: V. Ramaswamy, NOAA; John R. Christy, Univ. of AL in Huntsville; John R. Lanzante, NOAA; Carl A. Mears, Remote Sensing Systems; Benjamin D. Santer, DOE LLNL; Chris K. Folland, U.K. Met. Office |
| Chapter 1 | Convening Lead Author: V. Ramaswamy, NOAA Lead Authors: James W. Hurrell, NSF NCAR; Gerald A. Meehl, NSF NCAR Contributing Authors: Adam Phillips, NSF NCAR; Benjamin D. Santer, DOE LLNL; M. Daniel Schwarzkopf, NOAA; Dian J. Seidel, NOAA; Steven C. Sherwood, Yale Univ.; Peter W. Thorne, U.K. Met. Office |
| Chapter 2 | Convening Lead Author: John R. Christy, Univ. of AL in Huntsville Lead Authors: Dian J. Seidel, NOAA; Steven C. Sherwood, Yale Univ. Contributing Authors: Ming Cai, FL State Univ.; Eugenia E. Kalnay, Univ. of MD; Chris K. Folland, U.K. Met. Office; Carl A. Mears, Remote Sensing Systems; Peter W. Thorne, U.K. Met. Office; John R. Lanzante, NOAA |
| Chapter 3 | Convening Lead Author: John R. Lanzante, NOAA Lead Authors: Thomas C. Peterson, NOAA; Frank J. Wentz, Remote Sensing Systems; Konstantin Y. Vinnikov, Univ. of MD Contributing Authors: Dian J. Seidel, NOAA; Carl A. Mears, Remote Sensing Systems; John Christy, Univ. of AL in Huntsville; Chris E. Forest, MIT; Russell S. Vose, NOAA; Peter W. Thorne, U. K. Met. Office; Norman C. Grody, NOAA |
| Chapter 4 | Convening Lead Author: Carl A. Mears, Remote Sensing Systems Lead Authors: Chris E. Forest, MIT; Roy W. Spencer, Univ. of AL in Huntsville; Russell S. Vose, NOAA; Richard W. Reynolds, NOAA Contributing Authors: Peter W. Thorne, U.K. Met. Office; John R. Christy, Univ. of AL in Huntsville |
| Chapter 5 | Convening Lead Author: Benjamin D. Santer, DOE LLNL Lead Author: Joyce E. Penner, Univ. of MI; Peter W. Thorne, U.K. Met. Office Contributing Authors: William D. Collins, NCAR; Keith W. Dixon, NOAA; Thomas L. Delworth, NOAA; Charles Doutriaux, DOE LLNL; Chris K. Folland, U.K. Met. Office; Chris E. Forest, MIT; Isaac M. Held, NOAA; John R. Lanzante, NOAA; Gerald A. Meehl, NSF NCAR; V. Ramaswamy, NOAA; Dian J. Seidel, NOAA; Michael F. Wehner, DOE LBNL; Tom M.L. Wigley, NSF NCAR |
| Chapter 6 | Convening Lead Author: Chris K. Folland, U.K. Met. Office Lead Authors: David E. Parker, U.K. Met. Office; Richard W. Reynolds, NOAA; Steven C. Sherwood, Yale Univ.; Peter W. Thorne, U.K. Met. Office |
| Appendix A | Tom M.L. Wigley, NSF NCAR With contributions by: Benjamin D. Santer, DOE LLNL; John R. Lanzante, NOAA |

ABSTRACT



Previously reported discrepancies between the amount of warming near the surface and higher in the atmosphere have been used to challenge the validity of climate models and the reality of human-induced global warming. Specifically, surface data showed substantial global-average warming, while early versions of satellite data showed little or no warming above the surface. There is no longer evidence of such a discrepancy. This is an important revision to and update of the conclusions of earlier reports from the U.S. National Research Council and the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change.

Since those reports, errors have been identified and corrected in the satellite data and other temperature observations. These data now show globalaverage warming in the atmosphere similar to the warming observed at the surface and consistent with the results from climate models, although discrepancies remain to be resolved in the tropics. The recent evidence has increased confidence in our understanding of observed climatic changes and their causes.

DRAFT SUBSEQUENT FROM PUBLIG REVIEW

RECOMMENDED CITATIONS

For the Report as a whole:

Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences. Thomas R. Karl, Susan J. Hassol, Christopher D. Miller, and William L. Murray, editors, 2006. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For the Preface:

Karl, T.R., C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors, 2006: in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences*. T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For the Executive Summary:

Wigley, T.M.L., V. Ramaswamy, J.R. Christy, J.R. Lanzante, C.A. Mears, B.D. Santer, C.K. Folland, 2006: Executive Summary in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences*. T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For Chapter I:

Ramaswamy, V., J.W. Hurrell, G.A. Meehl, 2006: Why do temperatures vary vertically (from the surface to the stratosphere) and what do we understand about why they might vary and change over time? in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences.* T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For Chapter 2:

Christy, J.R., D.J. Seidel, S.C. Sherwood, 2006: What kinds of atmospheric temperature variations can the current observing systems detect and what are their strengths and limitations, both spatially and temporally? in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences.* T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For Chapter 3:

Lanzante, J.R., T.C. Peterson, F.J. Wentz, K.Y. Vinnikov, 2006: What do observations indicate about the change of temperatures in the atmosphere and at the surface since the advent of measuring temperatures vertically? in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences.* T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For Chapter 4:

Mears, C.A., C.E. Forest, R.W. Spencer, R.S. Vose, R.W. Reynolds, 2006: What is our understanding of the contribution made by observational or methodological uncertainties to the previously reported vertical differences in temperature trends? in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences*. T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For Chapter 5:

Santer, B.D., J.E. Penner, P.W. Thorne, 2006: How well can the observed vertical temperature changes be reconciled with our understanding of the causes of these changes? in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences.* T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For Chapter 6:

Folland, C.K., D. Parker, R.W. Reynolds, S.C. Sherwood, P.W. Thorne, 2006: What measures can be taken to improve the understanding of observed changes? in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences.* T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.

For Appendix A:

Wigley, T.M.L., Appendix A: Statistical Issues Regarding Trends, in *Temperature Trends in the Lower Atmosphere: Steps for Understanding and Reconciling Differences.* T. R. Karl, S. J. Hassol, C. D. Miller, and W. L. Murray, editors. A Report by the Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research, Washington, DC.