

1 **Preliminary Review of Adaptation Options for**
2 **Climate-Sensitive Ecosystems and Resources**

3
4 **Synthesis and Assessment Product 4.4**
5 **U.S. Climate Change Science Program**

6
7 DRAFT FOR PUBLIC COMMENT—AUGUST 2007
8
9

10
11
12 **Editors**

13
14 Susan Herrod Julius, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
15 Jordan M. West, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
16
17

18
19 **Authors¹**

20
21 Jill S. Baron, U.S. Geological Survey and Colorado State University
22 Linda A. Joyce, U.S.D.A. Forest Service
23 Peter Kareiva, The Nature Conservancy
24 Brian D. Keller, National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
25 Margaret Palmer, University of Maryland
26 Charles Peterson, University of North Carolina
27 J. Michael Scott, U.S. Geological Survey and University of Idaho
28
29
30
31
32

¹ Chapter authors, contributing authors, stakeholder workshop participants, and key reviewers are acknowledged in individual chapters. Logistical and technical support for this report was provided by ICF International, with special thanks to Susan Asam, Anne Choate, Randall Freed, Joseph Herr, Bradford Hurley, Sandra Seymour, and Sarah Shapiro. Stakeholder workshop facilitation was provided by Bill Dennison, University of Maryland Center for Environmental Science.

1 **Table of Contents**

2

3 **1. Executive Summary**

4

5 1.1 Introduction 1-3

6 1.2 Background 1-3

7 1.3 National Forests 1-4

8 1.3.1 Background and Current Status of Management 1-4

9 1.3.2 Adapting to Climate Change 1-4

10 1.3.3 Insights from Case Studies 1-5

11 1.3.4 Conclusions 1-6

12 1.4 National Parks 1-6

13 1.4.1 Background, History, Current Status of Management 1-6

14 1.4.2 Adapting to Climate Change 1-7

15 1.4.3 Insights from Case Studies 1-7

16 1.4.4 Conclusions 1-8

17 1.5 National Wildlife Refuges 1-8

18 1.5.1 Background and Current Status of Management 1-8

19 1.5.2 Adapting to Climate Change 1-8

20 1.5.3 Insights from the Case Study 1-9

21 1.5.4 Conclusions 1-9

22 1.6 Wild and Scenic Rivers 1-9

23 1.6.1 Background, History, and Current Status of Management 1-9

24 1.6.2 Adapting to Climate Change 1-10

25 1.6.3 Insights from Case Studies 1-11

26 1.6.4 Conclusions 1-11

27 1.7 National Estuaries 1-12

28 1.7.1 Background and Current Status of Management 1-12

29 1.7.2 Adapting to Climate Change 1-12

30 1.7.3 Insights from Case Studies 1-13

31 1.7.4 Conclusions 1-13

32 1.8 Marine Protected Areas 1-14

33 1.8.1 Background and Current Status of Management 1-14

34 1.8.2 Adapting to Climate Change 1-14

35 1.8.3 Insights from Case Studies 1-14

36 1.8.4 Conclusions 1-15

37 1.9 Synthesis and Conclusions 1-16

38 1.10 References 1-18

39 1.11 Boxes 1-19

40 1.12 Tables 1-20

41 1.13 Figures 1-22

42

43 **2. Introduction**

44

45 2.1 Goal and Audience 2-4

46 2.2 Stakeholder Interactions 2-4

1	2.3	Approach for Reviewing Adaptation Options for Climate-Sensitive Ecosystems and Resources	2-5
2			
3	2.4	Climate Variability and Change	2-6
4	2.4.1	Increases in Surface Temperature	2-6
5	2.4.2	Changes in Precipitation	2-7
6	2.4.3	Warming of the Oceans	2-7
7	2.4.4	Sea Level Rise and Storm Intensity	2-8
8	2.4.5	Changes in Ocean pH	2-8
9	2.4.6	Warming in the Arctic	2-9
10	2.4.7	Changes in Extreme Events	2-9
11	2.4.8	Changes in Hydrology	2-9
12	2.4.9	Observed Ecological Responses	2-10
13	2.4.10	Future Anticipated Climate Change	2-10
14	2.5	Treatment of Uncertainty	2-11
15	2.6	The Adaptation Challenge: The Purpose of This Report	2-11
16	2.7	References	2-13
17	2.8	Boxes	2-16
18	2.9	Figures	2-19
19			
20	3.	National Forests	
21			
22	3.1	Background and History	3-5
23	3.1.1	Historical Context and Enabling Legislation	3-5
24	3.1.2	Evolution of National Forest Mission	3-5
25	3.1.3	Interpretation of Goals	3-7
26	3.2	Current Status of Management Systems	3-7
27	3.2.1	Key Ecosystem Characteristics on Which Goals Depend	3-7
28	3.2.2	Stressors of Concern on National Forests	3-10
29	3.2.3	Management Approaches and Methods Currently in Use to Manage Stressors	3-17
30			
31	3.2.4	Sensitivity of management goals to climate change	3-19
32	3.3	Adapting to Climate Change	3-31
33	3.3.1	The Need for Anticipatory Adaptation	3-31
34	3.3.2	Approaches for Planning in the Context of Climate Change	3-37
35	3.3.3	Approaches for Management in the Context of Climate Change	3-39
36	3.3.4	Prioritizing Management Responses in Situations of Resource Scarcity	3-47
37			
38	3.4	Case study: Tahoe National Forest	3-49
39	3.4.1	Setting and Context of Tahoe National Forest	3-49
40	3.4.2	Recent and Anticipated Regional Climate Changes and Impacts	3-50
41	3.4.3	Current TNF Natural-Resource Policy and Planning Context	3-51
42	3.4.4	TNF management and planning approaches to climate change	3-52
43	3.4.5	Proactive Management Actions Anticipating Climate Change	3-55
44	3.4.6	Barriers and Opportunities to Proactive Management for Climate Change at TNF	3-56
45			
46	3.4.7	Increasing Adaptive Capacity to Respond to Climate Change	3-59

SAP 4.4. Adaptation Options for Climate-Sensitive Ecosystems and Resources

1	3.5	Case study: Olympic National Forest	3-61
2	3.5.1	Setting and Context of the Olympic National Forest	3-61
3	3.5.2	Recent and Anticipated Climate Change and Impacts	3-62
4	3.5.3	Current ONF Policy Environment, Planning Context and Management Goals	3-63
5			
6	3.5.4	Proactive Management Actions Anticipating Climate Change	3-64
7	3.5.5	Opportunities and Barriers to Proactive Management for Climate Change on the ONF	3-66
8			
9	3.5.6	Increasing the Adaptive Capacity to Respond to Climate Change	3-68
10	3.6	Case study: Uwharrie National Forest	3-69
11	3.6.1	Setting and Context of the Uwharrie National Forest	3-69
12	3.6.2	Current Uwharrie NF Planning Context, Forest Plan Revision and Climate Change	3-70
13			
14	3.6.3	Long-Term Natural Resource Services	3-71
15	3.7	Conclusions and Recommendations	3-72
16	3.7.1	Climate Change and National Forests	3-72
17	3.7.2	Management Response Recommendations	3-74
18	3.7.3	Research priorities	3-78
19	3.8	References	3-81
20	3.9	Acknowledgements	3-121
21	3.10	Boxes	3-122
22	3.11	Tables	3-130
23	3.12	Figures	3-133
24			
25		4. National Parks	
26			
27	4.1	Background and History	4-4
28	4.1.1	Legal History	4-6
29	4.1.2	Interpretation of Goals	4-8
30	4.2	Current Status of Management Systems	4-10
31	4.2.1	Key Ecosystem Characteristics on Which Goals Depend	4-10
32	4.2.2	Stressors of Concern	4-11
33	4.2.3	Current Approaches to NPS Natural Resource Management	4-17
34	4.2.4	Sensitivity of NPS Goals to Climate Change	4-21
35	4.3	Adapting to Climate Change	4-22
36	4.3.1	Coming to Terms with Uncertainty	4-22
37	4.3.2	Approaches to Management Given Uncertainty	4-23
38	4.3.3	Incorporating Climate Change Considerations into Natural Resource Management	4-27
39			
40	4.4	Case Study: Rocky Mountain National Park	4-31
41	4.4.1	Park Description and Management Goals	4-32
42	4.4.2	Observed Climate Change in the Western U.S.	4-33
43	4.4.3	Observed and Projected Effects of Climate Change in Rocky Mountain National Park	4-33
44			
45	4.4.4	Adapting to Climate Change	4-35
46	4.4.5	Needed: A New Approach Toward Resource Management	4-36

1	4.5	Conclusions	4-37
2	4.6	References	4-39
3	4.7	Acknowledgements	4-51
4	4.8	Text Boxes	4-52
5	4.9	Figures	4-61
6			
7		5. National Wildlife Refuges	
8			
9	5.1	Background and History	5-4
10		5.1.1 Introduction	5-4
11		5.1.2 Mission, Establishing Authorities, and Goals	5-6
12		5.1.3 Origins of the NWRS	5-7
13		5.1.4 The 1997 NWRS Improvement Act	5-8
14	5.2	Current Status of the NWRS	5-11
15		5.2.1 Key Ecosystem Characteristics on Which Goals Depend	5-11
16		5.2.2 Threats to the NWRS	5-14
17		5.2.3 Ecoregional Implications of Climate Change for the NWRS	5-22
18	5.3	Adapting to Climate Change	5-28
19		5.3.1 Adaptive Management as a Framework for Adaptation Actions	5-29
20		5.3.2 Adaptation Strategies Within Refuge Borders	5-30
21		5.3.3 Adaptation Strategies Outside Refuge Borders	5-33
22		5.3.4 Steps for Determining Research and Management Actions	5-40
23	5.4	Case Study: Alaska and the Central Flyway	5-49
24		5.4.1 Current Environmental Conditions	5-49
25		5.4.2 Projections and Uncertainties of Future Climate Changes and Responses	5-52
26			
27		5.4.3 Non-Climate Stressors	5-53
28		5.4.4 Function of Alaska in the National Wildlife Refuge System	5-53
29		5.4.5 Management Option Considerations	5-57
30	5.5	Conclusions	5-60
31		5.5.1 Take Away Messages About the Management Actions Required in the	
32		Face of Climate Change	5-61
33		5.5.2 Take-Away Messages about the NWRS	5-63
34	5.6	References	5-65
35	5.7	Acknowledgements	5-87
36	5.8	Appendix: Actions to Assist Managers in Meeting the Challenges Posed by the	
37		Threat of Climate Change	5-88
38	5.9	Text Boxes	5-94
39	5.10	Tables	5-96
40	5.11	Figures	5-98
41			
42		6. Wild and Scenic Rivers	
43			
44	6.1	Background and History	6-4
45	6.2	Current Status of Management System	6-5
46		6.2.1 Framework for Assessing Present and Future Status	6-5

SAP 4.4. Adaptation Options for Climate-Sensitive Ecosystems and Resources

1	6.2.2	Hydrogeomorphic Context	6-6
2	6.2.3	Present Human Context	6-9
3	6.2.4	The Policy Context: Present Management Framework Legal and	
4		Management Context	6-14
5	6.3	Adapting to Climate Change	6-19
6	6.3.1	Climate Change Impacts	6-19
7	6.3.2	Future Human Context: Interactive Effects of Multiple Stressors	6-22
8	6.3.3	Ecosystem Goods and Services Assuming Present Management	6-24
9	6.3.4	Options for Protection Assuming New Management	6-27
10	6.4	Case Studies	6-31
11	6.4.1	Wekiva River Case Study	6-32
12	6.4.2	Rio Grande Case Study	6-37
13	6.4.3	Upper Delaware River Case Study	6-42
14	6.5	Conclusions	6-46
15	6.6	References	6-47
16	6.7	Acknowledgements	6-59
17	6.8	Boxes	6-60
18	6.9	Figures	6-67
19			
20		7. National Estuaries	
21			
22	7.1	Background and History	7-4
23	7.1.1	Historical Context and Enabling Legislation	7-4
24	7.1.2	Interpretation of National Estuary Program Goals	7-6
25	7.2	Current Status of Management Systems	7-7
26	7.2.1	Key Ecosystem Characteristics on Which Goals Depend	7-7
27	7.2.2	Current Stressors of Concern	7-9
28	7.2.3	Legislative Mandates Guiding Management of Stressors	7-12
29	7.2.4	Sensitivity of Management Goals to Climate Change	7-19
30	7.3	Adapting to Climate Change	7-35
31	7.3.1	Potential for Adjustment of Traditional Management Approaches to	
32		Achieve Adaptation to Climate Change	7-36
33	7.3.2	Management Adaptations to Sustain Estuarine Services	7-39
34	7.3.3	New Approaches to Management in the Context of Climate Change	
35			7-51
36	7.3.4	Prioritization of Management Responses	7-54
37	7.4	Case Study: The Albemarle-Pamlico Estuarine System	7-55
38	7.4.1	Introduction	7-55
39	7.4.2	Historical Context	7-55
40	7.4.3	Geomorphological and Land Use Contexts and Climate Change	7-56
41	7.4.4	Current Management Issues and Climate Change	7-60
42	7.4.5	Recommendations for Environmental Management in the Face of Climate	
43		Change	7-62
44	7.4.6	Barriers and Opportunities	7-63
45	7.5	Conclusions	7-64
46	7.5.1	Management Response	7-64

1	7.5.2	Research Priorities	7-67
2	7.6	Appendix	7-71
3	7.6.1	Federal Legislation for Protection and Restoration of Estuaries	7-71
4	7.7	References	7-74
5	7.8	Acknowledgements	7-101
6	7.9	Boxes	7-102
7	7.10	Tables	7-110
8	7.11	Figures	7-112
9			
10		8. Marine Protected Areas	
11			
12	8.1	Background and History	8-4
13	8.1.1	Introduction	8-4
14	8.1.2	Historical Context and Origins of National Marine Sanctuaries and Other	
15		Types of Marine Protected Areas	8-6
16	8.1.3	Enabling Legislation	8-9
17	8.1.4	Interpretation of Goals	8-11
18	8.2	Current Status of Management System	8-11
19	8.2.1	Key Ecosystem Characteristics on Which Goals Depend	8-11
20	8.2.2	Stressors of Concern	8-15
21	8.2.3	Management Approaches and Sensitivity of Management Goals to	
22		Climate Change	8-23
23	8.3	Adapting to Climate Change	8-25
24	8.3.1	Ameliorate Existing Stressors in Coastal Waters	8-25
25	8.3.2	Protect Apparently Resistant and Potentially Resilient Areas	8-27
26	8.3.3	Develop Networks of MPAs	8-27
27	8.3.4	Integrate Climate Change Into MPA Planning, Management, and	
28		Evaluation	8-31
29	8.4	Case Studies	8-34
30	8.4.1	Case Study: the Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary	8-34
31	8.4.2	Case Study: The Great Barrier Reef Marine Park	8-42
32	8.4.3	Case Study: The Papahānaumokuākea (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands)	
33		Marine National Monument	8-48
34	8.4.4	Case Study: the Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary	8-55
35	8.4.5	Conclusions About Case Studies	8-62
36	8.5	Conclusions	8-63
37	8.6	References	8-65
38	8.7	Acknowledgements	8-110
39	8.8	Boxes	8-111
40	8.9	Tables	8-118
41	8.10	Figures	8-122
42			
43		9. Synthesis and Conclusions	
44			
45	9.1	Introduction	9-3
46	9.2	Assessing Impacts to Support Adaptation	9-3

SAP 4.4. Adaptation Options for Climate-Sensitive Ecosystems and Resources

1	9.2.1	Mental Models for Making Adaptation Decisions	9-3
2	9.2.2	Elements of an Impact Assessment	9-4
3	9.2.3	Uncertainty and How to Incorporate it Into Assessments	9-10
4	9.3	Best Practices for Adaptation	9-12
5	9.3.1	Resilience	9-13
6	9.3.2	Adaptation Approaches	9-15
7	9.3.3	Confidence	9-17
8	9.3.4	Adaptive Management	9-18
9	9.4	Barriers and Opportunities for Adaptation	9-19
10	9.4.1	Legislation and Regulation	9-21
11	9.4.2	Management Policies and Procedures	9-22
12	9.4.3	Human and Financial Capital	9-24
13	9.4.4	Information and Science	9-26
14	9.5	Advancing the Nation's Capability to Adapt	9-28
15	9.5.1	Re-Evaluate Priorities and Consider Triage	9-29
16	9.5.2	Manage at Appropriate Scales	9-30
17	9.5.3	Manage for Change	9-30
18	9.5.4	Expand Interagency Collaboration, Integration, and Lesson-Sharing	
19			9-31
20	9.6	Conclusions	9-33
21	9.7	References	9-36
22	9.8	Appendix: Resources for Assessing Climate Vulnerability And Impacts	9-43
23	9.9	Boxes	9-45
24	9.10	Tables	9-51
25	9.11	Figures	9-60
26			