

Analyses of the Effects of Global Change on Human Health and Welfare and Human Systems

Final Report, Synthesis and Assessment Product 4.6

U.S. Climate Change Science Program
And the Subcommittee on Global Change Research

Convening Lead Author

Janet L. Gamble, Ph.D., U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Lead Authors ¹

Kristie L. Ebi, Ph.D., ESS LLC.

Anne E. Grambsch, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Frances G. Sussman, Ph.D., Environmental Economics Consulting

Thomas J. Wilbanks, Ph.D., Oak Ridge National Laboratory

¹ Contributing authors are acknowledged in individual chapters.

FEDERAL EXECUTIVE TEAM

Acting Director, Climate Change Science Program: William J. Brennan

Director, Climate Change Science Program Office: Peter A. Schultz

Lead Agency Principal Representative to CCSP,
National Program Director for the Global Change
Research Program, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency: Joel D. Scheraga

Product Lead, Global Change Research
Program, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency: Janet L. Gamble

Chair, Synthesis and Assessment Product Advisory Group
Associate Director, National Center for Environmental
Assessment, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency: Michael W. Slimak

Synthesis and Assessment Product Coordinator,
Climate Change Science Program Office: Fabien J.G. Laurier

Special Advisor, National Oceanic and Atmospheric
Administration Chad A. McNutt

EDITORIAL AND PRODUCTION TEAM

Editor, U.S. Environmental Protection Agency: Janet Gamble
Technical Editor, ICF International: Melinda Harris
Technical Editor, ICF International: Toby Krasney
Reference Coordinator, ICF International: Paul Stewart
Reference Coordinator, ICF International: Dylan Harrison-Atlas
Reference Coordinator, ICF International: Sarah Shapiro
Logistical and Technical Support, ICF International: Lauren Smith

SAP 4.6 Analysis of the Effects of Global Change on Human Health and Welfare and Human Systems

Disclaimer: This document, part of the Synthesis and Assessment Products described in the U.S. Climate Change Science Program (CCSP) Strategic Plan, was prepared in accordance with Section 515 of the Treasury and General Government Appropriations Act for Fiscal Year 2001 (Public Law 106-554) and the information quality act guidelines issued by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency pursuant to Section 515. The CCSP Interagency Committee relies on U.S. Environmental Protection Agency certifications regarding compliance with Section 515 and Agency guidelines as the basis for determining that this product conforms with Section 515. For purposes of compliance with Section 515, this CCSP Synthesis and Assessment Product is an “interpreted product” as that term is used in U.S. Environmental Protection Agency guidelines and is classified as “highly influential”. This document does not express any regulatory policies of the United States or any of its agencies, or provides recommendations for regulatory action.



July 2008

Members of Congress:

On behalf of the National Science and Technology Council, the U.S. Climate Change Science Program (CCSP) is pleased to transmit to the President and the Congress this Synthesis and Assessment Product (SAP), *Analyses of the Effects of Global Change on Human Health and Welfare and Human Systems*. This is part of a series of 21 SAPs produced by the CCSP aimed at providing current assessments of climate change science to inform public debate, policy, and operational decisions. These SAPs are also intended to help the CCSP develop future program research priorities. This SAP is issued pursuant to Section 106 of the Global Change Research Act of 1990 (Public Law 101-606).

The CCSP’s guiding vision is to provide the Nation and the global community with the science-based knowledge needed to manage the risks and capture the opportunities associated with climate and related environmental changes. The SAPs are important steps toward achieving that vision and help to translate the CCSP’s extensive observational and research database into informational tools that directly address key questions being asked of the research community.

This SAP focuses on the effects of global change on human health and welfare and human systems. It was developed with broad scientific input and in accordance with the Guidelines for Producing CCSP SAPs, the Federal Advisory Committee Act, the Information Quality Act, Section 515 of the Treasury and General Government Appropriations Act for fiscal year 2001 (Public Law 106-554), and the guidelines issued by the Environmental Protection Agency pursuant to Section 515.

We commend the report’s authors for both the thorough nature of their work and their adherence to an inclusive review process.

Sincerely,

Carlos M. Gutierrez
Secretary of Commerce

Samuel W. Bodman
Secretary of Energy

John H. Marburger III
Director, Office of Science
and Technology Policy
Executive Director, Committee
on Climate Change Science and
Technology Integration

Chair, Committee on
Climate Change Science
and Technology Integration

Vice Chair, Committee on
Climate Change Science
and Technology Integration

AUTHORS TEAM FOR THIS REPORT

Executive Summary	<p>Convening Lead Author: Janet L. Gamble, U.S. EPA Lead Authors: Kristie L. Ebi, ESS LLC.; Frances G. Sussman, Environmental Economics Consulting; Thomas J. Wilbanks, Oak Ridge National Laboratory Contributing Authors: Colleen Reid, ASPH Fellow; John V. Thomas, U.S. EPA; Christopher P. Weaver, U.S. EPA; Melinda Harris, ICF International; Randy Freed, ICF International</p>
Chapter 1	<p>Convening Lead Author: Janet L. Gamble, U.S. EPA Lead Authors: Kristie L. Ebi, ESS LLC.; Anne Grambsch, U.S. EPA; Frances G. Sussman, Environmental Economics Consulting; Thomas J. Wilbanks, Oak Ridge National Laboratory Contributing Authors: Colleen E. Reid, ASPH Fellow; Katharine Hayhoe, Texas Tech University; John V. Thomas, U.S. EPA; Christopher P. Weaver, U.S. EPA</p>
Chapter 2	<p>Lead Author: Kristie L. Ebi, ESS LLC. Contributing Authors: John Balbus, Environmental Defense; Patrick L. Kinney, Columbia University; Erin Lipp, University of Georgia; David Mills, Stratus Consulting; Marie S. O’Neill, University of Michigan; Mark Wilson, University of Michigan</p>
Chapter 3	<p>Lead Author: Thomas J. Wilbanks, Oak Ridge National Laboratory Contributing Authors: Paul Kirshen, Tufts University; Dale Quattrochi, NASA/Marshall Space Flight Center; Patricia Romero-Lankao, NCAR; Cynthia Rosenzweig, NASA/Goddard; Matthias Ruth, University of Maryland; William Solecki, Hunter College; Joel Tarr, Carnegie Mellon University Contributors: Peter Larsen, University of Alaska-Anchorage; Brian Stone, Georgia Tech</p>
Chapter 4	<p>Lead Author: Frances G. Sussman, Environmental Economics Consulting Contributing Authors: Maureen L. Cropper, University of Maryland at College Park; Hector Galbraith, Galbraith Environmental Sciences LLC.; David Godschalk, University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill; John Loomis, Colorado State University; George Luber, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention; Michael McGeehin, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention; James E. Neumann, Industrial Economics, Inc.; W. Douglass Shaw, Texas A&M University; Arnold Vedlitz, Texas A&M University; Sammy Zahran, Colorado State University</p>
Chapter 5	<p>Convening Lead Author: Janet L. Gamble, U.S. EPA Lead Authors: Kristie L. Ebi, ESS LLC.; Frances G. Sussman, Environmental Economics Consulting; Thomas J. Wilbanks, Oak Ridge National Laboratory Contributing Authors: Colleen E. Reid, ASPH Fellow; John V. Thomas, U.S. EPA; Christopher P. Weaver, U.S. EPA</p>

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This report has been peer reviewed in draft form by individuals identified for their diverse perspectives and technical expertise. The expert review and selection of reviewers followed the OMB's Information Quality Bulletin for Peer Review. The purpose of this independent review is to provide candid and critical comments that will assist the Climate Change Science Program in making this published report as sound as possible and to ensure that the report meets institutional standards. The peer review comments, draft manuscript and response to the peer review comments are publicly available at: www.climatechange.gov/Library/sap/sap4-6/default.php.

Environmental Protection Agency Internal Reviewers

We wish to thank the following individuals from the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency for their review of the first, and in some case later, draft(s) of the report. Reviewers from within EPA, included:

Lisa Conner	Adam Daigneault	Benjamin De Angelo
Barbara Glenn	Doug Grano	Matthew Heberling
Ju-Chin Huang	Stephen Newbold	Jason Samenow
Sara Terry		

National Center for Environmental Assessment, Global Change Research Program

We extend our thanks to our colleagues in the Global Change Research Program who contributed thoughtful insights, reviewed numerous drafts, and helped with the production of the report.

John Thomas	Christopher Weaver
-------------	--------------------

Federal Agency Reviewers

Likewise, we thank the reviewers from within the federal "family." Reviewers from across the federal agencies provided their comments during the public comment period.

Brigid DeCoursey	Department of Transportation
Mary Gant	National Institutes of Environmental Health Sciences / NIH
Indur M. Goklany	Department of Interior
Charlotte Skidmore	Office of Management and Budget
Samuel P. Williamson	Office of the Federal Coordinator for Meteorology

Public Reviewers

We also extend our thanks to the reviewers who provided their comments during the public comment period, included individuals from the public.

William Fang	Edison Electric Institute
--------------	---------------------------

Katherine Farrell	AACDH
Hans Martin Fuessel	PICIR
Eric Holdsworth	Edison Electric Institute
John Kinsman	Edison Electric Institute
Kim Knowlton	Natural Resources Defense Council
Sabrina McCormick	Michigan State University
J. Alan Roberson	American Water Works Association
Gina Solomon	Natural Resources Defense Council

Human Impacts of Climate Change Advisory Committee (HICCAC)

Finally, we are indebted to the thoughtful review provided by a Federal Advisory Committee convened by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency to provide an independent expert review of the SAP 4.6. The panel (the Human Impacts of Climate Change Advisory Committee) met in October 2007 to discuss their findings and recommendations for the report. Following extensive revisions to the report, the HICCAC reconvened by teleconference in January 2008 to review the authors' response to comments. The panel's review of the report has contributed to a markedly improved document.

Chair	Tom Dietz	Michigan State University
Co-chair	Barbara Entwisle	University of North Carolina
Members	Howard Frumkin	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
	Peter Gleick	Pacific Institute
	Jonathan Patz	University of Wisconsin
	Roger Pulwarty	NOAA
	Eugene Rosa	Washington State University
	Susan Stonich	University of California at Santa Barbara

Thanks are also in order to Joanna Foellmer, the Designated Federal Official from within the National Center for Environmental Assessment (NCEA) who organized and managed the HICCAC.

ICF International

We thank our colleagues at ICF International for their support—logistical and technical—in preparing the report. We wish to extend special thanks to Melinda Harris and Randy Freed.

Summary

It has been an honor and a pleasure to work with all of the people named above as well as the many colleagues we have encountered in the process of preparing this report. We hope that this document will be a positive step forward in our efforts to assess the impacts of climate change on human systems and to evaluate opportunities for adaptation.

RECOMMENDED CITATIONS

Note: The page numbers included below are specific to the pre-layout draft of the report. These page numbers will change in the final printed version.

For the Report as a Whole:

CCSP, 2008: *Analyses of the effects of global change on human health and welfare and human systems*. A Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research. [Gamble, J.L. (ed.), K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, (Authors)]. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, USA.

For Executive Summary:

Gamble, J.L., K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, C. Reid, J.V. Thomas, C.P. Weaver, M. Harris, and R. Freed, 2008: Executive Summary. In: *Analyses of the effects of global change on human health and welfare and human systems*. A Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research. [Gamble, J.L. (ed.), K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, (Authors)]. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, USA, p. ES-1 to ES-14.

For Chapter 1:

Gamble, J.L., K.L. Ebi, A. Grambsch, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, C.E. Reid, K. Hayhoe, J.V. Thomas, and C.P. Weaver, 2008: Introduction. In: *Analyses of the effects of global change on human health and welfare and human systems*. A Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research. [Gamble, J.L. (ed.), K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, (Authors)]. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, USA, p. 1-1 to 1-41.

For Chapter 2:

Ebi, K.L., J. Balbus, P.L. Kinney, E. Lipp, D. Mills, M.S. O'Neill, and M. Wilson, 2008: Effects of Global Change on Human Health. In: *Analyses of the effects of global change on human health and welfare and human systems*. A Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research. [Gamble, J.L. (ed.), K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, (Authors)]. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, USA, p. 2-1 to 2-78.

For Chapter 3:

Wilbanks, T.J., P. Kirshen, D. Quattrochi, P. Romero-Lankao, C. Rosenzweig, M. Ruth, W. Solecki, and J. Tarr, 2008: Effects of Global Change on Human Settlements. In: *Analyses of the effects of global change on human health and welfare and human systems*. A Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research. [Gamble, J.L. (ed.), K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, (Authors)]. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, USA, p. 3-1 to 3-31.

For Chapter 4:

Sussman, F.G., M.L. Cropper, H. Galbraith, D. Godschalk, J. Loomis, G. Lubert, M. McGeehin, J.E. Neumann, W.D. Shaw, A. Vedlitz, and S. Zahran, 2008: Effects of Global Change on Human Welfare. In: *Analyses of the effects of global change on human health and welfare and human systems*. A Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research. [Gamble, J.L. (ed.), K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, (Authors)]. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, USA, p. 4-1 to 4-74.

For Chapter 5: Gamble, J.L., K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, C. Reid, J.V. Thomas, and C.P. Weaver, 2008: Common Themes and Research Recommendations. In: *Analyses of the effects of global change on human health and welfare and human systems*. A Report by the U.S. Climate Change Science Program and the Subcommittee on Global Change Research. [Gamble, J.L. (ed.), K.L. Ebi, F.G. Sussman, T.J. Wilbanks, (Authors)]. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Washington, DC, USA, p. 5-1 to 5-11.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Executive Summary

Abstract ES-3

ES.1 Climate Change and Vulnerability ES-3

ES.2 Climate Change and Human Health ES-5

ES.3 Climate Change and Human Settlements ES-7

ES.4 Climate Change and Human Welfare ES-9

ES.5 Tables ES-11

1. Introduction

1.1 Scope and Approach of the SAP 4.6 1-3

1.2 Climate Change in the United States: Context for an Assessment of Impacts on Human Systems 1-7

1.2.1 Rising temperatures 1-8

1.2.2 Trends in precipitation 1-9

1.2.3 Rising sea levels and erosion of coastal zones 1-10

1.2.4 Changes in Extreme Conditions 1-11

1.3 Population Trends and Migration Patterns: A Context for Assessing Climate-related Impacts 1-14

1.3.1 Trends in total U.S. Population 1-14

1.3.2 Migration patterns 1-15

1.4 Complex Linkages: The Role of Non-climate Factors 1-17

1.4.1 Economic status 1-18

1.4.2 Technology 1-18

1.4.3 Infrastructure 1-19

1.4.4 Human and Social Capital and Behaviors 1-20

1.4.5 Institutions 1-20

1.4.6 Interacting effects 1-21

1.5 Reporting Uncertainty in SAP 4.6 1-22

1.6 References 1-24

1.7 Tables 1-36

1.8 Figures 1-37

2. Human Health

2.1 Introduction 2-3

2.2 Observed Climate-Sensitive Health Outcomes in the United States 2-4

2.2.1 Thermal Extremes: Heat Waves 2-4

2.2.2 Thermal Extremes: Cold Waves 2-6

2.2.3 Extreme Events: Hurricanes, Floods, and Wildfires 2-6

2.2.4 Indirect Health Impacts of Climate Change 2-8

2.3 Projected Health Impacts of Climate Change in the United States 2-15

2.3.1 Heat-Related Mortality 2-15

2.3.2 Hurricanes, Floods, Wildfires and Health Impacts 2-17

2.3.3 Vectorborne and Zoonotic Diseases 2-18

2.3.4	Water- and Foodborne Diseases	2-18
2.3.5	Air Quality Morbidity and Mortality	2-19
2.4	Vulnerable Regions and Subpopulations	2-22
2.4.1	Vulnerable Regions	2-23
2.4.2	Specific Subpopulations at Risk	2-23
2.5	Adaptation	2-26
2.5.1	Actors and Their Roles and Responsibilities for Adaptation	2-27
2.5.2	Adaptation Measures to Manage Climate Change-Related Health Risks	2-29
2.6	Conclusions	2-29
2.7	Expanding the Knowledge Base	2-30
2.8	References	2-32
2.9	Boxes	2-57
2.10	Tables	2-61
2.11	Figures	2-72

3. Human Settlements

3.1	Introduction	3-3
3.1.1	Purpose	3-3
3.1.2	Background	3-3
3.1.3	Current State of Knowledge	3-4
3.2	Climate Change Impacts and the Vulnerabilities of Human Settlements	3-4
3.2.1	Determinants of Vulnerability	3-4
3.2.2	Impacts of Climate Change on Human Settlements	3-5
3.2.3	The Interaction of Climate Impacts with Non-Climate Factors	3-7
3.2.4	Realizing Opportunities from Climate Change in the United States	3-9
3.2.5	Examples of Impacts on Metropolitan Areas in the United States	3-10
3.3	Opportunities for Adaptation of Human Settlements to Climate Change	3-10
3.3.1	Perspectives on Adaptation by Settlements	3-11
3.3.2	Major Categories of Adaptation Strategies	3-12
3.3.3	Examples of Current Adaptation Strategies	3-13
3.3.4	Strategies to Enhance Adaptive Capacity	3-14
3.4	Conclusions	3-14
3.5	Expanding the Knowledge Base	3-15
3.6	References	3-17
3.7	Boxes	3-24
3.8	Tables	3-29
3.9	Figures	3-31

4. Human Welfare

4.1	Introduction	4-3
4.2	Human Welfare, Well-being, and Quality of Life	4-4
4.2.1	Individual Measures of Well-being	4-5
4.2.2	The Social Indicators Approach	4-6
4.2.3	A Closer Look at Communities	4-10
4.2.4	Vulnerable Populations, Communities, and Adaptation	4-12
4.3	An Economic Approach to Human Welfare	4-13

4.3.1 Economic Valuation	4-15
4.3.2 Impacts Assessment and Monetary Valuation	4-16
4.3.3 Human Health	4-17
4.3.4 Ecosystems	4-22
4.3.5 Recreational Activities and Opportunities	4-28
4.3.6 Amenity Value of Climate	4-35
4.4 Conclusions	4-38
4.5 Expanding the Knowledge Base	4-39
4.6 References	4-41
4.7 Appendix 1	4-57
4.8 Boxes	4-64
4.9 Tables	4-66
4.10 Figures	4-72
5. Research	
5.1 Synthesis and Assessment Product 4.6: Advances in the Science	5-3
5.1.1 Complex Linkages and a Cascading Chain of Impacts Across Global Changes	5-3
5.1.2 Changes in Climate Extremes and Climate Averages	5-4
5.1.3 Vulnerable Populations and Vulnerable Locations	5-5
5.1.4 The Cost of and Capacity for Adaptation	5-6
5.1.5 An Integrative Framework	5-6
5.2 Expanding the Knowledge Base	5-7
5.2.1 Human Health Research Gaps	5-9
5.2.2 Human Settlements Research Gaps	5-10
5.2.3 Human Welfare Research Gaps	5-10

6. Glossary and Acronyms