

**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Research and Development**

**BOARD OF SCIENTIFIC COUNSELORS
EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE CONFERENCE CALL**

**November 16, 2000
10:00 a.m. – 12:00 noon EST**

Discussion and Approval of the PM Research Program Report

Dr. Jerry Schnoor (University of Iowa), Chair of the Board of Scientific Counselors (BOSC), indicated that the revised draft of the PM report had been sent to the BOSC members and the Integration Subcommittee members by e-mail and regular mail. He incorporated the changes that were discussed at the October meeting into this draft. Dr. Ray Loehr indicated that he agreed with the report; Dr. Costel Denson and Dr. Carol Henry did not provide any comments. Dr. Schnoor asked how the role of the new BOSC members should be characterized with regard to the report. Dr. Herbert Windom (Skidaway Institute of Oceanography) said that it was difficult for him to comment on the report because he was not involved in the review, but he agreed to approve it given that the other BOSC members appear to be satisfied with this revised draft.

Dr. Jim Clark (Exxon Mobil Research & Engineering Company) agreed with the changes incorporated by Dr. Schnoor and indicated that also would approve the report. Dr. Rae Zimmerman (New York University) stated that she was pleased with the revised report. She noted that it would have been easier to review if the last round of changes had been highlighted in the document. Dr. Schnoor quickly reviewed the changes to the report. Several sentences were added to the Executive Summary and the tone was changed to reflect the fact that the BOSC's recommendations are meant to fine tune an already excellent program. Dr. Schnoor added transition sentences in the Overall Integration section as well as subheadings for better organization. He also attempted to explain what the BOSC meant by gap analysis. The formats for each chapter were made more consistent (e.g., each chapter now contains a conclusions and recommendations section), and the epidemiology chapter was reformatted to conform to the other chapters.

Dr. Schnoor said that he would like the members to vote on the report today and asked if he should give those members not present on the call an opportunity to vote by e-mail. He noted that about half of the BOSC members are present on the conference call. Dr. James Bus (Dow Chemical Company) recommended that the members present vote on accepting the report; the other members have had numerous opportunities to comment if they had strong objections to the report. Dr. Bus made a motion that the BOSC members accept the PM Research Program Review Report, and Dr. Windom seconded the motion. The report was unanimously accepted by the BOSC members present on the conference call. Dr. Schnoor agreed to prepare a cover letter to Dr. Norine Noonan (Assistant Administrator for ORD) to accompany the report.

Subcommittee Assignments

Dr. Schnoor sent an e-mail to the BOSC members with the assignments for the standing subcommittees. The assignments were as follows:

National Center for Environmental Assessment (NCEA) — Zimmerman (Chair), Mattison (Vice-chair)
National Center for Environmental Research (NCER) — Brown (Chair), Johnson (Vice-chair), McKay
National Exposure Research Laboratory (NERL) — Schnoor (chair), Stewart (vice-chair), Cooper
National Health and Environmental Effects Research Laboratory (NHEERL) — Bus (Chair), Windom (Vice-chair), Acosta
National Risk Management Research Laboratory (NRMRL) — Small (Chair), Clark (Vice-chair), Dorward-King
ORD Communications — Bostrom (chair), Dorward-King (Vice-chair)
STAR Program — Brown (Chair), Acosta (Vice-chair).

He assigned the senior members the Chair positions and the new members the Vice Chair positions. The Vice Chair will move up to the Chair position when the Chair rotates off the Board. In making the assignments, Dr. Schnoor tried to accommodate the members' first choices; however, not everyone received their first choice assignment because numerous members requested NHEERL and NRMRL. Dr. Windom indicated that he is pleased with his assignment on NHEERL, but because his institution works with the Gulf Breeze Laboratory, he was concerned there may be a conflict. Dr. Peter Preuss (Director, NCER, ORD) said he would have to think about whether that assignment would be a conflict. He noted that several BOSC members received grants from ORD, but it may be better to avoid any hint of conflict with regard to subcommittee assignments. Dr. Windom pointed out that his institution performs a small number of analyses for only one of the NHEERL laboratories. Dr. Preuss did not think it would be a problem and he would discuss it later with Dr. Windom. Ms. Shirley Hamilton (NCER, ORD) asked if Dr. Windom had anything to gain if the contract is awarded to his institution. Dr. Windom replied that he did not. Dr. Bus pointed out that the advice provided by the subcommittee will be primarily at the strategic level, so rarely will there be a conflict. If the subcommittee receives detailed information that could pose a conflict, then Dr. Windom should notify the Designated Federal Officer.

Dr. Zimmerman indicated that she was pleased with her assignment and liked the idea of assigning new members to the Vice Chair positions. Dr. Small was pleased with his assignment as well. Dr. Schnoor indicated that he has asked Dr. Bill Cooper (Michigan State University) to serve as the Chair of the NERL Subcommittee, so that he could be free to assist with other subcommittees. Dr. Schnoor said he would remain a member of the NERL Subcommittee if Dr. Cooper accepts the Chair position.

Ms. Hamilton asked Dr. Schnoor to clarify that there is no STAR Program Subcommittee. Dr. Schnoor said that he included it on the list because he would like to appoint several BOSC members to the National Research Council (NRC) committee forming to review the STAR Program. If only one member or no members can be assigned to that committee, these BOSC members will be reassigned to other subcommittees.

Dr. Schnoor noted that the Communications Subcommittee will examine communications throughout ORD. He noted that this subcommittee could conduct sites visits and operate like the Laboratory/Center subcommittees. Dr. Bostrom thought it would be helpful to have more members on the Communications Subcommittee. Dr. Schnoor asked if they should be BOSC members or external members. Dr. Bostrom replied that she would prefer one more BOSC member, particularly someone who was on the previous review. She noted that Dr. Zimmerman participated in the previous review. Dr. Zimmerman offered to help with that subcommittee, but noted that she rotates off the BOSC in August 2001. Dr. Small noted that several of the previous subcommittees commented on communications. Dr. Bostrom indicated that she would like to ask Caron Chess to work with the Communications Subcommittee. Dr. Schnoor said that he and Ms. Hamilton could help in getting external members for the subcommittees. Dr. Small said that if Caron is not available, he would recommend Steve Lewis from Exxon, who has expressed his

interest in continued interactions with the BOSC. Dr. Small mentioned that Caron Chess and Steve Lewis were members of the subcommittee that examined communications. Dr. Schnoor asked the Chairs and Vice-chairs of the subcommittees to give some thought to additional members before the January BOSC meeting. Dr. Bostrom agreed to call Steve and Caron to determine their interest in serving on the Communications Subcommittee. If they are interested, she will notify Ms. Hamilton.

Ms. Hamilton mentioned that there is no list of standing consultants; the entire process must be started again and it will take about 2 months. Dr. Preuss said that Ms. Hamilton will check the Science Advisory Board (SAB) list to see if the individuals are on that list; if they are, it will take less time to process the paperwork. Dr. Preuss mentioned that the potential candidates who were not selected for the BOSC should be considered for these subcommittees. There were 31 excellent candidates on the final list and the senior Board members have that list. Dr. Bostrom pointed out that Anna Harding was on that list and she would be an excellent subcommittee member. Dr. Schnoor asked the Chairs (Drs. Zimmerman, Brown, Small, Schnoor, Bus, and Bostrom) to provide him a list of who they would like to add to their subcommittees prior to the January meeting. He will forward the proposed list of subcommittee members to Ms. Hamilton so that she can check the SAB list to determine who is on that list. He expects that two or three more people will be added to each subcommittee. The BOSC members agreed that the subcommittees should have five members. Dr. Schnoor would like the subcommittee membership finalized by the January meeting. Dr. Windom asked if the list of 31 candidates could be provided to the new members. Dr. Preuss agreed to provide the list of names, their affiliations, and their areas of expertise to the new BOSC members. Ms. Beverly Campbell (SCG) agreed to e-mail the list of 31 candidates to each of the new BOSC members. Dr. Preuss said that the Chairs should not be overly concerned about selecting individuals who are on the SAB list; the paperwork for individuals not on that list will only take a few extra weeks. Dr. Schnoor said that he will work with Ms. Hamilton to get the new subcommittee members approved. Because the full BOSC must vote to approve the subcommittee members, the vote will be taken at the next meeting. Dr. Preuss noted that if the vote is taken at the January meeting, that portion of the meeting must be closed to the public.

Dr. Small asked if the new members had received copies of the Laboratory/Center Review reports. Ms. Hamilton said that the new members were sent copies of the reports following the October meeting. Ms. Campbell confirmed that those reports had been sent by e-mail. Dr. Schnoor asked that the reports be mailed to the new members before the January meeting and Ms. Campbell agreed to send out copies of the reports.

Next BOSC Meeting

Dr. Schnoor reported that most of the BOSC members are available on January 25-26, 2001, for the next meeting. Dr. Bus indicated that he is available on the 26th and could arrive late on the 25th. Dr. Small mentioned that he is not available on the 26th, but could be there on the 25th. It was decided that the next meeting would be held January 25-26, 2001; the agenda will include a full day on the 25th and a half-day on the 26th.

Multiyear Plans

Dr. Schnoor reminded the BOSC members that there are five pilot multiyear plans nearly ready for review. These include: particulate matter, drinking water, endocrine disruptors, global climate change, and pollution prevention. Dr. Preuss mentioned that 16 multiyear plans (the health and ecology plans are each split into four reports) to cover all of ORD's portfolio are due tomorrow; however, the plans will not be available to the BOSC for several months, because the internal peer review must be completed before they go to the Board.

Dr. Schnoor asked if the Board should look at all of the plans or select several to review. Drs. Windom and Elaine Dorward-King (Rio Tinto Borax) both indicated that it would be better to review one or two plans, rather than all of the plans. Dr. Schnoor asked Dr. Preuss if ORD has any preferences with regard to which plans the BOSC reviews. Dr. Preuss agreed to pose that question to Dr. Noonan and the other Laboratory/Center Directors. He noted that particulate matter, drinking water, and endocrine disruptors appear to be the most likely candidates for BOSC review. Dr. Preuss mentioned that the BOSC may want to do one plan for problem-driven research and one for core research. Dr. Bostrom asked if the BOSC could receive at least one draft report by the January meeting. Dr. Preuss agreed to find out if any of the plans would be ready for distribution at the next meeting. Dr. Bus said that he likes the idea of looking at multiyear plans that affect the future strategic directions of the Agency. Dr. Preuss indicated that health, ecology, pollution prevention, and socioeconomics are the plans for the core research areas. Dr. Schnoor stated that there is good health expertise on the BOSC; perhaps the Board should review the health plan. It was agreed that the BOSC would select several multiyear plans for review, and the plans selected will include at least one core area and one problem-driven area. Dr. Schnoor indicated that the BOSC members will continue to communicate on this issue by e-mail and telephone, and he will ensure that the appropriate people are available at the next meeting to discuss this issue and make a final decision.

Dr. Bonnie McCay's BOSC Membership

Dr. Schnoor indicated that Dr. Bonnie McCay expressed some hesitation with continuing to serve on the BOSC. Dr. Bostrom was concerned about Dr. McCay's resignation and asked Dr. Schnoor if there was any chance she would change her mind. Dr. Schnoor replied that he would speak to Dr. McCay again about continuing to serve on the Board.

Dr. Schnoor thanked the BOSC members for their participation on the call and reminded them to mark their calendars for the January 25-26, 2001 meeting.

Action Items

The following action items were identified during the discussions:

- ❖ Dr. Schnoor agreed to prepare a cover letter to Dr. Noonan to accompany the PM Research Program Review Report.
- ❖ Dr. Preuss will discuss with Dr. Windom whether his assignment to the NHEERL Subcommittee is a conflict of interest.
- ❖ Dr. Bostrom agreed to call Steve Lewis and Caron Chess to determine their interest in serving on the Communications Subcommittee. If they are interested, she will notify Ms. Hamilton.
- ❖ The Chairs (Drs. Zimmerman, Brown, Small, Schnoor, Bus, and Bostrom) of the Laboratory/Center subcommittees will provide Dr. Schnoor a list of who they would like to add to their subcommittees prior to the January meeting. Dr. Schnoor will forward the proposed list of subcommittee members to Ms. Hamilton so that she can check the SAB list to determine who is on that list.
- ❖ Ms. Campbell agreed to send the list of 31 candidates (names, affiliations, and areas of expertise) to the new BOSC members.
- ❖ Dr. Schnoor will work with Ms. Hamilton to process the paperwork for the external subcommittee members.

- ✧ Ms. Campbell agreed to mail copies of the Laboratory/Center Review Reports to the new BOSC members before the January meeting.
- ✧ Dr. Preuss agreed to ask Dr. Noonan and the other Laboratory/Center Directors their preferences with regard to which multiyear plans should be reviewed by the BOSC.
- ✧ Dr. Preuss agreed to determine if any of the multiyear plans will be ready for distribution at the January meeting.
- ✧ The BOSC members will select several multiyear plans for review; at least one of these plans will be a core research area and at least one will be a problem-driven research area.
- ✧ Dr. Schnoor will continue to communicate with BOSC members about selection of multiyear plans for review.
- ✧ Dr. Small agreed to assist with identifying potential candidates to replace Dr. McKay. He will try to identify the individual recommended by Dr. McKay and will prepare a short list of candidates with appropriate expertise for consideration by the BOSC.

List of Participants

Ann Bostrom, Ph.D.

Associate Professor
Georgia Institute of Technology
School of Public Policy
685 Cherry Street
Atlanta, GA 30332-0345
Receptionist: 404-894-3196
Fax: 404-894-0535
E-mail: ann.bostrom@pubpolicy.gatech.edu

Ann Bostrom, Ph.D. (Current Address)

Program Director
Decision, Risk, and Management Science
Program
Division of Social and Economic Sciences
National Science Foundation
4201 Wilson Boulevard, Room 995
Arlington, VA 22230
Phone: 703-292-7263
Fax: 703-306-0485
E-mail: abostrom@nsf.gov

Beverly Campbell

The Scientific Consulting Group, Inc.
656 Quince Orchard Road, Suite 210
Gaithersburg, MD 20878
Tel: 301-670-4990
Fax: 301-670-3815
E-mail: bcampbel@scgcorp.com

James S. Bus, Ph.D.

Science Policy Leader and Technical
Director
Health and Environmental Sciences
The Dow Chemical Company
1803 Building
Midland, MI 48674
Phone: 517-636-4557
Fax: 517-638-9863
E-mail: jbus@dow.com

James R. Clark, Ph.D.

Exxon Mobil Research & Engineering Co.
3225 Gallows Road, Room 3A412
Fairfax, VA 22037
Phone: 703-846-3565
Fax: 703-846-6001
E-mail: jrclar3@erenj.com

Elaine J. Dorward-King, Ph.D.

Global Executive, Environment, Health
and Safety
Rio Tinto Borax
26877 Tourney Road
Valencia, CA 91355-1847
Phone: 661-287-5779
Fax: 661-287-5566
E-mail: elaine.dorward-king@borax.com

Shirley R. Hamilton

Designated Federal Officer
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Research and Development
National Center for Environmental Research
(8701R)
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Washington, DC 20460
Phone: 202-564-6853
Fax: 202-565-2444
E-mail: hamilton.shirley@epa.gov

Betty J. Overton

Alternate Designated Federal Officer
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Research and Development
National Center for Environmental Research
(8701R)
Washington, DC 20460
Phone: 202-564-6848
Fax: 202-565-2444
E-mail: overton.betty@epa.gov

Avery Palmer

Inside EPA

List of Participants (Continued)

Peter W. Preuss, Ph.D.

ORD BOSC Liaison
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of Research and Development
National Center for Environmental Research
(8701R)
Washington, DC 20460
Phone: 202-564-6825
Fax: 202-565-2444
E-mail: preuss.peter@epa.gov

Jerald L. Schnoor, Ph.D.

Professor of Civil and Environmental
Engineering
Engineering Research Facility
University of Iowa
330 South Madison Street, Room 116
Iowa City, IA 52242
Phone: 319-335-5649
Fax: 319-335-5585
E-mail: jschnoor@cgrer.uiowa.edu

Mitchell J. Small, Ph.D.

Professor of Civil and Environmental
Engineering/Engineering and Public Policy
Carnegie-Mellon University
Porter Hall 119, Frew Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15213-3890
Phone: 412-268-8782
Fax: 412-268-7813
E-mail: ms35@andrew.cmu.edu

Herbert L. Windom, Ph.D.

Skidaway Institute of Oceanography
10 Ocean Science Circle
Savannah, GA 31411
Phone: 912-598-2490
Fax: 912-598-2310
E-mail: herb@skio.peachnet.edu

Rae Zimmerman, Ph.D.

Professor
Robert F. Wagner Graduate School of
Public Service
New York University
4 Washington Square North
New York, NY 10003
Phone: 212-998-7432
Fax: 212-995-3890
E-mail: rae.zimmerman@nyu.edu