

These notes are in the following order:

1. Attendance
2. Correspondence and handouts
3. Administrative Items
4. Membership Review
5. Physical Reflections, Peter Steinberg
6. Community Comment
7. CAC Discussion on the ATSDR Public Health Assessment
8. Agenda Setting

1. Attendance

Members/Alternates Present:

See Attached Sheets.

Others Present:

M. Bebon, P. Bond, H. Carrano, J. Carter, J. D'Ascoli, K. Geiger, M. Holland, S. Johnson, G. Penny, A. Rapiejko, A. Reben, S. Robbins, P. Steinberg, J. Tarpinian, A. Yuchatz

2. Correspondence and Handouts

Items one and two were mailed with a cover letter dated November 4, 2005.

1. Draft agenda for November 10, 2005
2. Draft notes for October 20, 2005

3. Administrative

The meeting began at 6:39 p.m. Reed Hodgkin went over the ground rules and the draft agenda. An announcement from the Laboratory was added to the agenda. Matthew Triber, the East Yaphank Civic Association alternate, was introduced and those around the table and in the audience introduced themselves.

Minutes from the June, July, and October meetings were approved as written. There were two abstentions for the July minutes, and four for October.

Peter Bond gave the CAC an update on the budget. He reminded the CAC that when the budget came out in February there was a significant cut in the funding for RHIC and for Medical Imaging. The House and Senate put the money back in after an active campaign. Last week the bill went to a conference committee because the House and Senate did not agree exactly on the numbers. When the bill came out of that committee the RHIC and Medical Imaging money had been reallocated. The House has passed that budget, the Senate has not yet acted on it but is likely to pass it, and it is likely the President will sign it. Bond said that it is expected there will be stories over the weekend on the impact to the Laboratory. At this time the details on why the money was reallocated are not known. Peter said there would be updates in the future.

Member Mannhaupt asked if the Laboratory needed help in asking why?

Bond: There are lots of many people asking questions. There was a press release from the two NY Senators and Rep. Bishop, who are also asking questions, and as said before it will take time before we know the full impact.

Member Graves asked if the dollar figure was known.

Bond: The approximate figure is between \$15 and \$20 million.

Member Garber asked if this was an extreme case?

Bond: This is extremely unusual. Many things are included along with the Department of Energy's budget. For example, the budget bill also contains the budget for the Army Corps of Engineers and there's suspicion that they needed more money in their budget for the impacts of Hurricane Katrina.

Member Garber asked if an email update could be sent before the next meeting.

Bond: More should be known by the December meeting, specific Lab numbers aren't known yet.

Jeanne D'Ascoli stated that the HFBR was not on the agenda tonight because the regulators were still working on it. When their work is completed it will be brought to the CAC. Les Hill is not sure if it will be in December or January. The request for a presentation on the smoker study will be kept as a future agenda item as the scientist was not available for this meeting. There were copies of a Bulletin featuring an article on the study on hand for distribution to members.

D'Ascoli asked the CAC if it was okay for Peter Steinberg's presentation to be taped. The CAC did not object.

4. Membership Review

Jeanne D'Ascoli reported that 14 appears to be the optimum number for obtaining quorum regularly. There are now 27 member organizations, which require a quorum of 15. After reviewing attendance over the past two years it has been some time since either the members or alternates of the educator and health care categories have attended a meeting. CAC guidance states that in the event that a member or alternate misses 1/3 or more of the meetings in a six-month period, the CAC shall contact the organization.

Member Sprintzen indicated they should be contacted.

Member Talbot asked if outreach to fill the categories with new members could be done?

D'Ascoli said she would be happy to do whatever the CAC directed her to.

Garber thought the first step should be to contact the members to see if they are still interested.

The CAC agreed that the process forward would be for Jeanne to contact the groups. If they indicate they are no longer interested in participating, that will be the trigger for Jeanne to start looking in the community.

Sprintzen said if they are not interested they could be asked if they have a recommendation.

Reed noted that from the standpoint of process what is being done tonight and what will go into the announcement coming in December represents notice that the CAC is likely to take action next month. There is a requirement to give notice when an action is going to be taken on membership. Then next month action can be taken and the spot can be vacated so that quorum will be obtainable while trying to fill the positions over time.

Member Sprintzen noted that a former CAC representative from ABCO, Connie Kepert, had been elected to the Brookhaven Town Board.

Note: Following the discussion, alternate Adam Martin, representative for the education category, joined the meeting. Therefore, only the health category representatives will be contacted.

5. Physical Reflections on the World Year of Physics, Near Perfect Fluids, and Quantum Diaries, Peter Steinberg

Peter Steinberg said that he would be talking about physics, the World Year of Physics, near perfect fluid, which is the research being done at the RHIC collider, and quantum diaries which is a project combining physics and the Internet. Although he is from the Chemistry Department, he is a physicist.

Steinberg showed a picture of the beach and pointed out the elements - air, fire (the sun), water, and the Earth. He explained that the elements are actually states of matter – gas, plasma (ionized gas), liquid and solid. Looking further the universe is beyond the sky, light from the sun makes the sky blue, there are waves in the water and there are the geological dynamics of the earth. Physics is around us, but is often hidden from view.

The World Year of Physics is being celebrated now because of the papers Einstein published in 1905. Steinberg explained the photoelectric effect, which was an important precursor to Quantum Theory. He said the second paper called Brownian Motion explained jagged paths of particles suspended in solution. Einstein made a model assuming that the particles were being barraged on all sides by other atoms in the fluid. This can be related to measurement, and proved that matter, especially liquid matter, was atomic in nature and the particle being hit by other particles and could actually calculate the properties of these particles which put the kinetic theory of liquids on a scientific basis.

In June 1905, Einstein published a paper on the Electrodynamics of Moving Bodies, which we now know as the Theory of Special Relativity. Before this, people thought of time and space as rigid things. Einstein realized that neither time nor space is fixed – especially when people observing each other are moving relative to each other.

The fourth paper was called Does the Inertia of a Body Depend on Its Energy Content? The basic idea was that energy and mass could be interchanged with one another. $E = mc^2$ is the foundation of modern particle physics and high-energy nuclear physics and is Einstein's most famous formula.

Steinberg used graphic visualizations to show a particle collision and explained what was happening and said that from the collisions material is made, which he qualified with a "sort of." He talked about quarks and gluons and quark-gluon plasma. He explained how RHIC works and how gold ions are collided there and talked about particle detection. He described the STAR detector, how it works, the perfect fluid, and talked about black holes and the big bang.

Steinberg also explained that because of the World Year of Physics, he was participating in a web log or "blog." The project is called the Quantum Diaries and 33 physicists from around the world are contributing to it. The blog web page is www.quantumdiaries.org.

6. Community Comment

There were no comments.

Member Graves said if the CAC was going to have any input or take any action on the budget cuts they would have to talk about it tonight.

The CAC engaged in a discussion concerning what the appropriate action for them to take would be. The options considered were to write the NY Senators and ask them to vote no on the conference bill, or to write in support of the budget stating how important the work is and what the local impact will be.

The CAC agreed that a letter would be written expressing their concern that this legislation inadequately funds BNL and explains the impact the cuts will have locally.

The CAC further agreed that Members Graves and Esposito would draft the letter, it would go out Wednesday, and copies would be available in the next packet.

7. CAC Discussion on ATSDR Public Health Assessment

Reed noted that the public comment period was underway. It is not a DOE report or a Lab report so neither the Lab nor DOE is in the position to report on the Assessment. He told the CAC that they were on their own in the evaluation of what they've seen and in getting any comments back to the ATSDR. If there are any questions that need to be answered by the Lab because the report has generated those questions, they'll be captured and they'll be answered at the next meeting. It won't have an effect on the CAC's comments to ATSDR, but if further discussion with the Lab on those particular issues is needed, that can be done.

As far as capturing comments, Reed said the CAC could either work toward a consensus resolution or, as has been done in the past, a sense of comments could be captured on the flip charts. He also noted that the public comment period will end next week.

Member Esposito suggested first capturing the comments and then looking at them to decide if there is consensus. The CAC agreed.

The ensuing discussion was led by Members Mannhaupt and Esposito as they had reviewed the entire document. The CAC discussed how the report was to be used, the data contained in the report, the methodology used, the lack of sufficient data to draw conclusions, inaccurate data, the importance of correcting the record, whether or not it was a valid document, and how their criticism of the document might be viewed by the media. Specific concerns regarding the sections on drinking water, air emissions, and the Peconic River were highlighted.

Suffolk County was asked for their opinion on the report. Sy Robbins, of the SCHSD, responded that the County had not taken a formal position yet. They are still reviewing it. He indicated that in general, the staff concurs with the type of comments made by the CAC. He expects they will ask for a lot of changes.

It became clear the task required additional time, and Jeanne D'Ascoli said the Gail Penny indicated that the ATSDR would likely grant an extension of the public comment period. The CAC agreed that the DOE should request an extension until January 20 on their behalf.

There was some discussion on the pros and cons of criticizing the report versus criticizing the Agency itself, inadequate funding, and other issues.

The bullets from the flip charts will be sent out before the next meeting. Reed advised that they should plan to go to closure in December, not January.

Reed told the CAC that they were tough! The agencies that the CAC works with at the local, state, and federal level have helped set a standard of what the CAC finds as acceptable for the community. That's being reflected in how the CAC is responding to the ATSDR. The main point is that's an indictment of the ATSDR and a statement about the standards that the other agencies have brought to the CAC.

Following are the bullets from the flip charts:

- No health impact from BNL
- TCA plume was from Precision Concepts, not from BNL
- Disappointed in quality of report
- Limited and/or uncertified data used when more comprehensive data available from Suffolk County
- Some of data reported is inaccurate
- Study took too long
- Involvement of others in study was inadequate
- Conclusions of report not adequately supported
- Report causes community to question ATSDR methods and quality
- Report failed to meet community need to document study of impacts
- Unsupported historical data and conclusions presented as accepted fact

Drinking Water

- Data used in ATSDR report is insufficient and inadequate to serve as basis for the findings and conclusions in the report

Air Emissions

- There are large uncertainties in air emissions following BGRR fuel rod ruptures – data is insufficient to draw definitive conclusions

Peconic River

- The significant sampling and studies conducted after 1999 are not adequately addressed in report
- Peconic River conclusions are not supported by significant amount of existing data and are not consistent with conclusions of recent studies and evaluations
- Conclusions about pesticide contamination in fish are unsupported
- Recommendations are simplistic and not useful in developing practical strategies
- Innovative and substantive recommendations would have been useful
- Overall, the study is flawed and not a responsible representation of the situation at and around BNL
- CAC rejects the ATSDR study as an ineffective health assessment
- ATSDR health assessment conflicts with assessments made by local, state and federal agencies
- ATSDR study and report would have been useful several years ago – information is now overcome by events and more thorough analyses
- The health effects issues raised by the ATSDR report have been thoroughly addressed and resolved in other studies
- The ATSDR report does not add value to the existing studies
- Some of the ATSDR conclusions are consistent with the results of other recognized studies and some ATSDR conclusions are not consistent with those studies – the

conclusions of the recognized studies should be relied upon instead of those listed in the ATSDR report

8. Agenda Setting

Dec. Agenda

ATSDR discussion (first)

HFBR Alternatives

Budget update

The December anniversary/holiday dinner meeting will begin at 5:30 p.m.

The CAC noted that they prefer meeting in the South Room. The Lab will arrange that for future meetings when possible.

The meeting adjourned at 9:58 p.m.

2005	Affiliation		First Name	Last Name	JAN	FEB	MAR	APR	MAY	JUN	JUL	AUG	SEP	OCT	NOV	DEC
Chart Key - P = Present																
ABCO (Garber added on 4/10/02)	Member	Don	Garber			P	P	P	P	P	P				P	
ABCO	Alternate	Doug	Dittko													
Brookhaven Retired Employees Association	Member	Graham	Campbell	P			P	P	P	P				P	P	
Brookhaven Retired Employees Association (L. Jacobson new alternate as of 4/99)(A. Peskin 5/04)	Alternate	Arnie	Peskin			P		P	P							
CHEC (Community Health & Environment Coalition (added 10/04)	Member	Sarah	Anker	P	P			P	P	P	P			P	P	
	Member	Adrienne	Esposito	P							P			P	P	
Citizens Campaign for the Environment (Ottney added 4/02-takenoff 1/05 Mahoney put on)	Alternate	Brendan	Mahoney			P		P	P	P	P			P		
E. Yaphank Civic Association	Member	Michael	Giacomaro	P	P			P	P	P	P					
E. Yaphank Civic Association (J. Minasi new alternate as of 3/99) (M. Triber 11/05)	Alternate	Matthew	Triber												P	
Educator	Member	Audrey	Capozzi				P									
Educator (B. Martin - 9/01)	Alternate	Bruce	Martin													
Educator (A. Martin new alternate 2/00) (Adam to college 8/01)(add. alternate 9/02)	Alternate	Adam	Martin					P								P
Environmental Economic Roundtable (Berger resigned, Proios became member 1/01)	Member	George	Proios	P												P
Environmental Economic Roundtable (3/99, L. Snead changed to be alternate for EDF)	Alternate	None	None													
Fire Rescue and Emergency Services	Member	Joe	Williams													
Fire Rescue and Emergency Services	Alternate	Don	Lynch											P	P	
Fire Rescue and Emergency Services	Alternate	James	McLoughlin	P	P	P			P	P						
Friends of Brookhaven (E.Kaplan changed to become member 7/1/01)	Member	Ed	Kaplan	P	P				P	P	P					P
Friends of Brookhaven (E.Kaplan changed to become member 7/1/01)(schwartz added 11/18/02)	Alternate	Steve	Schwartz													
Health Care	Member	Jane	Corrarino													
Health Care (as of 10/02 per JD)	Alternate	Mina	Barrett													
Huntington Breast Cancer Coalition	Member	Mary Joan	Shea	P			P	P			P				P	

2005	Affiliation		First Name	Last Name	JAN	FEB	MAR	APR	MAY	JUN	JUL	AUG	SEP	OCT	NOV	DEC
	Huntington Breast Cancer Coalition	Alternate	Scott	Carlin												
	Intl. Brotherhood of Electrical Workers/Local 2230	Member	Mark	Walker	P	P	P	P	P	P				P	P	
	IBEW/Local 2230	Alternate	Philip	Pizzo												
	L.I. Pine Barrens Society	Member	Richard	Amper	P											
	L.I. Pine Barrens Society (added P. Loris 6/05)	Alternates	Phoebe	Loris			P	P	P	P	P					
	L.I. Progressive Coalition	Member	David	Sprintzen	P	P	P	P	P	P	P			P	P	
	L.I. Progressive Coalition	Alternate	None	None												
	Lake Panamoka Civic Association (Biss as of 4/02)	Member	Rita	Biss	P	P	P	P	P	P	P			P	P	
	Lake Panamoka Civic Association (Rita Biss new alternate as of 3/99)	Alternate	Joe	Gibbons												
	Long Island Association (Groneman replace 10/05)	Member	Lauren	Hill										P		
	Long Island Association	Alternate	William	Evanzia				P								
	Longwood Alliance	Member	Tom	Talbot	P			P		P					P	
	Longwood Alliance	Alternate	Kevin	Crowley												
	Longwood Central School Dist. (switched 11/02)	Member	Barbara	Henigin	P	P	P			P	P			P	P	
	Longwood Central School Dist.	Alternate	Allan	Gersytern												
	NEAR	Member	Jean	Mannhaupt	P		P	P						P	P	
	NEAR (prospect taken off ¾)(blumer added 10/04)	Alternate	Karen	Blumer												
	NSLS User	Member	Jean	Jordan-Sweet	P	P		P	P	P					P	
	NSLS User	Alternate	Peter	Stephens												
	Peconic River Sportsmen's Club (added 4/8/04)	Member	John	Hall	P	P		P		P	P					
	Peconic River Sportsmen's Club	Alternate	Jeff	Schneider		P										
	Science & Technology (added 1/13/05)	Member	Iqbal	Chaudhry	P	P	P	P		P						
	Town of Brookhaven	Member	John	Turner												
	Town of Brookhaven	Alternate	Anthony	Graves	P	P		P	P	P	P			P	P	
	Town of Brookhaven, Senior Citizens	Member	James	Heil		P	P		P						P	
	Town of Brookhaven, Senior Citizens (open slot as of 4/99)	Alternate	None	None												
	Town of Riverhead	Member	Robert	Conklin	P	P	P	P	P	P	P				P	
	Town of Riverhead (K. Skinner alternate as of 4/99)	Alternate	Kim	Skinner												
	Wading River Civic Association	Member	Helga	Guthy	P	P		P	P					P		
	Wading River Civic Association	Alternate	Sid	Bail												