

# Table of Contents

<b>Preface</b> .....	<b>iii</b>
----------------------	------------

<b>Chapter I: Executive Summary</b> .....	<b>3</b>
-------------------------------------------	----------

A. Overview.....	3
B. Technology Overview (Chapter II).....	4
C. Risk Assessment Methodology (Chapter III) .....	5
D. The Implications of Epigenetic Reprogramming for Clones and their Progeny (Chapter IV).....	7
E. Risks to Animals Involved in Cloning (Chapter V).....	8
F. Food Consumption Risks (Chapter VI) .....	9
1. Two-Pronged Approach to Identifying and Characterizing Food Consumption Risks.....	9
2. Conclusions Regarding Potential Food Consumption Risks .....	10
a. Cattle Clones.....	10
b. Swine Clones .....	12
c. Sheep Clones.....	13
d. Goat Clones.....	13
e. Clone Progeny.....	13
G. Concluding Statements (Chapter VII) .....	14

<b>Chapter II: Technology Overview: Somatic Cell Nuclear Transfer and Other Assisted Reproductive Technologies</b> .....	<b>19</b>
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------

A. What is Cloning?.....	20
B. Continuum of Reproductive Technologies .....	21
1. Natural Service.....	21
2. Artificial Insemination and Synchronized Estrus .....	22
3. Embryo Transfer .....	24
4. <i>In vitro</i> Fertilization .....	26
5. Embryo splitting.....	27
6. Blastomere Nuclear Transfer .....	28
7. Somatic Cell Nuclear Transfer (SCNT).....	29
a. Donor cell.....	30
b. Oocyte.....	31
c. Fusion.....	31
d. Transfer to recipient.....	32
C. Critical Biological Events in SCNT.....	32
D. Outcomes Observed in ARTs .....	34
E. Future of Reproductive Technologies in Modern Agricultural Practice .....	36

**Chapter III: Developing the Risk Assessment Methodology..... 41**

- A. Charge..... 41
- B. General Discussion of Risk/Safety Analyses..... 41
  - 1. Risk and Safety ..... 41
  - 2. Risk Assessment vs. Risk Management..... 42
- C. Risk/Safety Assessment of Cloning..... 42
- D. Transgenic Animal Clones..... 44
- E. Methodology Development ..... 45
  - 1. Hazard Characterization..... 46
  - 2. Potential Risks ..... 48
  - 3. Proposed Approaches..... 49
    - a. Animal Health Risks..... 49
    - b. Food Consumption Risks..... 49
- F. Two-Pronged Approach to Assessing Food Consumption Risks ..... 50
  - 1. Critical Biological Systems Approach..... 51
    - a. Overview..... 51
    - b. Evaluation Nodes..... 52
- G. Limitations of the Risk Assessment..... 54

**Chapter IV: Epigenetic Reprogramming: Implications for Clones and their Progeny ..... 59**

- A. Overview of Epigenetic Reprogramming in Early Embryonic Development ..... 61
  - 1. Preimplantation Reprogramming..... 63
    - a. Fusion and Cleavage..... 63
    - b. Demethylation and Remethylation in Early Embryos ..... 66
    - c. Epigenetic Reprogramming in Later Development ..... 70
    - d. Studies of Gene Expression and Development in Clones and Other ARTs . 72
  - 2. Gametogenic Reprogramming..... 77
  - 3. Conclusions from Studies of Epigenetic Reprogramming..... 79
- B. Phenotypic Evidence for Gametogenic Reprogramming ..... 80
  - 1. Phenotypic Anomalies Observed in Mouse Clones..... 80
    - a. Utility of Mouse Model ..... 80
    - b. Pregnancy (Developmental Node 1)..... 81
    - c. Perinatal Period (Developmental Node 2) ..... 83
    - d. Juvenile Period to Reproductive Maturity (Developmental Nodes 3 and 4) 84
    - e. Maturity and Aging (Developmental Node 5)..... 86
  - 2. Conclusions from Phenotypic Studies of Gametogenic Reprogramming in Mouse Clones and their Progeny for Reprogramming in Domestic Livestock Clones and their Progeny ..... 87
- C. Implications of Epigenetic Reprogramming for Animal Health and Food Consumption Risks ..... 89

**Chapter V: Animal Health Risks ..... 93**

- A. Potential Hazards and Risks to Animals Involved in Cloning..... 93
- B. The Critical Biological Systems Approach to the Analysis of Clone Animal Health: Cattle, Swine, Sheep, and Goats ..... 94
  - 1. Pregnancy and Parturition (Developmental Node 1)..... 94
  - 2. Perinatal Period (Developmental Node 2)..... 96
  - 3. Juvenile Developmental Node (Developmental Node 3) ..... 97
  - 4. Reproductive Development and Function Node (Developmental Node 4)..... 98
  - 5. Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging (Developmental Node 5)..... 99
    - a. Telomere Length as an Indicator of Aging ..... 100
- C. Data on Animal Health by Species ..... 104
  - 1. Cattle..... 104
    - a. Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition..... 107
      - i. Pregnancy..... 107
      - ii. Parturition ..... 111
        - (a) Hydrops..... 111
        - (b) Dystocia ..... 114
        - (c) Large Offspring Syndrome ..... 115
        - (d) Other complications..... 116
    - b. Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period..... 116
      - (a) Large Offspring Syndrome ..... 117
      - (b) Other complications..... 122
      - i. Cyagra Data: Perinatal Cohort..... 124
      - ii. Unpublished data ..... 125
    - c. Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Development ..... 127
      - i. Peer-Reviewed Publications ..... 127
      - ii. Cyagra Data: 1-6 Month Cohort ..... 133
      - iii. Unpublished data ..... 135
    - d. Developmental Node 4: Reproductive Development and Function ..... 140
      - i. Peer-Reviewed Publications ..... 140
      - ii. Unpublished Data..... 145
    - e. Developmental Node V: Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging ..... 147
      - i. Peer-reviewed literature ..... 147
      - ii. Cyagra Data: 6-18 Month Cohort ..... 149
      - iii. Unpublished data ..... 149
    - f. Progeny of Bovine Clones ..... 151
    - g. Summary for Health of Bovine Clones and Their Progeny ..... 152
  - 2. Swine..... 153
    - a. Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition..... 154
      - i. Pregnancy..... 154
      - ii. Parturition ..... 154
    - b. Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period..... 155
      - i. Peer-Reviewed Publications ..... 155
      - ii. Viagen dataset..... 157
      - iii. Unpublished data ..... 157
    - c. Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Development ..... 159

i.	Peer-reviewed literature .....	159
ii.	Viagen dataset.....	161
d.	Developmental Node 4: Reproductive Development and Function .....	162
e.	Developmental Node V: Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging .....	163
f.	Progeny of Swine Clones.....	163
g.	Summary for Health of Swine Clones and Their Progeny .....	164
3.	Sheep.....	164
a.	Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition.....	165
i.	Pregnancy.....	165
ii.	Parturition .....	166
(a)	Dystocia .....	166
(b)	Other complications .....	166
b.	Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period.....	167
c.	Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Development .....	168
d.	Developmental Node 4: Reproductive Development and Function .....	168
e.	Developmental Node V: Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging .....	168
f.	Progeny of Sheep Clones .....	168
g.	Summary for Health of Sheep Clones .....	168
4.	Goats .....	169
a.	Developmental Node 1: Pregnancy and Parturition.....	169
i.	Pregnancy.....	169
ii.	Parturition .....	170
b.	Developmental Node 2: Perinatal Period.....	170
c.	Developmental Node 3: Juvenile Development .....	171
d.	Development Node IV: Reproductive Development and Function .....	172
e.	Developmental Node V: Post-Pubertal Maturation and Aging .....	172
f.	Progeny of Goat Clones.....	172
g.	Summary for Health of Goat Clones .....	173
D.	Conclusions.....	173

## **Chapter VI: Food Consumption Risks ..... 179**

A.	Potential Hazards and Food Consumption Risks Associated with Food Products from Animal Clones and their Progeny .....	179
1.	Assumptions.....	179
2.	Critical Biological Systems Approach to Animal Clones of Cattle, Swine, Sheep, and Goats.....	179
a.	Bovine Clones.....	180
i.	Cell Fusion, Nuclear Reprogramming, and Embryonic and Fetal Development in Bovine Clones .....	181
(a)	Peer-reviewed Publications.....	182
(b)	Summary for the Embryonic/Fetal Developmental Node in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 1).....	189
ii.	Perinatal Development in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 2) .....	189
(a)	Peer-reviewed Publications.....	189
(b)	Cyagra Dataset: Perinatal Cohort.....	201
(c)	Unpublished data .....	203

	<b>(d)</b> Summary for Perinatal Developmental Node in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 2).....	203
iii.	Juvenile Development in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 3)...	204
	<b>(a)</b> Peer-reviewed Publications.....	204
	<b>(b)</b> Cyagra Data: 1-6 Month Age Cohort.....	211
	<b>(c)</b> Unpublished data .....	214
	<b>(d)</b> Summary for Juvenile Developmental Node in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 3).....	214
iv.	Reproductive Development and Function in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 4).....	215
	<b>(a)</b> Peer-reviewed Publications.....	215
	<b>(b)</b> Unpublished data .....	224
	<b>(c)</b> Summary Statement for Reproductive Development and Function in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 4).....	224
v.	Post-Pubertal Maturation in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 5)...	225
	<b>(a)</b> Peer-reviewed Publications.....	225
	<b>(b)</b> Cyagra Dataset: 6-18 Month Cohort.....	227
	<b>(c)</b> Unpublished data .....	228
	<b>(d)</b> Summary Statement for Post-Pubertal Maturation in Bovine Clones (Developmental Node 5).....	228
b.	Swine Clones .....	229
i.	Cell Fusion, Nuclear Reprogramming, Embryonic and Fetal Development Through the Perinatal Developmental Period in Swine Clones (Developmental Nodes 1 and 2) .....	230
	<b>(a)</b> Peer-reviewed Publications.....	230
	<b>(b)</b> Summary Statement on the Embryo/Fetal to Perinatal Developmental in Swine Clones (Developmental Nodes 1 and 2) .....	234
ii.	Juvenile Development and Function in Swine Clones (Developmental Node 3).....	234
	<b>(a)</b> Peer-reviewed Publications.....	234
	<b>(b)</b> Viagen Dataset.....	237
	<b>(c)</b> Summary Statement for Juvenile Development and Function in Swine Clones (Developmental Node 3).....	239
iii.	Reproductive Development and Function in Swine Clones (Developmental Node 4).....	239
	<b>(a)</b> Peer-reviewed Publications.....	239
iv.	Post-Pubertal Maturation in Swine Clones (Developmental Node 5)	240
v.	Conclusions Regarding the Food Safety of Swine Clones .....	240
c.	Sheep Clones.....	241
i.	Peer-reviewed Publications.....	241
ii.	Conclusions Regarding the Food Safety of Sheep Clones .....	243
d.	Goat Clones.....	243
i.	Perinatal Development and Function in Goat Clones (Developmental Node 2).....	244
ii.	Juvenile Development in Goat Clones (Developmental Node 3).....	245

iii.	Reproductive Development and Function in Goat Clones (Developmental Node 4).....	246
iv.	Post-Pubertal Maturation in Goat Clones (Developmental Node 5) ..	247
v.	Summary Statement on Health Status of Goat Clones .....	247
vi.	Conclusions for Food Consumption Risks from Goat Clones.....	247
3.	Compositional Analysis Method.....	248
a.	Overview.....	248
b.	Nutritional Risk.....	249
i.	Milk.....	251
ii.	Meat .....	254
c.	Characterization of Milk from Cow Clones.....	258
i.	Peer-reviewed Reports .....	258
ii.	The Report of the Japanese Research Institute for Animal Science in Biochemistry and Toxicology.....	264
iii.	Additional Data .....	266
iv.	Summary Statement on Composition of Milk from Clones .....	270
d.	Characterization of Meat from Clones and Their Progeny.....	271
i.	Cattle.....	271
ii.	Swine.....	278
(a)	Clones .....	278
(b)	Swine Clone Progeny.....	282
iii.	Conclusions from Studies Evaluating the Composition of Meat and Milk from Clones and Their Progeny .....	285
B.	Drawing Conclusions Regarding Risks Associated with Consumption of Food Products from Animal Clones.....	286
1.	Approaches for Decreasing Uncertainties .....	286
2.	Bounding the Risk Space .....	287
3.	Developing Conclusions Regarding Food Consumption Risks.....	288
4.	Weight of Evidence Conclusions Regarding Food Consumption Risks for Clones and their Progeny .....	289
a.	Cattle Clones.....	289
i.	Risk Hypothesis Statement for Perinatal Bovine Clones.....	290
ii.	Risk Hypothesis Statement for Juvenile Bovine Clones.....	291
iii.	Risk Hypothesis Statement for “Adult” Bovine Clones .....	292
b.	Swine Clones .....	293
i.	Risk Hypothesis Statement for Swine Clones .....	294
c.	Sheep Clones.....	294
i.	Risk Hypothesis Statement for Sheep Clones.....	295
d.	Goat Clones.....	295
i.	Risk Hypothesis Statement for Goat Clones.....	295
e.	Clone Progeny.....	296
5.	Summary of Risk Hypotheses.....	296
a.	Additional Issues.....	297
i.	Potential Allergenicity .....	297
ii.	Microbiological Effects .....	298
iii.	Unanticipated Effects.....	299

iv. Technology Changes.....	300
5. How Much (Information) Is Enough?.....	300
<b>Chapter VII Summary and Conclusions .....</b>	<b>305</b>
<b>Glossary .....</b>	<b>311</b>
<b>References.....</b>	<b>327</b>
<b>Appendix A: Risk and Safety Assessment Primer for Animal Cloning A3</b>	
A. How has Risk Assessment Evolved? .....	A3
B. Thinking About Risk.....	A4
C. How Do We Think About Safety?.....	A6
<b>Appendix B :Overall Reproductive Efficiency and Health Statistics for US Animal Agriculture.....</b>	<b>B3</b>
A. Dairy cattle.....	B3
B. Beef Cattle .....	B6
C. Swine.....	B8
D. Sheep.....	B9
E. Goats .....	B11
<b>Appendix C: Comparisons of Outcomes Among Assisted Reproductive Technologies (ARTs).....</b>	<b>C3</b>
A. Successes and Failures of AI, IVP, and ET .....	C8
B. Outcomes for BNT, Fetal- and Adult-Cell SCNT .....	C12
C. Conclusions regarding outcomes for ARTs.....	C13
<b>Appendix D Transgenic Clones .....</b>	<b>D3</b>
A. Issues.....	D3
B. Cattle.....	D4
C. Swine.....	D6
D. Sheep.....	D8
E. Goats .....	D9
F. Conclusions Regarding Transgenic Clones .....	D11
<b>Appendix E: The Cyagra Dataset .....</b>	<b>E3</b>
A. Response to CVM Data Requests.....	E3
B. Cyagra Dataset.....	E4
1. Description of Clones .....	E6

2.	Evaluations Performed.....	E8
3.	CVM’s Analysis of Cyagra Data: Method.....	E9
4.	CVM’s Analysis of Cyagra Data: Results .....	E11
a.	Comprehensive Veterinary Examinations .....	E11
b.	Conclusions from Veterinary Examinations.....	E13
c.	Laboratory Values: Selection of Most Appropriate Comparator.....	E13
d.	Conclusions Regarding Clone and Comparator Population Cohorts in Aggregate.....	E15
e.	Animal and Analyte Specific Analyses .....	E16
i.	Growth-Related Phenomena .....	E18
f.	Animals with Measurements at Different Developmental Nodes .....	E20
i.	Age Range within 24 hours of birth (Charts E101 and E111).....	E21
(a)	Analyte Evaluation.....	E22
(b)	Animal Evaluation .....	E24
(c)	Conclusions for Perinatal Period: Animal Safety .....	E25
(d)	Food Safety .....	E25
ii.	Age Range 1 to 6 months (Charts E201 and E211).....	E26
(a)	Analyte Review.....	E26
(b)	Animal Evaluation (1 to 6 months Age Group).....	E27
(c)	Conclusion for 1 to 6 month old group: Animal Safety.....	E29
(d)	Conclusion for 1 to 6 month old group: Food Safety .....	E29
iii.	Age Range: 6-18 Months (Charts E301 and E311) .....	E30
(a)	Analyte Analysis.....	E30
(b)	Animal Analysis.....	E32
(c)	Conclusions for 6-18 Month Group: Animal Safety.....	E33
(d)	Conclusions for 6-18 Month Group: Food Safety .....	E33
5.	Charts and Tables.....	E34

**Appendix F: The Viagen Dataset ..... F3**

A.	Background.....	F3
B.	Experimental Design.....	F3
1.	Study 1: Clones vs. Comparators.....	F5
a.	Animal Health, Hematology, Clinical Chemistry, and Urinalysis.....	F6
b.	Boar Semen Evaluation.....	F6
c.	Farrowing Rate.....	F6
2.	Study 2: Progeny of Clone Boars vs. Progeny of Conventional Boars .....	F7
a.	Statistical Analysis.....	F7
i.	Methodology .....	F7
ii.	Utility of Statistical Analysis as a Tool for Assessment of Outcomes .....	F9
b.	Specific Methods for the Analysis of Animal Health, Hematology, Clinical Chemistry, and Urinalysis Data .....	F10
c.	Meat Composition, Carcass Characteristics, and Meat Quality Assessments for Clones, Comparators, and Progeny .....	F10
C.	Results.....	F11
1.	Study 1 .....	F11
a.	Survival.....	F11



b.	Animal Health, Growth, Blood Clinical Chemistry, Hematology, and Urinalysis .....	F12
c.	Carcass Characteristics .....	F20
d.	Meat Composition Analysis for Clones and Comparators .....	F21
e.	Semen and Breeding Evaluation .....	F23
f.	Farrowing Rate.....	F24
2.	Study 2: Progeny of Clones vs. Comparators .....	F25
a.	Survival.....	F25
b.	Growth, Hematology, Clinical Chemistry, and Urinalysis .....	F31
i.	Growth .....	F31
ii.	Hematology, Clinical Chemistry, and Urinalysis .....	F34
c.	Carcass Characteristics .....	F39
d.	Meat Composition from the Progeny of Clones and Comparators.....	F40
D.	Conclusions from the Viagen Dataset.....	F45
1.	Study 1: Clones vs. Comparators.....	F45
a.	Animal Health.....	F45
b.	Food Safety .....	F46
2.	Progeny of Clone Boars vs. Progeny of Comparator Boars .....	F47
a.	Animal Health.....	F47
b.	Food Safety .....	F47
E.	Addendum.....	F48

## **Appendix G: Investigation on Attributes of Cloned Bovine Products:**

### **A Study Performed by the Ministry of Health of Japan..... G3**

A.	Project Report of an Investigation of the Properties of Products from Cloned Cattle.....	G7
B.	English language summary of the report “Investigation on the Attributes of Cloned Bovine Products” .....	G11
C.	Results of a 28-day feeding study in rats fed diets containing freeze dried milk or beef from ordinary cattle and clone cattle.....	G21

### **Appendix H: The Comprehensive Veterinary Examination ..... H3**

A.	Introduction to the Comprehensive Veterinary Examination .....	H3
B.	The Importance of Species-Specific Standards .....	H4
C.	How a Veterinarian Performs a Comprehensive Veterinary Examination.....	H4
1.	Specific Considerations for Neonatal CVEs.....	H6
2.	Specific Considerations for Juvenile CVEs.....	H7
3.	Specific Considerations for Mature Animal CVEs.....	H7
4.	Specific Consideration for Reproductive Stage Examinations.....	H7
a.	Males.....	H7
b.	Females .....	H8
D.	Interpreting the Comprehensive Veterinary Examination for Animal Clones ....	H9
E.	Parameters Evaluated in the Comprehensive Veterinary Exam for a Risk Assessment.....	H9