TRACY S. THORLEIFSON MAXINE R. STANSELL Federal Trade Commission 2 915 Second Avenue, Suite 2896 Scattle, Washington 98174 (206) 220-4481 (Thorleifson) (206) 220-4474 (Stansell) (206) 220-6366 (fax) 3 Mar - 6 2003 4 5 CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFCANIA THOMAS J. SYTA CA Bar No. 116286 CLERK, U. S. DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DIVISION AT SANTA ANA 6 Federal Trade Commission DEPUTY 10877 Wilshire Boulevard Los Angeles, CA 90024 (310) 824-4324 FEB 21 2003 8 (310) 824 4380 (fax) Priorith ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFF UNITED STATES DESTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 10 Send Clsd 11 Enter WESTERN DIVISION 12 JS-5/JS-6 JS-2/JS-3 13 5A CV 98-968 DOC FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, 14 No. CV-99-2895 CBM (RZx) Plaintiff, 15 STIPULATED ORDER FOR PERMANENT INJUNCTION AS ν. 16 TO MITCHELL D. GOLD MITCHELL D. GOLD, et al., 17 Defendants. 18 19 20 Plaintiff, the Federal Trade Commission ("FTC" or "Commission"), has filed a 21 complaint for a permanent injunction and other relief, pursuant to Section 13(b) of the 22 Federal Trade Commission Act ("FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 53(b), charging defendants 23 Mitchell David Gold, Patricia Ann Cooley Gold, Herbert Gold, Celia Gold, Jonathan 24 Philip Cohen, Steven John Chinarian, U.S. Marketing, Inc., and North American 25 Charitable Services, Inc., with violations of Section 5 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45, 26 in connection with solicitations of charitable donations by telephone and by mail. The 27 Commission and defendant Mitchell D. Gold (hereinafter "defendant" or "defendant 28 ENTER ON PEDGRAL TRADS COMMISSION 915 Second Ave., Su. 2856

Stattle, Westington 95174 (205) 226-6150

STIPULATED FINAL ORDER AS TO MITCHELL D.

ŧ

Mitchell Gold"), by and through counsel, for the purpose of full and final settlement of the matters alleged in the complaint filed in this case, have consented to entry of this Stipulated Order for Permanent Injunction as to Mitchell D. Gold ("Order") without a trial or adjudication of any issue of law or fact therein.

NOW, THEREFORE, the Commission and defendant Mitchell Gold, having requested the Court to enter this Order, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED as follows:

FINDINGS

- 1. This is an action by the Commission under Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b). Pursuant to this Section, the Commission has the authority to seek the relief contained herein.
- 2. The Commission's complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against defendant Mitchell Gold under Sections 5(a) and 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a) and 53(b).
- 3. This Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter of this case and all the parties hereto. Venue in the Central District of California is proper.
- 4. The alleged activities of defendant Mitchell Gold are in or affecting commerce, as defined in Section 4 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 44.
- 5. The parties shall each bear their own costs and attorney's fees incurred in this action and have waived all claims under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412.
- Defendant has waived all rights to seek appellate review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.
- 7. This Order does not constitute, and shall not be interpreted to constitute, either an admission by defendant or a finding by the Court that defendant has engaged in any violations of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a).
 - 8. Entry of this Order is in the public interest.

DEFINITIONS

- 1. For purposes of this Order the following definitions shall apply:
- 2. "Donation" or "contribution" means money or any item of value provided in response to a solicitation made on behalf, or in the name, of any nonprofit organization, including any payment for advertising or any listing in any magazine, journal or other publication produced by, or on behalf of, or in the name of, any nonprofit organization.
- "Donor" or "consumer" means any person or business solicited for a donation or contribution.
- 4. "Nonprofit organization" means any person that is, or is represented to be, a nonprofit entity or that has, or is represented to have, a charitable purpose, specifically including any entity that purports to benefit, either in whole or in part, purported law enforcement, firefighting, or veterans' organizations, personnel, or programs, or individuals who suffer from an illness or injury or handicap.
- 5. "Material fact" means a fact likely to affect a person's decision as to the amount of, or whether to make, a donation, contribution, or purchase.
- 6. "Person" means a natural person, organization or other legal entity, including a corporation, partnership, proprietorship, association, cooperative, government agency, or any other group or combination acting as an entity.
 - 7. "Solicitor" means any person who solicits donations or contributions.
- 8. "Telemarketing" means any plan, program, or campaign that involves attempts to induce consumers to purchase any item, good, service, partnership, interest, trust interest, other beneficial interest, or chance to win a prize, by means of telephone sales presentations, provided that the term "telemarketing" does not include: transactions that are not completed until after a face-to-face contact between the seller or solicitor and the consumers solicited; transactions initiated by a customer's telephone call, when the call is not the result of any solicitation by a seller or telemarketer, and transactions initiated by telephone calls made to any person with

1 w 2 c 3 li 4 p 5 s 6 e

whom the caller has a prior or established business or personal relationship that was not created by means of "telemarketing" as defined herein. The term includes but is not limited to, participating in such a plan, program, or campaign, managing others who participate in such a plan, program, or campaign, operating an enterprise conducting such a plan, program, or campaign, or otherwise participating as an officer, director, employee or independent contractor in an enterprise that conducts such a plan, program, or campaign.

<u>ORDER</u>

I. PROHIBITION ON FUNDRAISING

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that defendant Mitchell Gold is hereby restrained and enjoined from engaging, participating, or assisting in any manner or in any capacity whatsoever in the solicitation of contributions from any donor, whether directly, indirectly, in concert with others, or through any intermediary, business entity, person or device. Under this prohibition, defendant shall not be employed by, hold any ownership interest in, direct, control, manage, advise or provide consulting services to, any sole proprietorship, corporation, partnership, person or other entity that solicits contributions or is involved in the business of fundraising, including, but not limited to, a non-profit organization; nor shall defendant receive benefits or payments the amount of which is based on the amount of contributions solicited by another entity; provided, however, that this provision shall not prohibit defendant from providing to a non-profit organization volunteer services for which he receives no compensation of any kind.

II. PROHIBITION ON TELEMARKETING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendant Mitchell Gold is hereby restrained and enjoined from engaging, participating, or assisting in any manner or in any capacity whatsoever in telemarketing, whether directly, indirectly, in concert with others, or through any intermediary, business entity, or device.

1 [

3

5 6 7

9

10 11

12 13

14

15 16

17 18

19 20

21

22 23

24 J

26

27 | 28 | IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendant Gold and those persons in active concert or participation with him who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service, facsimile or otherwise, whether acting directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, are hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from making, or assisting in making, material misrepresentations in connection with the sale of consumer goods or services.

IV. JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that:

- Judgment for consumer redress in the amount of \$10,000,000.00 is hereby entered in favor of the Commission against defendant Mitchell Gold for equitable monetary relief including, but not limited to, consumer redress and payment of any attendant expenses of administering any redress fund. In any proceedings to enforce defendant's payment obligation, the total amount of any garnishment shall not exceed twenty-five percent (25%) of defendant's disposable earnings for the applicable time period. The terms "earnings," "disposable earnings," and "garnishment," shall have the same meanings as defined in 15 U.S.C. § 1672. In the event that direct redress to donors is wholly or partially impracticable, or funds remain after redress is completed, the Commission may apply any remaining funds for such other equitable relief (including consumer information remedies) as it determines to be reasonably related to defendant's practices as alleged in the complaint. Any funds not used for such equitable relief shall be deposited into the United States Treasury as disgorgement. Defendants shall have no right to challenge the Commission's choice of remedies under this Section. No portion of the payments as herein provided shall be deemed a payment of any fine, penalty, or punitive assessment.
- B. Defendant Mitchell Gold shall stipulate to entry of an order of nondischargeability, under 11 U.S.C. 523(a)(2), of the FTC's claim for \$10,000,000.00

~

 based on this stipulated judgment. This stipulation shall be filed to settle the pending adversary proceeding in <u>FTC v. Gold</u>, Adv. Proceeding No. SA 99-01590 (C.D. Cal. Bkrtcy).

V. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF RECEIPT OF ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, within five (5) business days after receipt of this Order as entered by the Court, defendant Mitchell Gold shall submit to the Commission a truthful sworn statement, in the form shown on Appendix A, that shall acknowledge receipt of this Order.

VI. COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Order may be evaluated:

- A. For a period of ten (10) years from the date of entry of this Order, defendant shall notify the Commission in writing of the following:
- Any changes in his residence, mailing address, and telephone number, within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- 2. Any changes in his employment status (including self-employment), within ten (10) days of such change. Such notices shall include the name and address of each business with which defendant is affiliated or employed, a statement of the nature of the business, and a statement of the defendant's duties and responsibilities in connection with the business or employment;
- 3. Any proposed change in the structure of any business entity that is engaged in the advertising, marketing, sale or offering for sale of any consumer good or service, that is owned or controlled by defendant such as creation, incorporation, dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, creation or dissolution of subsidiaries, proposed filing of a bankruptcy petition, or change in the corporate name or address, or any other changes that may affect coropliance obligations arising out of this Order, thirty (30)

. 7

7

6

16

14

17 18

19 20

22

23

24

21

25 26 27 days prior to the effective date of any proposed change; provided, however, that with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which the defendant learns fewer than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, the defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as practicable after learning of such proposed change;

- B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Order, the defendant shall provide a written report to the Commission, sworn to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in which the defendant has complied and is complying with this Order. This report shall include but not be limited to:
 - Defendant's then-current residence address and telephone number;
- Defendant's then-current employment, business address and telephone numbers, a description of the business activities of each such employer, and the defendant's title and responsibilities for each employer or business;
- C. For the purposes of this Paragraph, "employment" includes the performance of services as an employee, consultant, or independent contractor; and "employers" includes any individual or entity for whom defendant performs services as an employee, consultant, or independent contractor; and
- D. The reporting provisions of this paragraph shall be suspended during any period of time that defendant Mitchell Gold is incarcerated, provided that within thirty (30) days of his release defendant shall provide the requisite reports.

VII. COMPLIANCE MONITORING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating defendant Mitchell Gold's compliance with any provision of this Order:

A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, defendant Mitchell Gold shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in defendant Mitchell Gold's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect the business

operation where such business is engaged in the advertising, marketing, sale or offering for sale of any consumer good or service;

- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor defendant Mitchell Gold's compliance with this Order by all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:
- obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court,
 in the manner otherwise provided by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure;
- 2. posing as consumers and suppliers to defendant Mitchell Gold, defendant's employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by defendant Mitchell Gold, without the necessity of identification or prior notice;
- 3. obtaining any documentary material, tangible things, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C. § 45(a)(1)) pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1.
- C. Defendant Mitchell Gold shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Order. The person interviewed may have counsel present.
- D. For purposes only of the compliance reporting required by this Paragraph, the Commission is authorized to communicate directly with defendant Mitchell Gold.

VIII. MAINTENANCE OF RECORDS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that defendant, for a period of twelve (12) years from the date of entry of this Order, in connection with any business entity that defendant directly or indirectly owns or controls that is engaged in the advertising, marketing, sale or offering for sale of any consumer good or service, is hereby permanently restrained and enjoined from failing to create, and from failing to retain for

ӆ

4

X. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for the purpose of enabling either of the parties to this Order to apply to the Court at any time for such further orders or directives as may be necessary or appropriate for the interpretation or modification of this Order, for the enforcement of compliance therewith or for the punishment of violations thereof.

XI. ENTRY OF THIS JUDGMENT

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, as there is no just reason for delay, the Clerk of the Court is hereby directed to enter this Order.

SO ORDERED, this _	6 day of March	, 200 3 .
	plant O. Carter	
	Honorable Construct Judge United States District Judge	

27

28

The parties hereby consent to the terms and conditions set forth above and 2 consent to entry of this Order without further notice to the parties. Defendant stipulates ithout. o abide by its

3	and acknowledges that he has consented to entry of this Order freely and w		
4	coercion, that he understands the provisions of the Order, and is prepared to		
5	terms.		
6			
7	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION	DEFENDANT	
8		,	
9 10	Tracy of Thorlands	Michell D. Gold	
	Tracy S. Dhorleitson	Mitchell D. Gold	
l 1 12	mark trall	Frankle -	
13	Maxine R. Stansell	S. Daniel Harbottle Attorney for Mitchell D. Go	
14	1/20/	AS TO	
15	Charles A. Harwood		
16	Regional Director 915 Second Avenue		
17	Seattle, WA 98174		
18	Attorneys for Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission		
19			
20	i		
21			
22]		
23			
24			

1 1	APPENDIX A				
2 3	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA WESTERN DIVISION				
4	•				
5	FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION,				
6	Plaintiff,	No. CV-99-2895-CBM (RZx)			
7	v.				
8	MITCHELL D. GOLD, et al.,	AFFIDAVIT OF DEFENDANT			
9	Defendants.				
10	A track to the second of the s				
11	l. My name is	, My current residence address is			
12	1 am a citizen of the United States				
13	and am over the age of eighteen. I have personal knowledge of the facts set forth in this Affidavit.				
14	2. I am a defendant in <u>FTC v. Mitchell, D. Gold, et al.</u> (United States District Court for the				
15	Central District of California).				
16	3. On [date], I received a copy of the Order for Permanent Injunction, which				
17	was signed by the Honorable Consuelo B. Marshall and entered by the Court on				
18	[date of entry of Order]. A true and correct copy of the Order I received is				
19	appended to this Affidavit.				
20	I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States that the foregoing is true				
21	and correct. Executed on [date]	, at [city and state].			
22	<u> </u>				
23	[Signature/Full name of defendant]				
24	Subscribed and sworn to before me this _	day of, 2002.			
25					
26	Notary Public				
27	My Commission Expires:				
28					

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I caused the foregoing document to be served on all defendants by providing a true and correct copy thereof on the date set forth below by first-class mail, deposited with the United States Postal Service at Seattle, to:

- S. Daniel Harbottle, Rutan and Tucker, LLP (counsel for North American Charitable Services, U.S. Marketing, Mitchell Gold, Herbert Gold, and Celia Gold), 714-546-9035, 611 Anton Blvd., Suite 1400, Costa Mesa, CA 92626; Washington:
- Frank Battaile, Battaile & Hargrave, LLP (counsel for Jonathan P.
 Cohen), 949-719-1326, 110 Newport Center Dr., Suite 200, Newport Beach, CA
 92660;
- Robert C. Moest (counsel for North American Charitable Services,
 U.S. Marketing, Mitchell Gold, Herbert Gold, and Celia Gold), 310-915-9897, 2530
 Wilshire Blvd., 2d Floor, Santa Monica, CA 90403; and
- Ben Pesta (counsel for Steven Chinarian), 310-203-2150, 1801 Avenue
 of the Stars, Ste. 900, Los Angeles, CA 90067.

Diracy Thoulants

Date: February 26, 2003