UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE

FOOD SAFETY AND INSPECTION SERVICE

+ + + + +

NATIONAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON MEAT AND POULTRY INSPECTION

+ + + + +

SUBCOMMITTEE NUMBER 2
STRATEGIC IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR ENHANCING OUTREACH
TO SMALL AND VERY SMALL PLANTS

+ + + + +

May 23, 2006 2:30 p.m.

USDA South Building
Conference Room 0161
1400 Independence Avenue, S.W.
Washington, D.C.

FACILITATOR: DR. JOSEPH J. HARRIS

Southwest Meat Association

PARTICIPANTS:

DR. DAVID CARPENTER

MR. DARIN DETWILER

MR. MIKE FINNEGAN

DR. ANDREA GRONDAHL

MR. MARK SCHAD

ALSO PARTICIPATING:

DR. BARB MASTERS

MR. TONY CORBO

DR. KARLEASE KELLY

MR. BOBBY PALESANO

MS. ANN RAZOR

MS. MELINDA SUB

I-N-D-E-X

AGENDA ITEM	PAGE
Opening by Dr. Joseph J. Harris	4
Discussions on:	
Question: What suggestions do you have for how FSIS, through the International HACCP Alliance, could locate industry representatives who are willing to share expertise and other technical resources and assistance with very small plants?	6
Question: What suggestions do you have for how FSIS could obtain data on the types of support the small and very small plants need for their food safety systems?	37
Question: What suggestions do you have for how FSIS could best work with a users group (consisting of all partners) to provide feedback on the usefulness of existing tools and services, to pilot new activities or materials, and to make recommendations on how to improve the outreach function to better meet the needs?	61
Question: What other suggestions do you have for FSIS for strengthening our strategy for outreach to small and very small plants?	102

Adjourn

1 P-R-O-C-E-E-D-I-N-G-S 2 (2:57 p.m.)DR. HARRIS: -- deliberations, why don't we 3 4 go ahead and get the others in the room to introduce 5 themselves so that everybody will kind of know who's who. I think I know about everybody almost anyway. 6 7 So those of you around the outside, if you guys want 8 to introduce yourselves. I mean we met Bobby and Karlease earlier. You better tell this gentleman who 9 10 you are. 11 MR. PALESANO: I am Bobby Palesano. 12 CORBO: Tony Corbo from the consumer MR. 13 group, Food and Water Watch. 14 MS. RAZOR: Ann Razor (ph.), North American 15 Meat Processors Association. 16 MS. SUB: Melinda Sub (ph.) with the National Turkey Federation. 17 18 DR. KELLY: Karlease Kelly with FSIS. 19 DR. HARRIS: Well, let's get started then. 20 Back to my appropriate page here. Did everybody get -- I think we got very clear instructions on what 21

> Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

it is we're supposed to be doing, and we -- I guess

22

1 let's start with -- is everybody clear on what our 2 I know a lot of times we run into questions are? that, okay, what the questions mean, but I think these 3 4 questions were fairly well written. So I don't see 5 any issues there. 6 Shall we take up question 1? 7 DR. CARPENTER: Wait a minute. Joe, on the 8 third question --9 DR. HARRIS: Okay.

DR. CARPENTER: -- just -- I need to have clarification. Is that a complete question? We're to provide feedback to pilot new activities and to make recommendations. Are those and, and, and, and so every user has got to be capable of doing that?

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. KELLY: I would say ideally but if for some reason you're -- you feel like there needs to be a difference, I would just note it. Like this group would only really be able to do this or they would only be able to do that. Just specify it.

DR. CARPENTER: If it came to mind, would you discard any individual who could not -- all three but I'm sure information on two issues would come

to -- that's all the clarification I need right now 1 2 for the questions. So the first question again, 3 MR. HARRIS: 4 what suggestions for FSIS through the International 5 HACCP Alliance or what I heard earlier or potentially 6 other entities, how would we suggest that they locate 7 industry representatives willing to share expertise 8 and other technical resources and assistance with 9 small and very small plants? Feedback anybody? 10 MR. FINNEGAN: Well, I'll tell you what we've done to teach HACCP and train it, is we had to 11 12 partner up with Extension and we're lucky to have a 13 meat scientist at MSU. So between those three, we 14 were very lucky to help our very small plants. Let's 15 see the question again. 16 MR. SCHAD: So you're talking about academia 17 then, right, Mike? MR. FINNEGAN: 18 Yeah. Exactly. We didn't go 19 through the International HACCP Alliance although we used their training to begin with for HACCP and formed 20 a coop with -- and also the Department of Health, too. 21 22 Montana Department of Health, MSU Extension was very

helpful. She helped us get grants, stuff like that, and MSU meat scientist. That worked extremely well for us.

DR. GRONDAHL: And North Dakota, one thing, you know, they're asking industry representatives is the trade group in North Dakota is small but they're pretty resourceful as far as knowing what plants are taking the lead, who in industry is seeking the lead with such things and has information that can share that with other plants that might not be in a position to do that.

DR. HARRIS: That's the way I sort of read the question, too. It's almost more of a, for lack of a better word, a mentoring type program, actually have industry people that would willing to share what they know and what they've learned with others in the industry.

MR. SCHAD: That was my first thought when I read that question, and my second thought was trade associations. When I reread the question, I had a second thought. But I would agree with what you said, Joe. It seems like some plant owners have a better

grasp and are able to deal with this a lot better than others, and that's just making an observation.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. HARRIS: Uh-huh. What I'll probably do is sort of take notes until we begin to zero in on an answer that we want to put on paper, but -- am I detecting that we're leaning Ι guess from the discussion, from some of the things that Mark was saying, how would we go about, you know, getting industry representatives identified? Would it make sense to form process category -- similar to the way we did the HACCP plan, is process categories. a small guy that's doing fully cooked, not stable products, like hams or other products like that, who would be a good mentor type individual that would be willing to share information or share ideas Would it make sense to go at it in that with me? direction? That's a question.

MR. SCHAD: I think it does make some sense because like if some guy was to ask me about hams or ready-to-eat product, I'd be glad to help him out but if he came to me about slaughtering in the HACCP plan, I'd say you'd better go someplace else because I'll

probably steer you the wrong way.

MS. CUTSHALL: If I can just jump in here. When we did the mentoring in the initial implementation and matched folks up, large with the small, small with the very small, that's the way we did it, by process, by product, and it seemed to work pretty well.

DR. HARRIS: I do think that we could work with either the Alliance and/or trade associations to identify some plants that, for lack of a better term, sort of get it when it comes to food safety programs and HACCP implementation, that are willing to share that expertise and sort of identify a list of people that are willing to do that sort of thing. I mean I know as a trade association person, I can think of, you know, several members that could fulfill that role very well.

MR. FINNEGAN: That would be willing to spend the time?

MR. DETWILER: I guess, you know, what comes to my mind and, you know, I have nothing to do with experiencing your businesses, two questions that just

jump to the forefront for me. What's in it for me if I was to be the expert? And, why would I want to help out my competitor?

MR. SCHAD: I can't explain it, Darin, but just as a -- being involved in a trade association with small and very small plants, most of us are willing to help out the other guy and just knowing that it'll all come around in the end, that that guy, when the need arises, he'll help me, and I can't -- I'm not, I'm not disagreeing with your logic because I can understand why you would ask that question.

DR. HARRIS: Two points. Some years ago, we sort of informally as an industry, me and I really took the lead on this but sort of made a pact that we would not use food safety ever as a competitive issue, number one, and number two, from personal experience, I can tell you that when Mark's competitor endures a food safety crisis, it doesn't help Mark. I can tell you that, you know, when Jack-in-the-Box had their issues, McDonald's execs didn't sleep better at night because of it. And so we've always sort of looked at it that way, that food safety is not competitive.

There's a lot of ways we can compete but that doesn't need to be one of them. And so there I think most everyone in the industry has embraced that.

DR. GRONDAHL: I have another thought kind of going back, Mike, to what you were saying about academia. You know, and this might be different in North Dakota where we are smaller, but academia acts as kind of a bouncing board for plants coming to them, getting information, them giving information back, and they might be able to help identify those lead people in the industry that are willing to step up and play this role but, you know, getting back to the question, locating industry representatives, they might be someone to go to in that I think.

DR. HARRIS: Uh-huh.

MR. FINNEGAN: And in our particular case, all we really had was academia when we stepped up to the plate big time.

DR. HARRIS: I think that's generally true everywhere, that academia really has come through Extension programs and, and other programs. There's a whole variety of ways.

1	MR. FINNEGAN: Right. And the hardest part
2	is getting them to buy into the hassle concept. We
3	had a hard time there but once they got into it, we
4	had no problem.
5	DR. CARPENTER: But could academia be
6	effective if they weren't really involved in the
7	industry? I mean on a day-to-day basis.
8	MR. FINNEGAN: In our case, we have Dr. Jane
9	Bowles and she's a meat scientist and industry is
10	constantly calling her up, constantly calling her for
11	supporting documentation, things like that.
12	DR. GRONDAHL: And they actually have
13	doesn't Montana have a meat lab or a
14	MR. FINNEGAN: Right.
15	DR. GRONDAHL: meat processing facility.
16	MR. FINNEGAN: Right, and they do water
17	activity, pH reading, nutritional labeling, and so
18	it's really a close tie.
19	DR. CARPENTER: I guess it's incumbent upon
20	this Committee to identify those individuals who
21	appear to be a repository for this kind of
22	information.

DR. HARRIS: Well, I think the Agency has helped us out a little bit in terms of when they suggest the Alliance which has 35, 36 universities and about 20 trade associations. So that might be the conduit to filter back down to all those entities. Ι think most of the -- and it's mostly land grant universities for the most part. I mean think most of those do have a -- do belong to the Alliance and have direct communications with the Alliance, and obviously that never picks up everybody. You can never identify one place where you're going to pick up everybody, but I think it's a whole bunch of them right there of both the associations and the universities. I think it's maybe pushing up to maybe 40 universities involved.

MR. SCHAD: Joe, I'd like to try to add just a little bit of -- the way I read the question.

DR. HARRIS: Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. PALESANO: And I think if you read it, what we're really looking for as you pointed out, we're utilizing the International HACCP Alliance which means that we as an Agency are soliciting industry representatives particularly representatives that have

gone through the process of obtaining the supporting documentation necessary to support any of the decisions they make in their HACCP plan or hazard analysis. What we feel like that is, is a partnership that we might be able to utilize to assist small or very small plants. We don't know how we can best find out who those persons or companies or corporations are that are willing to share that knowledge and that information with the Agency.

DR. HARRIS: Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. PALESANO: Obviously in my opinion, how you capture that by processing categories would be another way of categorizing how we do that, but I believe what we're looking for her, and I'm only doing that to try to help clarify it, what I read into that question.

DR. HARRIS: Good. Okay. I think that's helpful. That kind of leads me in a little bit different direction.

I'm Chairman. I don't have to do all the talking. The role of the Chairman is just to get everybody else's thoughts, not, not -- by the way, to

make it clear, I would welcome input from, from those of you. It's not like we've got 200 people in here that would make it unbearable or unmanageable. So those of you on the sides, feel free. I think your Committee -- Subcommittee would welcome your input as well.

DR. CARPENTER: We do.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. HARRIS: Don't everybody jump in at once.

Would it make sense then for us to -- I'm going to throw this out more as just a suggestion to bounce ideas off of, then to suggest that the Agency work through the Alliance and ask the Alliance to work through its member associations and universities to list help begin develop this of to resource individuals -resource companies, resource individuals and frankly I suspect that some of those individuals will be university people. We know -- I refer universities frequently mу members to technical issues. We know that there are others within the industry that are willing to help smaller plants out. We know that there's a lot of places that

1	have good resources, and I think that that might make
2	sense then for us to make that recommendation back to
3	the Agency.
4	MR. SCHAD: Joe, are you talking solely
5	through the HACCP Alliance then or
6	DR. HARRIS: Have the Alliance coordinate
7	the effort.
8	MR. FINNEGAN: You're talking just a list of
9	their contacts, the International HACCP Alliance, to
10	furnish to the industry. Am I following you right
11	here?
12	DR. HARRIS: Well, I was thinking more in
13	terms of the Alliance wouldn't actually provide it to
14	the industry. What the Alliance would do would be
15	develop a list of resources
16	MR. FINNEGAN: Okay.
17	DR. HARRIS: whether they be industry,
18	academia, or association resources
19	MR. FINNEGAN: Right.
20	DR. HARRIS: and compile this, provide it
21	to the Agency so that this one stop shopping if a
22	small company calls

1	MR. FINNEGAN: Okay.
2	DR. HARRIS: they could access that list
3	through the Agency. Am I going the wrong direction?
4	MR. PALESANO: I think you're going in the
5	right direction.
6	DR. HARRIS: Okay.
7	MR. FINNEGAN: All right. I mean I can see
8	that.
9	DR. HARRIS: They would not be the one
10	disseminating the list, but they would be kind of the
11	coordinator to assembling the list.
12	MR. FINNEGAN: Uh-huh.
13	MS. RAZOR: Joe, I have one thought and I
14	hate to put a damper on anything but and I totally
15	agree with what you say and what you say about our
16	members and they're more than willing to help each
17	other out and I mean that's one of the things our
18	association prides itself on, you know, putting people
19	in contact with each other, but I do see a little bit
20	more of a problem, as you say, we're going to take
21	your name and publish it on a list so that anybody can

Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

contact you if they have a question about HACCP

22

program issue.

DR. HARRIS:

MS. RAZOR:

MS. RAZOR: That just seems more remote than maybe they would be willing to, you know, I mean we have -- if somebody calls me and I'm thinking of the need of trying to get people to submit their names to a list to publish through FSIS.

Okay.

DR. HARRIS: Okay.

MR. DETWILER: And if it is an employee of Joe's business, why would Joe want his employee to be off the clock or be on the clock and helping out all these other people. I mean who's going to do that person's job after a while.

MS. RAZOR: I'm not saying it's not worth a try but thinking about the actual logistics of getting people to commit and helping the whole United States if they so decide to call.

DR. GRONDAHL: I guess the way I understand it, and maybe Bobby or Karlease you can help me understand it better, but the website wouldn't just list the plants that are willing to share information. FSIS would act as a conduit, get that information from

these plants that are willing to share it and then be able to distribute it to others that don't have it.

MR. PALESANO: Obviously there are several

food safety system.

issues here I think and maybe that's what you're struggling with but, you know, first of all there are -- we believe there are larger establishments particularly that have information out there and may be willing to share information with very small plants that would assist them in developing a more robust

That's one issue.

We have to identify those representatives that are willing to do that. I don't anticipate that I'm going to put Mike's or Mark's name either one on our web page as a contact individual but we might reference some information or we may reference the International HACCP Alliance or whatever process you all come up with.

Obviously as Ann points out, there are a lot of things that have to be considered when you start putting names or people's information up publicly.

MR. FINNEGAN: I know in our case, or Kevin, he's already a contact person, and so are we for

1	Montana. Our name was up there already as the contact
2	person for HACCP, HACCP problems, supporting
3	documentation, not that we know the answers but we
4	know who to call. We'll tell them to call Jane, Dr.
5	Jane.
6	MR. SCHAD: Yeah, and maybe I wasn't
7	expressing myself clearly. I didn't envisioned
8	somebody's name on FSIS' website. I guess I was
9	envisioning something more what Mike said.
10	MS. RAZOR: Yeah, it makes sense what
11	Karlease said.
12	MR. SCHAD: I've had questions come to me
13	like, hey, Mark, on that point in your process, and I
14	have a similar process, what did you use for
15	supporting documentation? And it just kind of
16	funneled down through what Mike said. It was an
17	example like that. It wasn't like somebody called me
18	up and said Mark, write my HACCP plan for me. It
19	wasn't like that.
20	MS. RAZOR: Right, right.
21	DR. HARRIS: I'm trying to think of a way to
22	put try to capture a little bit of what we've

discussed here. I'm not ignoring everybody. I'm just sort of trying to find a way to capture it a little bit. And, you know, if somebody is jotting down something and has some sort of phraseology that they want to use.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. DETWILER: So that's the kind of question though, what kind of documentation you use to --

MR. PALESANO: What the question says to me is that we're looking for industry representatives that have expertise that they're willing to share or could be technical resources or assistance. Now if Joe was identified as one of those individuals, then if I'm a very small plant operator, I could call Joe if I was made available to him and say, Joe, what kind of technical resources did you utilize to support your critical limit at this particular CCP, or can you assist me in going through the decision making process this particular process in the hazard at step analysis.

MR. DETWILER: Well, how about this though.

Instead of waiting for that question to come up

because now, you know, here's your point man and now
the same question has been asked of him 17 times, what
if instead of locating a resource and I'm not saying
you can have a live resource, but if, you know, he did
a great job of documenting this or going through this
process, let's have him write this down, you know,
let's put this in a central place where, you know,
you're frequently asked questions now according to one
area's very small plant expert in your region, in your
expertise area of, of, you know, whatever kind of meat
or whatever. This is how he did it or this is how
they went about doing it necessarily. I don't know if
that's giving away too much, but I would fear that at
some point he's going to say, you know what, how many
times do I get called and I get asked that same exact
question, time after time after time. Couldn't I just
put it down once and it's, it's there for future use.
MR. PALESANO: In theory, that's a good
point and
MR. DETWILER: You can't anticipate
everything, but

Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

MR. PALESANO:

In practice, however, we find

1 that most of the time, what works in one facility in a 2 process may not mean the same in another process or another facility. Then again, that's where if we had 3 4 the expertise available for people, they could walk 5 them through and say if you made this decision, you could use this type of information for support. 6 Ιf 7 your decision happens to go this way, you need a 8 different kind of support and that would be something similar to blah, blah, blah. 9 10 MR. FINNEGAN: But really FSIS has already I've got books, generic HACCP plans for 11 12 you name the product. I mean --13 DR. HARRIS: They exist. 14 MR. FINNEGAN: They exist. 15 They exist. DR. HARRIS: There's nine CCPs 16 for sausage. 17 MR. PALESANO: I'm going to give you a 18 little bit of history. I think you're trying to bite 19 off too much of the apple at once, and really I 20 would -- the question we're asking is how can we get resources from industry utilizing the International 21

> Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

22

HACCP Alliance.

1	We recognize and if you have time to look at
2	the implementation plan that we have provided to you,
3	you will see there multitudes of things. One of them
4	is to look at this mountain of documentation that
5	you're referring to, Mike, and to determine what
6	documentation is still valid or was it ever valid,
7	what should we leave posted, whether we need to make
8	the information that's there more applicable to a
9	small or very small plant, is there some of it that we
10	need to weed out, is there some of it that we need to
11	write in clearer, understandable language, you know,
12	all of these kinds of things. That's all part of the
13	plan as well, but I don't think that's what this
14	question references.
15	DR. HARRIS: And some day we're going to get

DR. HARRIS: And some day we're going to get into subsequent questions also.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Right.

DR. HARRIS: We have more than one question and a point well taken. Maybe we need to narrow our focus here slightly on question 1, and broaden, and save some of that.

DR. CARPENTER: Well, one interpretation for

me is that you've tried to locate the representatives and it failed or you just don't know where to look?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. PALESANO: The Agency does not contact a company and say, hey, can I use you as a -- that's just not what we do, and we can't -- that's why we referenced the International HACCP Alliance, is they are a non-profit institution that kind of serves as a, for lack of a better word, mediator between industry and the Agency.

DR. HARRIS: We may have some members that have no idea what the Alliance is, and maybe I should, and maybe that way it would help.

The Alliance was basically formed back when USDA began down the path of mandating HACCP, and its mission from the beginning was be completely to relative for neutral, to not advocating the Government, not advocating for the industry, but being a coalition of industry associations, of universities, of Government agencies, that could come together and work toward a uniform implementation of HACCP across the meat and poultry industries. That's really where it all began, in other words, where its focus has

been.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Now it does get into -- the Alliance gets into a variety of activities all related to HACCP and food safety primarily within the meat and poultry industry, although there are some other food groups involved as well. It does a lot of work with the Agency. It does some contract work for FSIS relative to the training of EIAO official, EIAO whatever, I guess O is -- well, anyway, it provides training there.

I would even go so far as to admit that the integrally --I can't Alliance was even word -- but they were very involved in the development of the generic models, and one of the things that the Alliance did in the development of the generic HACCP to bring together industry, academia, models was Government and consumer groups to work on those models and try to identify individuals and entities with expertise in each processing area and develop those What became of those models after their models now. initial development and what the final product is, we can debate, but that is sort of how the Alliance is

1 structured and functions. So there's some background there relative to 2 past experience in doing this kind of activity in 3 4 terms of assembling groups or assembling resources I 5 guess is the best way I know to put it, in terms of 6 whether that be, you know, the Alliance very actively 7 does provide a lot of the support documentation when 8 requested industry as well as it offers accreditation 9 HACCP training program. There's lot а 10 sidelines that it kind of gets involved in. 11 So for those of you who are unfamiliar with 12 it, that is sort of where the Alliance is and what it 13 is. Just for full disclosure, I 14 am on its 15 Executive Committee. So I mean I definitely very 16 close to it. So --DR. GRONDAHL: Has this question been posed 17 18 to the HACCP Alliance, the first question asking them 19 their opinion on how they would locate these --20 MR. PALESANO: Not to my knowledge. Maybe that would be the 21 DR. GRONDAHL: 22 obvious question.

1 MR. FINNEGAN: Yeah, that would be a place 2 to start, to ask them. 3 DR. HARRIS: And as you also heard today, 4 one of the things that the -- the Alliance has been 5 very involved with the Agency, and you heard about the 6 December meeting today that was organized and hosted 7 by the Alliance where it brought FSIS and industry 8 altogether to talk about small plant issues. So what's your -- let's, let's try to get 9 10 something on paper now for this first one. We've 11 talked about it for a while. Let's get something 12 We've got a short afternoon here. 13 MR. FINNEGAN: Yeah. 14 DR. HARRIS: What I had started typing 15 there, it recognizes -- I was going to sort of make an 16 introductory statement about certainly recognizing that the, you know, FSIS has a history of cooperative 17 18 efforts with the Alliance, and it may even make sense 19 for them to continue in that effort as pertains to 20 this question. That's what I started with, with what 21 I had started typing here.

> Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

MR. FINNEGAN: That sounds good.

22

1	DR. HARRIS: Okay. Now that I've put a
2	sense of fluff in there, let's get some detail here.
3	MR. FINNEGAN: Well, what Andrea said first
4	thing is to contact them, FSIS.
5	DR. GRONDAHL: And solicit their advice on
6	how you locate industry representatives in these
7	areas.
8	MR. FINNEGAN: Is the International HACCP
9	Alliance, are they in close contact with the trade
10	associations like yours, North American Food and your
11	Southwest evidently. You're on the Board. You
12	know what I mean so there's no
13	DR. HARRIS: We have very close contact.
14	MR. FINNEGAN: A good relationship with all
15	the different associations.
16	DR. HARRIS: I don't know that it I
17	don't know that it's all, but I mean
18	DR. CARPENTER: That's a complex question.
19	The second half we've answered. What about the first
20	half?
21	MS. RAZOR: Yes, we're involved.
22	DR. CARPENTER: Okay. So there is
	Eman State Departing Ing

involvement. I mean wouldn't you concede that the Alliance has all the knowledge and expertise that's needed, and going back to Darin's point about why should I help my competitor out, it might, it might go to the academic sector of that Alliance to be the experts that we would recommend to FSIS to use as primary contact. Because, Mike, you said it works well for you, right?

MR. FINNEGAN: It worked very well for us just from the simple fact that we really didn't have industry representatives that were willing to come forth. It was new. It was new to everybody, you know, we don't have any large plants in Montana, not a one.

MR. DETWILER: Well, it would be like a built in credibility issue, too, you know, depending on where this resource comes from. If it's some competitor down the road versus the HACCP Alliance or academia, you've got to think of, well, that's where that credibility lies.

The other thing, and this is not necessarily the best map to look at, but you're going to have some

areas that need a lot more representation than other areas, and that could be an issue, that if we're looking at the State level for academia, it might be different than if we're looking at different -- the HACCP Alliance, the Turkey Federation, you know, different areas that cover the whole geography there. They know where their concentrations lie geographically versus those land grant universities. Some of them might not be completely, you know, there's nothing in our area. Why would be involved or you want me to provide you with one -- look at all of this we have in our, our, you know, in the middle of the eastern half of the United States versus the Rocky Mountains area there.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. FINNEGAN: And in that particular case, the best thing to do is call the State people and we're already on the list, you know, for HACCP contacts because obviously we know more of what's going on in Montana, you know, than Austin, Texas.

DR. HARRIS: I have a question for probably Mary or Bobby or Karlease, any of you guys from the Agency, is the list of State contacts current and

1	updated? Last time I looked at it, it looked a little
2	out of date. I mean Dr. Jan was still showed up for
3	Texas.
4	MS. CUTSHALL: I just updated that.
5	DR. HARRIS: Did you? I haven't looked
6	lately, that's why I was asking.
7	MS. CUTSHALL: I just did it for New Mexico
8	and Texas last week.
9	DR. HARRIS: My question is should we
10	recommend that that be updated, but if it was just
11	updated, then there's no need to recommend that.
12	MS. CUTSHALL: You can certainly recommend
13	it.
14	DR. HARRIS: You can recommend anything.
15	If, you know, not if there's a need for it. That's
16	good because I did not know if those had been.
17	MS. CUTSHALL: We try to keep it updated,
18	yes. We try to keep it as current as possible.
19	MR. SCHAD: I wonder if I could oh, I'm
20	sorry.
21	MS. CUTSHALL: I was just going to,
22	terminology-wise, we usually call the State contacts,

contacts. The academic folks are coordinators. It's just a semantic thing. Sorry.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

I'm just thinking here, and I MR. SCHAD: might kind of be thinking out loud here. I'm looking at this from the perspective of a very small plant owner, and there's been a lot of ideas. Academia is good and all that, but I would kind of look at it, I've got this question, I don't know what to do here, so I would go through the HACCP Alliance. that's what we've been talking about here, and I think we need -- I would want several different choices that I would want to pick from to call. So I would make my decision on who I'm going to call because I, I can look at a state coordinator and I'm not going to pick out anybody's name or anything like that, I say, well, that guy, he don't know what he's talking about. I'm not going to call him.

DR. HARRIS: Maybe I'll diverge a little bit with that, Mark, because my thinking on this is I'm going back to what was presented today. The Agency is looking for one-stop shopping. This very small plant would not call the Alliance directly.

MR. SCHAD: Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. HARRIS: There's going to be an 800 number hopefully that this small plant would call and what then is available is the resources that the Alliance has assembled, the Agency can reference and use in assisting these -- that are directing these plants. Does that -- I think that's what I read into the document or heard during the presentation today.

MR. PALESANO: Actually, just to give you an example of how that works, last week I believe it was, somebody called looking for some assistance, and they were a very small plant from the State of Texas, and so somebody that answered that phone looked at the contact list, and recognized that the list was not up to date and contacted Mary and said, Mary, you realize is retired. So that is the kind Dr. Jan of information and the way the system is supposed to work and that's just one small example.

DR. HARRIS: I had no idea of that, Mary, when I brought that up a while ago. That's a strange coincidence. I was just taking that as an example. I didn't know --

MS. CUTSHALL: And I think one of the things that -- to follow up on what Bobby said, that we do have the ad hoc group that is starting to work at the TSC, and they're going to be working closely with other program areas.

From out input, one of the things that we would tell folks at the TSC is that if somebody calls my office or calls me, normally I don't just give them one source. I'll give them a number. I may give them a trade association, a university and somebody else that I know. If I know specifically there's -- it may not be a university in their state, but there's somebody else that's just a recognized expert, I'll normally recommend a couple of different sources.

And from FSIS' perspective, it's a good thing that we do that because we don't want to say, oh, well, the only person in the universe that you can call is Southwestern Meat Association or this person or that person, where it appears from our perspective, we're endorsing one source over another. So I think as part of our work with the ad hoc group, for the one-stop source, it would be something that we would,

you know, make into a different protocol that people would follow. Because it's also true that a lot of times, you know, it doesn't have to be somebody -- it doesn't have to be -- it doesn't have to be -- those would be the kind of things that we as an Agency would try to build into our protocols for the folks that are answering the questions.

DR. HARRIS: I'm kind of thinking out loud but it's coming through my fingers some. I'm trying to capture what we're saying a little bit but in more of a report form. To make it more efficient is I guess the word I was looking for. We may tweak the wording in here, but that's something we'll put in for now.

What else do we need to build into this response? I mean I think, I think we -- if we'd stop right there, we've basically answered the question.

Now is there more detail that we need to include. I was very general in listing academia, industry representatives, associations, State contacts. Is there any others that need to be specifically spelled out for completeness?

1 MR. FINNEGAN: Well, we may as we go along 2 and answer the rest of the questions, we may -- we can 3 always go back to it. 4 DR. HARRIS: So we want to work on the 5 second a little bit then? 6 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Change of thought process a little wouldn't hurt. 7 8 DR. HARRIS: Okav. How does FSIS obtain 9 data on the types of support that small and very small 10 plants need? In other words, I read that to say how does 11 12 the Agency knows what it needs to be providing? 13 are the small and very small plants need, and how does the Agency find out what they need? 14 15 Well, I'm going to throw out MR. SCHAD: 16 something here that, as a very small plant owner, I, I having to do 17 try to go to most sessions with 18 regulations and the most effective, I guess forward is 19 the best word, is this roundtable approach, and what 20 we do is -- it's an all day thing, and it is a round We make sure -- we don't make sure the -- we 21

> Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

regulators over

here

there's not

22

make

sure

1	industry over here like face to face. So it's like we
2	have to get in a fight or anything. We make it in a
3	roundtable thing. Industry meets in the morning and
4	formulates the issues and the questions, and then we
5	have a moderator or facilitator and he
6	DR. CARPENTER: Hold it. This is a meeting,
7	what, who, where. I missed something.
8	MR. SCHAD: This is industry and
9	DR. CARPENTER: Is this your lab or
10	MR. SCHAD: No.
11	DR. CARPENTER: Oh, it's not.
12	MR. SCHAD: No, it's through Extension.
13	DR. CARPENTER: Through Extension?
14	MR. SCHAD: Yeah.
15	DR. CARPENTER: So it's local?
16	MR. SCHAD: It's local, yes.
17	DR. CARPENTER: Okay.
18	MR. SCHAD: Well, I've heard they've done
19	this across the country in different areas.
20	DR. CARPENTER: Okay.
21	MR. SCHAD: But it's the most effective
22	thing I've been at. Industry formulates the questions

by themselves in the morning, and then in the afternoon, then the regulators come in.

DR. CARPENTER: Okay.

MR. SCHAD: And then the questions are asked by the moderator. So industry feels -- they don't feel intimidated all the way. They don't have to be afraid of asking the question. And this is a good way of getting answers to questions and getting feedback.

When I read that second question, I just thought now if FSIS wants to obtain like what -- well, what are the issues out there or what do the very small plants need, what if, you know, these roundtables that's going on across the country, if these issues were or questions were put together and sent back to FSIS, would this be a way of obtaining the needs of small and very small plants?

DR. HARRIS: Well, I think I heard this morning that there's a lot of effort going on underway to bring together Q&As from various sources, and I know that some of the roundtable Q&As do wind up being disseminated. I know the ones from University of Arkansas, they're pretty active about getting theirs

assembled and, and disseminated to the industry. I don't attend their roundtable normally. I have in the past, but I normally do get copies of the questions and answers at some point when they're disseminated.

I don't know whether on the current website that is being -- maybe more on the Tech Service Center website, I don't know.

MR. PALESANO: I'll give you a little bit of information that the particular questions that were generated at some of the roundtables that Mark is referring to, they arrive on someone's desk in writing, and they have been responded to in writing. Some of them were not submitted to us until a couple of years later, but they have been responded to.

Yes, we do intend to capture those questions and those would be part of the questions that will be posted.

What we found or the questions, those particular questions, Mark, that I believe you may have been at the roundtable, what I found there was some questions that were asked about a particular -- something that was happening in the Agency or a

1 particular document that the Agency referenced rather 2 than I need a specific type of document for this or what kind of document do I need to support this 3 4 decision, and so I may not have exactly the questions 5 that you are referencing. 6 MR. SCHAD: The ones I've been at, Bobby, 7 I've got both type. I've got questions about new directives and also directives about I believe I have 8 adequate supporting documentation and the Agency tells 9 10 me that it's not --Well, that's the questions 11 MR. PALESANO: 12 that they sent them to me to respond to. 13 DR. HARRIS: In terms of what type of support the small and very small plants need for their 14 15 food safety systems, I mean read that -- I 16 that's -- I read supporting documentation into that 17 question. 18 going to ask the I'm Agency 19 question now. The most likely avenue that I see so far for accessing that information is through the food 20 safety assessments. I mean food -- these things come 21 22 to the surface during the food safety assessment on

1 what kinds of things are not being supported very 2 Is there a means of capturing that? 3 MR. PALESANO: Yes. Yes, that is on our 4 list to review the food safety assessments. I would like to throw a different wrinkle to 5 you as representative of this Committee and think that 6 7 we as a regulator don't have to go in and find out these things that may result in an enforcement action. 8 We're looking for ways to obtain this data prior to us 9 10 going in, in an official capacity, conducting 11 assessment and then perhaps taking an enforcement 12 action. 13 So if we could find out, you've got a very small plant, Mike's got a small plant, you all are a 14 15 bit uncomfortable in areas of your food safety system, 16 that you have concerns about for us to know what those are and to find out if there is information out there 17 to fill those gaps, we need to know it before we go 18 19 in. 20 After I go in to do an assessment, there, I'm obligated under the Act to take an action. 21 22 If I know those gaps are there, and I can sit down

with you in advance and say to you, let's talk about the types of things that we'll be looking at during a food safety assessment, blah, blah, blah, here are some things that we have that are posted on our website, blah, blah, blah.

DR. HARRIS: I was guessing that we could learn something from the pain and suffering of some of these plants that have already had an enforcement action taken.

MR. PALESANO: That is on our list, and you'll see it as one of the action items, Joe. It is on our list to review those as painful as someone pointed out in the meeting today, that they're several pages long, but we do plan to go through that. We do have a group already set up for that.

MS. CUTSHALL: I think one thing maybe just to clarify here, what I think we're really looking for here is the struggle that a lot of us on the workgroup have been working through, and we can all sit here and say anecdotally everybody knows that supporting documentation is a problem. We hear it over and over, but what kind of supporting documentation? What

particular processes? How can we, how can we find out the information on where there really are gaps, and I think Karlease said this when she was talking, where are the real gaps and where are the places that we just haven't been proactive enough letting people know that there's existing information. So how can, how can you give us suggestions on how we can better really get our hands around that issue?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. HARRIS: My experience is that many times with some of these companies, they don't know what they don't know. You ask them what do you know, and they go, I don't know. EIAO, I think I everything I need. Well, next week when the EIAO comes, we're going to find out if you had everything you needed or not, and sometimes not. And I know where you're coming from, I'm interested and in hearing --

MR. FINNEGAN: You're exactly right. A lot of these plants that I've seen, I've done those reviews, they don't really know that they are lacking supporting documentation and not only do they not know but they don't know where to go to get it. And you're

1 They don't know what they don't know, exactly. 2 DR. HARRIS: The first step is to admit you 3 have a problem kind of a thing. 4 MR. DETWILER: Wouldn't they know what they 5 haven't known in the past? I don't know what I don't 6 know now, but I know in the past I've had to look for 7 this. I've had to ask about this. I've had to get 8 advice on this. So what about some type of 9 anonymous or blind, whatever they call it, like a 10 survey, you know, what are some resources you've had 11 to go looking for in the past that potentially you or other similar, you know, establishments might need 12 13 help for in the future. A one-stop kind of a --I'll throw this out. We heard 14 DR. HARRIS: 15 earlier today that for the Agency to conduct such a 16 survey is an issue. That's not an easy thing for the 17 Agency to do because of the hoops that have to be 18 jumped through before the Agency can ask for this 19 information. 20 MR. DETWILER: What about the Alliance? Well, or trade associations 21 DR. HARRIS: 22 might be a good --

MR. DETWILER: Trade associations.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. HARRIS: And here's the problem. The big gap in that is the ones that need it the most are the ones that don't belong to any of that stuff. They don't belong to my association, they don't belong to Mark's, Ann's or any of the other ones.

MR. DETWILER: So couldn't we correlate all -- but couldn't we go then, okay, we know these places exist and they're not a member of this, this, this, and this. Therefore here is our focus They're not on either of these trade groups concern. or organizations. So now we definitely want to focus I mean I would have no idea but let's say, on those. you know, again, if we know that they exist and we can find that they're not on the Turkey Federation or the -- what are all the federations and alliances and stuff, and wow, what do you know? They're not associated with anybody. That's the ones you definitely send someone out to -- send out some kind of thing and say what have you looked for in the past, get some data on those guys.

DR. HARRIS: Okay. And here again, I'm

1 going to keep throwing problems back at you, 2 don't mean to do that but how do we know who those 3 people are? If the Agency doesn't know who belongs to 4 what --5 MR. PALESANO: We don't want to know. 6 DR. HARRIS: Exactly, and don't want to 7 So I don't know who belongs to other groups. I 8 know who belongs to my own group, and that's difficult thing just in itself to figure out who out 9 10 there are the non-belongers. That's a harder question 11 to answer than it seems. 12 And probably the one that FINNEGAN: 13 should know the non-belongers is the CSI in the plant 14 every day. 15 But CSI has no way of knowing DR. HARRIS: 16 if they belong or don't belong to --17 MR. FINNEGAN: No, but I mean the CSI is 18 there looking over their HACCP records which you have 19 to do every day. They should know if there's parts 20 missing, the inspector doing the work. 21 DR. HARRIS: I'll let the Agency people 22 address that question.

MR. DETWILER: Okay. This may sound ridiculous, but don't these places pay tax. How would you find a record of them paying membership dues to some organization? I don't know.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. PALESANO: You know, first of all, from an Agency perspective, we really don't care whether an establishment belongs to an organization or not. position is that we are there to verify that establishment's food safety systems meet the regulatory requirements. If they can do that with or without an organization to belong to, that's fine, you know, and most of the time if they belong, they are more apt to ask for assistance and they stand a better chance of having the supporting documentation, but we should not be judging or making any decisions whether or not an establishment belongs to an association.

MR. DETWILER: Well, then why can't we just be honest with them and say, look, we want to make sure that there are open avenues of support and resources for every agency or for every establishment. We realize that some out there may not be a part of this group, that group or the other group. We, you

know, we have no control over that. We don't want to necessarily know that but if you find yourself not belonging to any of these groups and realize that you need some type of connection for these resources, please give us a phone call at 1-888-blah, blah, blah, blah, blah, and we'll be sure to hook you up with, you know --

MR. PALESANO: Yeah, Darin, and that's what this whole effort right here is about. It really is. That's what the entire outreach effort is about.

DR. HARRIS: Would it make sense, I'm asking the Subcommittee this now, and we welcome any other input, too, but would it make sense for, you know, the Agency to communicate that in a very succinct message to all federally inspected plants. I mean a letter, not put it in the form of a notice necessarily but some sort of a communication that -- obviously they have a means of communicating to every federally inspected plant and also I guess provide the same information to every State inspection agency that could be disseminated to its inspected facilities that says, you know, if you think you need supporting

1	documentation or maybe even better yet, here are the
2	areas that we have found to be common areas that
3	plants need more supporting documentation, and if
4	you're in that boat, here's what you do. And that
5	might be a very easy, you know, and that's how the
6	Agency could find out what they need and then they
7	hear back from them. That's not a survey. That's
8	just an offer of assistance of information. I'm
9	looking around at the Subcommittee members.
10	DR. CARPENTER: And Mary said some of these
11	places don't have Internet access but don't the CSIs
12	go in every day. Can they carry in this piece of
13	paper? Could they?
14	MR. DETWILER: Well, you could send them out
15	card and give them a phone number.
16	DR. CARPENTER: Yeah, but who gets in the
17	plant every day. I mean if there's not an Internet
18	wire, it's the CSI with a pile of paper. Additional
19	responsibilities for CSIs to give to them. We didn't
20	suggest it in this Committee. Don't mention us.
21	MS. CUTSHALL: Well, I think there's a
22	number of ways. If you want to go that way, you can

use the Internet. You can put an ad up 2 Internet. You can do a mass mailing. You can ask the CSI to just remind people that there's resources out 4 there or the EAIOs, whoever. There's ways that we could do that. MR. DETWILER: Put an ad in the local trade 7 city's, Small Business Association, Pulse. MS. CUTSHALL: If it costs money, it's going to be hard to do.

1

3

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. DETWILER: Well, again, the more bang for your buck deal where you realize you're going to get the message across the most, you know, looking at some of the eastern states where you're going to have versus some of the Midwest states or whatever. Ιt just seems that if you make every attempt to do that, going to that you're people that do get some communicate back.

DR. CARPENTER: And I don't think you ought to dismiss what Mark mentioned a few minutes ago. Roundtables where industry anonymously proposes to a coordinator what issues need to be addressed. what you said, Mark?

1	MR. SCHAD: Uh-huh.
2	DR. CARPENTER: And I mean why aren't
3	those what isn't the information collected and sent
4	forward.
5	MR. DETWILER: I think it's a good idea but
6	what I was hearing was that unfortunately the ones
7	that aren't necessarily going to go to that roundtable
8	meeting are the ones that are also of concern. So in
9	addition to the roundtable meeting, if you send out
10	this totally, you know, blanket message of, if you
11	find yourself not being connected or not having been
12	connected, here's a way for you to find out the
13	information on how to be connected, this in support
14	or or this in conjunction with what Mark was
15	talking about could be effective.
16	DR. CARPENTER: I didn't mean that would be
17	the exclusive means
18	MR. DETWILER: Right.
19	DR. CARPENTER: because the question is
20	suggestions, plural.
21	MR. DETWILER: Right.
22	DR. CARPENTER: So those are at least a
	Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road

couple.

MR. DETWILER: Well, there's going to be the reason for whatever reason, they don't hear about this or they can't get out because they're such a small company that they're not going to either geographically or time or a season of their product or whatever, they're not going to be able to participate in that type of a roundtable discussion but that follow through with some type of a letter or card or whatever saying, hey, contact us here.

DR. CARPENTER: But you could envision that a roundtable would have some documentation about the type of support that's needed, it gets in through a letter that the CSI brings in, and I never heard of anything, I don't know what I don't know, gets information from the CSI based on information that was forwarded from the roundtable. It's just multi layers of communication.

MR. DETWILER: Yeah.

DR. CARPENTER: And very network networked if you know what I mean.

MR. SCHAD: Yeah, I do think you need more

than one -- I'm not discounting your idea but -- and maybe if somebody doesn't fill it out and send it in, maybe that's their tough luck. Maybe that's their problem.

MR. DETWILER: Or maybe it's because they do feel that they're connected but the only reason they decide to fill it out or to make the phone call or send it back or whatever is because they're like, well, yeah, I do need that, and they're, you know, even if one percent returned that call or card, or whatever, and that's a population that was totally unrepresented or not served, then that's why they weren't invited.

MR. SCHAD: I just wanted to say that in 22 years of being involved in outreach type activities, the roundtable is the most effective to me. Much more effective than getting something in the mail saying, Mark, what's your problem?

DR. CARPENTER: Is it effective for you because you ask the question and you get the answer that day? I mean is that what you're saying or it gets discussed?

MR. SCHAD: Because it, because it discussed. I can look somebody right in the eyeball and I get a response immediately and what's great about it being anonymous is there are a lot of small and very small plants that don't want to be identified with the question or problem in any way, and I'm not excusing that because I used to be like, you know, to have that problem, it's hurting them but maybe we need to overlook that. When it's anonymous at roundtable things, it just brings so much more out because that doesn't -- that problem they have with identifying themselves, we've eliminated that problem.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. CARPENTER: But that sounds so positive on a local level and ought to be given to FSIS so it's national. I mean that's how I conceptualize it. I mean if it works locally, and it's anonymous, there's positive feedback, satisfaction amongst those who asked the questions, I mean it's going to --

MR. SCHAD: Because a lot of times the regulator will say, well, you know, who asked that question? Why do they want to know if they already know it?

1	MR. FINNEGAN: If you'll lot at the map for
2	the west, Montana, North or South Dakota, Wyoming,
3	logistics, you know, these guy will drive 500 miles.
4	MR. SCHAD: Really, I'm being repetitive
5	here. I just wanted to give my input as a very small
6	plant. That's the most effective means I've ever been
7	at.
8	MR. FINNEGAN: If I can make a suggestion
9	that FSIS directly communicating with the plants, it
10	would be far more feasible just to e-mail the
11	inspectors who go in the plant every day and say,
12	print this off and share it with your plant owner.
13	That way, the cost is
14	DR. HARRIS: Well, I think there is direct
15	communication with the plant. I sort of wanted to
16	leave it open to the Agency how it wants to go about
17	reaching those plants, whether they want to mail them
18	a letter or however the Agency would, in fact,
19	communicate. I don't know. I feel a little
20	uncomfortable on, on specifying.
21	DR. CARPENTER: Okay. You want to keep it
22	implicit. Are you sure you don't want to make it

1	explicit. I think it should be explicit, with many,
2	letter, e-mail. It would be e-mail to the inspectors
3	because a lot of plants don't have computers.
4	MR. FINNEGAN: You're looking concerned,
5	Joe, because you're
6	DR. HARRIS: No, I'm thinking, just thinking
7	how to put it into words what you're saying or how to
8	incorporate what you just suggested.
9	MR. FINNEGAN: All right. The subcommittee
10	recommends that FSIS communicate directly with each
11	federally inspected establishment via e-mail, via
12	mailings. It would be nice to get something besides
13	the network is down. We're supposed to be getting
14	our computers.
15	DR. HARRIS: That suggests a few ways or
16	throws out or other ways.
17	MR. FINNEGAN: Do you want e-mail through
18	CSIs or do you want that comma in there?
19	DR. HARRIS: Well, it could be either direct
20	or through CSIs actually. I mean I'm guessing that
21	the Agency already knows how to e-mail a lot of
22	plants. I was thinking about direct e-mail also to

1 the plant owner. Several years worth of food safety 2 Is that accurate in terms of what you assessments. 3 guys are going to be compiling as you begin to --4 MR. PALESANO: Yeah, the program began in the fall of 2001. 5 6 MR. FINNEGAN: Wow. I wouldn't want that 7 job. 8 DR. HARRIS: What else? Do we need to include -- I included Mark's roundtable idea. 9 10 DR. GRONDAHL: You know, looking at the food safety assessments and the data that is already on 11 12 hand, do you think that looking at -- International 13 HACCP Alliance gets all these incoming questions. don't know if they keep historical records of all that 14 15 but I don't know if that would be something to add 16 to -- if they have data they could compile on the more 17 common questions they're getting to identify the 18 needs. 19 DR. HARRIS: Possibly. I don't know if they 20 keep records, you know. I don't keep records either 21 but I can tell you the one question I get the most. don't have to keep records to know what the most 22

common question is.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

I think what she's getting at MR. PALESANO: makes a little bit of sense. It lends to something I heard recently in talking to an establishment's manager is that I think it was from a very large plant maybe, but they actually catalog their questions as well and certainly, you know, if they're getting a lot of questions or they have a lot of questions that they're keeping records of, you know, if we're going to try to get all of the questions that are available from both sides, the industry as well as the Agency, and people are willing to share those questions with us obviously in a form where they would not associated with an establishment or something, that might be something as well, that kind of goes with what you're saying. Someone kind of volunteered that to me recently.

MR. DETWILER: Isn't there some kind of agriculture daily news program on or something like on PBS, Agriculture Day, Ag Day or something like that.

MS. CUTSHALL: There's a number of local programs.

MR. DETWILER: I swear if I go through the channels, I come across a PBS there's some TV show they have all the time, that's all about agriculture.

Does anyone know what I'm talking about at all? I'm trying to think of another resource. The Google, you know, the searches in Google, they actually have a TV show --

MS. CUTSHALL: Sharon's doing that for you right now.

MR. DETWILER: I know it's on PBS. It's like Ag Day or Ag -- I don't know, but there's an actual TV channel for Google. They actually talk about the top, you know, the top search to this, the top this kind of stuff, and I believe there's an actual show on something weird, you know, like Channel 169 or, you know, Channel 493 or something like that, but I swear I've come across, there's a TV show on agriculture. I don't know, maybe it's just me, I don't know.

DR. HARRIS: Okay. Let's see here. I added a sentence that says another method to obtain the data on types of support could be for FSIS to provide a

1	web-based mechanism for industry representatives,
2	associations or other entities to submit commonly
3	asked questions for support needs.
4	DR. CARPENTER: You've got it.
5	DR. HARRIS: I mean not only do we we
6	have to provide some sort of way to get it to the
7	Agency. And again, the Agency is soliciting it versus
8	others volunteering it is probably easier if the
9	Agency just provides a means for people to volunteer
10	it.
11	MR. FINNEGAN: You can just have a little
12	contact me icon or contact us. Okay.
13	DR. HARRIS: What else do we need on this
14	question? There's two more questions. Let's move to
15	the third one if nobody wants to add to this one. You
16	start thinking and I'll start typing the question.
17	MR. FINNEGAN: Mary, what do they mean by
18	users group consisting of all partners? What are
19	they?
20	MS. CUTSHALL: Let me take a look at the
21	question, Mike.
22	DR. KELLY: They mean a group kind of like a

group like this, a group of people that are just available to consult with or to give feedback or people who are in the business who are doing this, to give input.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. FINNEGAN: Okay. Agency, industry, everybody. Okay.

MR. DETWILER: Okay. Darin's going to come from a cultural perspective here. My wife was a She now makes 6, 7, \$8,000 a month selling on lawyer. eBay. I kid you not. The only reason I bring this up is because eBay to make sure that their website, their user information, their services, their entire program works effectively, they have people like you were just saying here, they actually have people from various parts of the country come once a year to answer these very same exact questions in terms of these are our existing tools, please -- we want you to provide feedback on this. They bring them in. They give them donuts and coffee, whatever, and that's their job is to come in and say, I used it this way and down the street they use it this way, and that kind of a thing. I don't know why -- if it works for eBay and with

their one-stop shop kind of website and information dissemination program, why it wouldn't work for FSIS.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. CARPENTER: Can FSIS have donuts and coffee for eBay executives?

DETWILER: Well, if you bring this MR. matter in, and you have different types of products, different types of business sizes, different originalities, you get a little sampling of all these different things, and you bring in, you know, someone from all these different perspectives, and they know in advance that their job is to, to provide feedback quality of, you know, assurance information dissemination, and your services and all kinds of stuff, I go directly to them and that's how I would get it, directly from the people using it. mean are there like Ag conferences, you know. You guys must go to conferences here and there. Teachers have conferences. You must be -there must agricultural industry conferences. You do it at conferences. If people are already traveling from great distances because there --

DR. CARPENTER: I'm not knocking your ideas

here. I'm just listening. You're doing good.

MR. DETWILER: -- there are multiple -- area, you know, and here is, you know, the Northwest, you know, 2007 Expo for whatever, you know, related to your business or whatever, then FSIS at this thing, they, they have -- instead of flying everyone to Washington, D.C., they take advantage of people that already traveled a great distance to go to that conference, they ask them to be part of this feedback group and, you know, give them a bag and a T-shirt and ball cap and donuts and coffee and a hardy thank you letter and a certificate for participating in this feedback discussion group and save money and make someone feel like they're important.

MR. PALESANO: For a -- entity, you're doing really well. T-shirts and ball caps. If you really want to make it appealing, give them a certificate good for one, you know, get out of a FSA fee card.

DR. HARRIS: Just tell them you're going to have a drawing for one get out of an NOIE free. Some lucky participant will win.

DR. CARPENTER: The eBay example is really

1 good except FSIS is a regulatory body. The users would have to absolutely be the non-regulated like 2 your association which is an intermediary of sorts. 3 4 DR. HARRIS: The direction he was head was 5 to take advantage of some existing conferences. Our industry has way heck more meetings than we need to 6 7 have, and take advantage of some of those and provide a forum for feedback at some of those. 8 9 MS. CUTSHALL: Yeah, if we're just asking 10 general questions and not saying -- I mean not getting 11 into the regulatory framework but you're actually 12 looking at sort of almost a focus group of scenario 13 and it's participation only if you want to. We're not requiring somebody to go, and it's something that I 14 15 don't see it would be objectionable. 16 DR. CARPENTER: The point I was trying to make is that if a regulated entity recognizes a gap, 17 18 they're not going to the regulator to fill it in, 19 right? Right, Mark? Unless it was a group, you know. 20 MS. CUTSHALL: I see what you're saying. 21 DR. CARPENTER: That was the only point I 22 was trying to make.

MS. CUTSHALL: Well, I think the plan stinks so bad --

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

think this particular MR. PALESANO: I question deals more with the outreach services and not with Mark having a gap in his food safety system. So I believe what this question is that we now have this implementation plan that's the reason we're doing all of these action items and we, the best way, as Darin pointed out, the best way for us to find out if it's working is to ask the people that using it. saying, you know, to you all, how can we both -- how can we find that out from the people that are using So, you know, if we dress up our web page and we do all these things, and then Mark starts using what we have up there and he's part of the user group, we need his feedback, you know, this part's working very This really stinks because, you know, I got well. into this particular one location, I didn't know where I was or what the purpose was. If we are serious about outreach, we need that honest feedback.

DR. HARRIS: Well, that's what I was thinking. Through the various outreach mechanisms

whether it would be your 888, 800 number, whatever it is, were entities can call. Whether it be through the site on the website where we're you're going to have all of this stuff assembled into one central location, almost a feedback forum I guess, where people who didn't come didn't have the opportunity to provide feedback on it. Hey, was this useful? Can we make it more useful?

MR. DETWILER: I mean, I tell you, I go to so many conferences, and there's people that are standing around waiting for something to happen and there's always someone handing out surveys and giving out free ball caps and you've got to have college interns working on this campus here, you send them all out to Boston or Chicago or wherever, and you give them the surveys, you tell them exactly what you want them to do, how to compile it, and boom, they're happy and you've got all this stuff collected and you didn't have to pay all this money and, you know, if it works at one conference, now go to the southwest and then to the northeast and all the different places.

MR. FINNEGAN: And keeping with one-stop

shop mentality, this would be -- the answer to that question would be in the same website as they getting their information that we're trying to disseminate, you know. I mean why don't they call it one-stop service.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

DR. HARRIS: I'm just sort of jotting down thoughts there. I didn't put those in sentence form but what else? We're just brainstorming here. What are some other ways that the Agency could get that kind of feedback on there?

MR. FINNEGAN: I know as far as us, you know, being a State Meat Inspection Agency, we're invited to everyone of their conferences, of the industry's conferences. They have a couple a year. We're always invited and, you know, that would be a good time for a little give and take because believe me, we find out what they don't like about us. We can find out what's good. And, you know, that's these, you know, these -- like you say, there's a lot of conferences and the MMPA, they get together guite a bit.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: MMPA?

1	MR. FINNEGAN: Montana, which they're
2	affiliated with AAMP. Which when you participate in
3	forums, you've got to, that's
4	DR. HARRIS: First, you've got to get the
5	industry groups to actually have a forum but I think
6	most of us speaking as one industry group, and most of
7	us would be very amenable to that idea.
8	MS. CUTSHALL: Can I ask you guys a
9	question? At the industry conferences, do we get the
10	non-belongers?
11	DR. HARRIS: Of course not. But I think the
12	Agency can still learn from them.
13	MS. CUTSHALL: I'm just asking a question.
14	DR. HARRIS: There's no two ways about it.
15	They're not all there.
16	MS. CUTSHALL: Is there any is there
17	something they would go to that you're aware of,
18	something that
19	DR. HARRIS: I've not seen it yet.
20	MR. SCHAD: That's a tough one, Mary,
21	because at the conferences, you don't get all the
22	members. You get the active members. You've got
	1

members and you've got active members and -
MS. CUTSHALL: I'm just trying to --

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. SCHAD: I wish I knew the answer to that question.

I guess my thinking on that is DR. HARRIS: since the Agency's looking for feedback in this particular instance, you know, I think the feedback would be useful but there's a lot of those people that may not belong, are still hopefully, if we've done any good at all in our first two questions, are you utilizing some of the tools and are at least running into the same issues that the belongers are in terms of using those tools, maybe not, but I don't know how to reach out to the -- the Agency is the only entity that I know of that knows how to reach them, and when I say the Agency, I mean including State agencies and that.

MR. DETWILER: Well, these people must potentially belong to some group. I mean there's Chamber of Commerce. There's granges. There's other things out there that might not be regulatory or industry group, but some of these smaller businesses

1	might be belonging to one which they perform.
2	DR. HARRIS: I don't know.
3	DR. GRONDAHL: In my experience, the only
4	way to reach the non-belongers is one on one visits,
5	I'd say visits, one on one.
6	DR. HARRIS: And I'm thinking outside the
7	box a little now but, you know, one way that works,
8	but I don't know how I don't know how to utilize
9	this group, and that is vendors that sell everything
10	from boxes to spices to casings. They know how to
11	reach these people because they sell them stuff every
12	day. Now I have no idea how you would tap into those
13	groups to reach out to these people but I guess I'm
14	open, you know. Do any of you guys see any means of
15	doing that? Because I will tell you the vendors do
16	belong to the associations.
17	MR. SCHAD: And that's how we get our most
18	members is through them because like you said, Joe,
19	they're on the road and they have more contact with
20	the meat processors.
21	MR. DETWILER: I mean where do these
22	local where do these smaller plants sell their

1 product? 2 DR. HARRIS: You know, that's as wide as you Some of them have their own retail 3 can imagine. 4 outlets. Some of them are selling to -- it's all of 5 They're selling through either they have a the above. 6 retail outlet. They're selling to local restaurants, 7 local independent grocers or not even independent 8 Some are grocery chains. I mean I can show grocers. you some really small companies that are selling to 9 10 the Kroegers and Safeways of the world. 11 Then why can't we go through MR. DETWILER: 12 them? 13 DR. HARRIS: Go through them how? 14 MR. DETWILER: I don't know. I'm just a 15 I don't know. teacher. 16 Ann, you're quiet over there. DR. HARRIS: 17 Could you envision using your vendors as a means of 18 reaching out to not just your members but other 19 entities?

> Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

what we're trying to reach out about our vendors don't

MS. RAZOR:

know anything about anyway.

20

21

22

I mean I don't know.

I think

MR. FINNEGAN: True.

MS. RAZOR: You know, you're trying to get a guy that sells boxes to talk to his people about what they need to do to be up on HACCP regulations?

DR. HARRIS: Well, I'm thinking more in terms of say, you know, plant the seed with this, and say, hey, when you're out visiting these plants, you know, ask them if they're using some of these tools that are available to them or if they even know about them. I mean that's a very informal way of doing this. It's going to be hard to quantify but --

MR. DETWILER: Well, if you have like Kroeger and major regional grocery outlets that are selling these guys product, obviously they're going to be concerned about the quality of the product. I know for instance in my neck of the woods, your QFC, Hagan, Kroeger, those guys have food safety people. Those guys have quality assurance people, and if they know that they purchase from small regional suppliers, they could be the ones that provide that communication back in terms of, hey, don't know if you knew this or not, but just thought I'd share this with you since we

stock your product, you know, that idea of, you know, I've been on some of these committees. The King County was it rabbit and small, you know, all the food safety commission there, where also on that same exact committee was -- there was Costco, there was OFC. There was all these, you know, major outlets, all their quality assurance people, all the people that deal with food safety, and they know their small They could be the conduit back to business suppliers. them in terms of, hey, just in case you need it, here's a resource. MS. CUTSHALL: Then you're going to reach -you're starting with this number and now we've reached this number. Maybe they're easier to reach, maybe they're not. DR. HARRIS: I don't know exactly how you reach those guys. Well, again, I was on a King MR. DETWILER: County -- Greater Seattle Commission, and they seemed

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

to know all their people, all their food safety

experts for Costco and, you know, I don't know what

you guys have here or where you are, but the Kroeger,

Top Foods, Hagan, you know, all the major chains in the big area. All those food safety people for those companies are at that table with me, and they were seemed to be pretty knowledge about who was doing business as a meat establishment in their areas.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MS. CUTSHALL: Can I ask you a question, Darin? I hear what you're saying, but from a FSIS perspective, how could we actually leverage that as I live in Frederick, Maryland, and one thing to say. I know the grocery stores in Frederick County and who the players are in Frederick County, but from FSIS' perspective, and I think that's kind of where Ann was going, how, how can we get our arms around that huge a Or, would it be something that you would population? envision FSIS would interact at with maybe some one local entity, maybe the local health department, and provide them with that information and they in turn would leverage that for us?

MR. DETWILER: It could be. The committee I was on was King County Health Department, Greater Seattle Area, and they were dealing with local meat issues, talking about ethnic, small mom and pop

family, different types of food establishments they had brought in all these different chains, I mean all the quality assurance, all the food safety people from, you know, executives from these different chains and some decisions were made and some ground was covered or whatever. I would just think that if FSIS went through the state and county in terms of looking at, do you have contacts with your major grocers, in terms of food safety quality assurance, and then try to go through them to get to some of their more local and regional suppliers, the smaller places, that could be a way to get a hold of them. You've kind of gone through some people but, I don't know, again I was surprised to see all the people there at the table that I went to for all the name brand grocery stores and, and food brands in my area. In our discussions, they -- it seemed like they knew every single little mom and pop meat facility in the greater county area.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MS. CUTSHALL: I was just asking more from I guess practical perspective, from FSIS' perspective how we could make that work for us.

MR. DETWILER: Well, again, we're just

1 trying to get out to them the idea of, you know, we 2 were talking about mailings before. We were talking about, you know, the idea of asking someone to be part 3 4 of a feedback group or forum, the idea of maybe they 5 know someone or could help communicate that message. 6 DR. HARRIS: I'm going to ask the Agency 7 people just a question. Is it even feasible for us to 8 suggest something like having CSIs solicit feedback during their weekly meeting with plant management? 9 Is 10 that -- that may be something that's just out of the 11 That may be something that can't be done 12 but is that? 13 MR. PALESANO: I don't think that anything is out of the question, and certainly that could be a 14 15 suggestion of the Committee. 16 Because regardless of how small DR. HARRIS: or non-belonging the plant is, they're supposed to be 17 18 having a weekly meeting with their IIC. 19 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What they're all 20 about is inspection issues. MR. SCHAD: What it's all about is finding 21 22 what the concern is before the food safety

1	assessment.
2	DR. KELLY: Yeah, as long as we give the CSI
3	some way to share that information.
4	DR. HARRIS: That would be the key, you know,
5	for them to get having the CSI in the loop, and
6	that's our problem. That's beyond your group.
7	MR. FINNEGAN: And the CSIs are in there
8	daily.
9	DR. HARRIS: I'm going to have to spell this
10	out because I thinking crime scene investigator. You
11	know, I've never seen that show in my entire life.
12	I've never seen any of the current shows but it's
13	what are those little meetings called?
14	MR. PALESANO: Weekly meetings.
15	DR. HARRIS: Meetings with CSI. Again, I'll
16	do this in paragraph form here in a second. I'm just
17	trying to get the ideas down on paper.
18	MR. FINNEGAN: I mean that makes sense to me
19	because the other question that was one of the things
20	that we were going to us, the CSI to give them the
21	information and then in turn they can solicit how they
22	liked it or if they used it.

DR. HARRIS: Because that's one of things -- thinking back, that was one of the ways that the Agency tried to get its arms around food defense preparedness, was to get the CSIs to ask during weekly meetings, you know, have you guys done everything yet. MR. PALESANO: The only question I would ask your group, is have you included all you, That question says, you know, that we want partners?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

you, your group, is have you included all the partners? That question says, you know, that we want to involve all partners, and I'm not saying you don't, but have you thought through, have we included all the partners there. You know, I think we got through inspection, you know, whether it's State or Federal. We've got through industry but have we included other partners that may be Extension agents, academia, or any of those that may be part of this as well, and I'm not saying, you know, I only know from some of the meetings that I attend, that the Extension agents are part of this equation.

DR. HARRIS: Yes, they are.

MR. PALESANO: They're our partners, and they may, you know, if I get in trouble as a very small plant operator, I may go to an Extension agent.

1	So, you know, the Extension agents are probably going
2	to be using these tools hopefully as well. So you
3	might want to think through, have you included all of
4	our partners?
5	DR. HARRIS: Well, I do think that the first
6	two things we listed there, the feedback forum whether
7	it be on the website or an 800 number picks up anybody
8	that would use it there. You bring up an interesting
9	point. I don't know how you would solicit feed back
10	from Extension people.
11	MS. RAZOR: Do they not have an Extension
12	convention?
13	DR. HARRIS: I mean every State, or at least
14	as far as I know, most States will have a statewide
15	gathering of their Extension Service once a year.
16	MS. CUTSHALL: We get long with people, too.
17	Reciprocal meets conference.
18	DR. HARRIS: And we can spell some of that
19	out. I consider that to be industry conference
20	personally but
21	MS. SUB: Don't Extension agents, aren't
22	they represented at their land grant. I mean I just

graduated from Virginia Tech in May '05, and I'm still I know we have like an associate program in outreach and education, and she's in charge of all Extension agent hiring, because my roommate is going through that process now, goes through her office. So she has like access to the Extension agent in Virginia. So couldn't you use a contact person like at each land grant university who is theoretically already in the Alliance that you were talking about But I mean people like that are pretty easy to get in touch with and there's only one per state. So you wouldn't have to try to reach out to every single Extension agent.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. FINNEGAN: That's exactly right. That's how we do it. There's one person who is head of MSU Extension Service.

MS. SUB: And she was in charge, I mean she met via like Internet web casting with the Extension agents and Extension agents are on every single committee or commission that Virginia Tech had, and I don't see why they couldn't help out with that as well.

1 MR. FINNEGAN: Because a lot of Extension 2 people are not interested in food safety. They're off doing, you know, beefability or something. 3 4 MS. SUB: Well, they have their specialty 5 like there's a -- extension, and then there's meat 6 science personnel. 7 DR. HARRIS: Well, you start talking about 8 Extension groups and most all the land grant colleges that have meat science extensions are part of the 9 10 HACCP Alliance. As far as I know, they all are. 11 easy for those guys because they can be involved in 12 the Alliance for free. It doesn't cost them anything. 13 So they basically all are. Where are we leaving it at, guys? Are we ready to move on from this one? 14 You 15 know, I'm sort of at my wits end on how else to 16 solicit feedback, but --17 MR. FINNEGAN: Well, it's pretty close to 18 the first question, it really was. 19 DR. HARRIS: But thank you for mentioning 20 Extension because I hadn't really thought of that group as we were -- now it just looks like this is 21 22 What else should the Agency be doing open ended.

relative to, after hearing what the plan is, outreach to small plants?

MR. DETWILER: I have a crazy idea.

DR. HARRIS: Crazy works.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

People who eat the product MR. DETWILER: and people who work in these small and very small plants have to be of age to work in these plants or, you know, they have to have gone through high school. Heaven forbid, in the high schools, not necessarily full blown, but there would be some education connection about HACCP or just the idea, basic foundational understanding that there's these things out there that could be bad for you, you know, isn't it like the 150th Anniversary of the USDA coming up here in six short years, and you start looking at the history class of where the historical connections between changes and food safety and regulation and wars and presidents and stuff like that and, yeah, you say this isn't your science class but the more, you know, you embed some of this stuff into your history class, your science class, your health class, the idea that, hey, you know, I'm working at this plant and I

swear I remember the whole, yeah, I've heard of HACCP before or I know about this, the idea that if you have to take everyone from zero to knowing something, when they're on the job, because I know through dealing with this commission, that unlike people who work in fast food restaurants or have to get a food handler card, people who work at these establishments don't necessarily have to have a food handling card even. If they had some basic foundational understanding of the need for this, and some of the key words and tricky phrases somehow came out through high school classes, it's just that much more of a foundational understanding that the average plant worker in a small and very small plant would have before getting into the job.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MS. CUTSHALL: Well, I think we have a whole food safety education staff that targets schools and consumers and all those --

MR. DETWILER: I'm definitely a person that would be looking for that, and I don't see it. I mean I've been through the FDA's, you know, food safety training, and the problem is that unless a student

decides to take a foods class, a home economics class, a pro-start kind of class that is a food, you know, preparation type class, they're not going to get that education, unless that kid is in a high school science program where the science teacher. And there's no way that the science teachers are prepared for this, unless they went through a very specially designed program, that they're going to talk about food ever, especially talking about food safety because there's too many other things to cover due to state and national standards. There's no state and national standards to deal with actual food science.

And to have something like this where you're talking about not just consumers, not just future parents who are going to prepare for their kids, not only workers, but the whole idea, you have an International HACCP Alliance and that all these people working in small and very small plants are going to come through. There's nothing out there that kind of integrates this into the general population knowledge.

I know that my wife and I, our biggest goal was so that E. coli became a household word, and

that's the one thing that we think we might have had some impact on for the last 13 years when, you know, no one ever heard of E. coli, and then all of a sudden now you find E. coli in jokes and something from Jay Leno or whatever.

So if HACCP becomes, you know, somewhere out there, whether it's in a joke, no one would use it in a joke or in a sitcom unless the audience understood it enough that it has something to do with a program that's there for food safety. And if high school students, whether -- I mean Tootsie Roll put out the history of the, you know, the United States history and they had a little Tootsie Roll, the Revolutionary War and a Tootsie Roll, the Civil War, and stuff, and that's product placement, yes, but, you know, there was a way of doing that.

Maybe USDA history again with the 150th anniversary of the USDA, could find ways to imbed some understanding of the history and the need for food safety and also what's going on currently in looking at history, citizenship, geography, resources, all these different things.

1 There's so many different content areas in 2 high schools that just a little bit could be in there and I know that I'm barking up from Darin's little 3 4 tiny, I'm a high school teacher soapbox, but I really 5 think that if the general population had a little bit 6 more knowledge, then that idea is strengthening your 7 strategy to outreach and at least they could have 8 heard of it. 9 And it's not everything's brand new, 10 know, that some concepts and some terminology has been 11 put out there and that's all I have to say about that. 12 MS. CUTSHALL: Darin, if you can see behind 13 you on the screen, that one is safe food handling. This is food safety in the kitchen. 14 15 MR. DETWILER: And no high school student is 16 voluntarily going to go to that. 17 MS. CUTSHALL: Have you heard of Fight Back? 18 DETWILER: Yeah, and I've had the MR. 19 Batmobile at my high school. They were the only stop in the State of Washington and because I knew about 20 I'm saying that having a 21 it, I brought them to it.

> Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

couple of teachers that know about it is great but

22

there's not enough. Science teachers are not taught on this stuff at all. History teachers don't know about this at all.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MS. CUTSHALL: So you're really talking about teaching the teachers, not --

MR. DETWILER: I'm talking about creating some, some integratable -- some materials that can be integrated into English class, into a history class, Look, the USDA just sent out into a geography class. all these, these maps that include this or a timeline of history of changes in our food system, and now your history teacher that's going to look at this free timeline and go, hey, while we're talking about these different, you know, categories, look, I got this free timeline map from the USDA or whatever. Teachers will use that stuff. They don't have to go through some expensive, you know, they were traveling, put up in a hotel and taught for a week necessarily on all the science or all of the history of the USDA, but if there's posters out there and maps, timelines, resources, articles, readings, if there's materials out there that teachers could use without much, if

any, preparation that they can easily be integrated their history, their citizenship, their into literature or their writing class or their science class, even their math class, I use the Washington of Health communicable diseases State Department report in my math class because of all the data that's there to be used.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Other math teachers think I'm the craziest world if I person in the but darn don't have discussions about Ε. coli and food safety and salmonella and communicable diseases in my math class and my students ask questions.

All I'm saying is that there's teachers out there across the country that will use stuff if there is stuff available and if the general population had a little bit more knowledge through high school, then when they go to their fast food restaurant job or they go to their food plant job, that it would in the long run strengthen any strategy in terms of outreach to small and very small plants.

And just because you have like Ask Karen and food safety education programs, it's not being used

that much. It might be used in certain places, but I mean I look for it, and it's not being used. And I sit on many curriculum boards and I sit on many different things. We do have some teachers that have been specifically trained on this, and right now the USDA graduate school, they kind of manage the FDA and the National Science Teachers Association Food Science Education Program but there's only so many teachers that go through that every year. And even if they go through it, it doesn't necessarily mean they can use it because it's not part of their State or national education standards. If we look at some of the different impacts on, you know, making a little change at the national or the state level about food safety, or even just bypassing that and making stuff that's available that could be integrated easily into different areas, I do think that it would benefit in the long run. DR. HARRIS: Amen to everything you just said. I know.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

I know.

I'm not

I couldn't agree more.

MR. DETWILER:

DR. HARRIS:

100 percent sure that that's going to be tightly linked enough to the question. You and I are on the same wavelength in terms of trying to get food safety education in the schools. I'm not sure that the linkage from there to small plant outreach is going to be very obvious to some people as we go forward with this.

MR. DETWILER: I agree but again if you look at the numbers, not for the very small plant, but for the small plants, there's a lot of those, and I would imagine that, you know, some of these areas have everything from 4-H to Future Farmers to different, you know, high school agricultural programs that could benefit, but at the same time, you know, again, just -- I think it's convenient that if everyone had a little bit more knowledge, then it would be easier to have that reach that you don't have to start from the beginning for everyone.

And you have that 150-year anniversary coming up in just a little bit.

DR. HARRIS: FSIS is 100 this year, and USDA I guess is 150 I guess at some point here.

Okay. I'm going to offer a direct suggestion for outreach to small and very small plants, to keep it simpler, simpler and plainer, I probably won't include that but serious I know the Agency has made a big effort to put documents in plain language. It's not plain enough yet.

(5:00 p.m.)

MR. CORBO: I have sort of a different twist to that. You have a growing immigrant population, and I know that you have a number of processors who are immigrants and you do have a language problem. What is the Agency doing to reach out to those folks in their native languages so that they understand what the requirements are?

I'll just give you an example. You know, when I worked over at Public Citizen, we FOIA'd the noncompliance reports dealing with the specified risk materials, and sure enough, there was a Vietnamese, you know, processor in California who was processing poultry. All of the sudden he decided to do beef just on the whim and the inspector walked in and said, what are you doing? And, and so they had to write him up,

1 and he didn't understand. He didn't understand that 2 he had to go through a procedure so that he could 3 process beef. 4 And so you have a problem here, and it's 5 It's growing because you have a lot of these growing. 6 small operators, small plant operators are immigrants. 7 DR. HARRIS: I agree and right now, the 8 multiple languages, I don't know what all languages it 9 needs to be, but my guess is more than English and 10 Spanish. 11 MR. CORBO: Oh, yes. Asian languages, 12 Latino. 13 HARRIS: There's a lot. I would DR. 14 completely agree with that. Another piece, questions 15 that I get a lot, that are difficult to answer, 16 that -- and inevitably it's small plants and start up facilities, just the basics. Okay. I want to have an 17 18 inspected facility. What do I do first? Where do you 19 for that information? There's qo not meat а 20 inspection 101 on the website that I know of. 21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can't you do a CD on 22 starting a business or --

1	MR. PALESANO: Well, again I recognize you
2	all have had
3	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay. That's it
4	there.
5	MR. PALESANO: little time to review the
6	information in your packet. One of the action items
7	that we have is a start up package. So we
8	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's it there.
9	MR. PALESANO: We do have people working on
10	putting that together because it will be used
11	consistently nationwide, not each district having
12	their own. That's just a little bit of FYI.
13	MR. SCHAD: I guess I agree with what Joe
14	said. I'm glad you're doing that because I get asked
15	that question, too.
16	DR. HARRIS: And most of it you just sort of
17	learn through the school of hard knocks.
18	DR. KELLY: Calling those eight offices?
19	DR. HARRIS: Right.
20	MR. FINNEGAN: And if you knew what you were
21	facing, you would be custom.
22	DR. HARRIS: I usually send them to the
	Free State Reporting, Inc.

District Office, and the response when I tell them that is that's who told me to call you. Okay. So that means I've got to try to answer these questions.

Okay. The Boss is here. Everybody look busy. We're on the last question.

Seriously, what other suggestions do we have. I mean I do -- I think we sound like we're all in agreement. It definitely needs to be very plain language and in more than one language or more than three languages. What else?

MR. DETWILER: What about formats, multiple formats? You know, you've got the DVD that could be plugged in or the video tape or the, you know, the computer file or the web access file or are we worried about some of these smaller plants not having computer or Internet access. So we put it in more than just Internet access to deal with the format.

DR. CARPENTER: Can FSIS contract, you said, a marketing outreach organization so that it's not coming from FSIS? FSIS puts together its own information, gives it to an Agency and then whose job it is to --

DR. HARRIS: How's the marketing budget this year? Is there a big advertising budget?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I think that's some of what we were hoping to deal with the Extension --

I know every year we meet MR. FINNEGAN: with the Ag Days in different areas. We'll have Aq Days for kids, I think 6th and 7th, we call the 1-800 numbers and they send us the magnets, all that Fight Back stuff, you know, in line with what Darin was We do that but it's just through the -- I think it's the Cattlemen's Coalition or something where they call it Aq Days and Paulson, Montana, and there are about 300 6th and 7th graders and we call it, and we get all of this free stuff, and we hand everybody a little bag of, and they especially like those stick-ons that you put on the fridge where it has the temperature of things, and that works really well, where we're educating these kids to wash your hands, and that is available and every year the USDA sends us a big box of free stuff. Now how that fits, I'm off track a little bit but that's what Darin was talking.

1	DR. HARRIS: The document that we were given
2	today contains and, David, you brought this up earlier
3	in our discussion, right before we started the meeting
4	actually, there's a lot of action items that I think
5	are all, you know if you look behind this tab, a
6	little further back, if you look at the strategic
7	implementation plan, do you guys think it would be
8	appropriate that, you know, in terms of other
9	suggestions would be just more encouragement to
10	proceed with the action plan that was developed,
11	because it's got a lot of action steps.
12	MR. FINNEGAN: It does.
13	DR. CARPENTER: About 25 action steps just
14	for the one-stop service easy access.
15	DR. HARRIS: There's a whole lot more detail
16	than we're ever going to be able to come up in this
17	limited amount of time.
18	MR. FINNEGAN: Those are all good ideas,
19	absolutely. In fact, on page 7 they talk about easily
20	understandable language, we recommend it.
21	DR. CARPENTER: They're going to create

They're going to create "Ask Harry

22

PartnerNet.

HACCP." They're going to extend to all the Western Hemisphere in the Spanish language. One stop access there.

DR. HARRIS: A lot of these other suggestions are contained in there.

DR. CARPENTER: Yeah, they are. I just want a consensus of the Committee, okay, on the third and fourth question. Does the third question say how FSIS could best work? Did they want a best practice of all the thoughts we could mull over and the balance of what we said would fall to the first question? Or did you want suggestions on what probably would be the best way to pursue?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I think what we were looking for third one is how we could best work with the user groups. We recognize we have existing materials that already are available, and we're trying to pull from our existing materials, briefings and the new ones to be developed. These are the ones that exist and we're trying to put them into this one stop shop. We recognize that some of them may still be valid, useful materials but before we put them out

there or put them in the one stop shop, we'd like to have some input on a users group that we could go to and be able to say, you know, it's really good information but we didn't know how to get to it, and for somebody to say to us, you know, it was just garbage to start with, don't just put it in the one place for me, it just wasn't useful information. So it doesn't matter that it's in one place. It iust wasn't useful information to start with. So we're really looking for some ideas on a users group that would help us better understand either existing tools or even our new materials that we could pilot these materials. That's what we're really looking for.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. CORBO: Well, there's where your focus group would come in, a real focus group. You would hire a firm to pull a sample of your small and very small plants.

And, in fact, the Agency is DR. HARRIS: even now in the process of doing just such a focus group on food defense. It's an assembly they went through, through various groups and found small to Washington sometime entities to come soon

participate in this focus group.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

MR. DETWILER: What about that Resolve? I thought that was like a third party thing.

DR. HARRIS: It is. And I don't know much about it. You'll have to ask them. That's the third party to work on the --

MR. DETWILER: I thought maybe if we're talking about third party group, then that Resolve maybe -- I don't know much about it. I just know that it's a third party group for this kind of thing, it could be used for a feedback group.

To clarify a little UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: bit, we -- and I know you weren't here, Darin, last time, but the Committee as a whole recommended that we have a third party facilitator, get input from all of our stakeholders on issues related to risk-based inspection, and likely the issues that we will take to them will relate to all of our topics on our Risk-Based Inspection System. Like we will take our measures of risk control on establishment, the issue that the other Subcommittee is addressing at this It will probably be the first Committee meeting.

issue that we take to our third party facilitator to get input from all of our stakeholders, and then they'll continue to work with the Committee as a whole as we get input from all of our stakeholders.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

This particular issue, enhancing working with our small and very small plants, would seem tangential to working forward in a small -- in the more robust Risk-Based Inspection System but probably not one because as you see we have a well developed plan because we work with the International HACCP Alliance. It's probably not one we would take to our third party facilitator because we have a fairly well developed plan at This point but would like to take the other issue to our third party It doesn't mean we couldn't ask them facilitator. just to get their input on it, but we would like to use our resources on the other tasks.

DR. HARRIS: I'm just trying to take what we had already written and put it into some kind of a useful format here.

The last piece, are you guys in agreement that the focus group idea is --

1	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I think that would be
2	good.
3	DR. HARRIS: How do we want to word that?
4	We've already started with this first focus group. So
5	expand the use of focus groups?
6	Okay. Committee people, does that capture
7	what we said on the third question?
8	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, I think it
9	does.
LO	DR. HARRIS: Okay. Let's go down to
L1	question 4. Do you want me to just try to put that
L2	into a
L3	MR. SCHAD: Did we eliminate the website,
L4	too, with what you just got rid of?
L5	DR. HARRIS: I can put that in as an
L6	example, a website and 800 number? You all want to
L7	make sure we save that in there? I want to get the
L8	right terminology here.
L9	More comments? More suggestions? Typos.
20	DR. CARPENTER: The only thing I could think
21	of, all of the material listed here in the initial
22	strategic implementation plan, I mean there's 25 major

1	activities and probably 100 action steps, do we
2	disseminate that to the target audience and say help
3	us prioritize this. This is about like a 5, 6 year
4	plan.
5	DR. HARRIS: It's comprehensive.
6	DR. CARPENTER: It rally it. I mean that
7	would be just asking for their input. What do you
8	need most, first, best? I mean is that possible?
9	DR. HARRIS: Well, they want feedback on
10	everything else. I mean I don't know if although I
11	will say that getting feedback on something like that
12	is a little more difficult because that would require
13	participants to read and digest what it says.
14	MR. SCHAD: I mean it is more difficult, but
15	I think it is a good point. I mean going through that
16	list, I can see, yeah, that sounds good but it's not
17	that critical.
18	DR. CARPENTER: You didn't get a consensus
19	on what the FSIS should be focused on to get the most
20	important or that which received the most votes,
21	highest on the list and pursue it.
22	DR. HARRIS: Could that be something that

1 the -- when we talked about the focus groups up there 2 above, could that be a role that of that focus group? DR. CARPENTER: Yeah, I think so. 3 4 MR. SCHAD: Barb, is this the finalized plan 5 subject scrutiny or is that to some more and finalization? 6 7 DR. MASTERS: This is the Agency's plan. MR. SCHAD: Okay. 8 It wouldn't preclude us from, 9 DR. MASTERS: 10 if we got input today, that's why it's here. Ιf somebody says, this is the worst idea I ever heard, 11 12 something says take it off, but this is the Agency's 13 Actions are already being taken from this plan. 14 MR. DETWILER: What about some of these 15 small and very small establishments, I don't know if 16 this would matter, but you know how you go get your 17 oil changed and you get your car worked on, they 18 always have these certificates that the workers went 19 to some training or whatever. Could you make us some 20 official certificates that this plant or someone from this plant has taken part in the FSIS training or 21

> Free State Reporting, Inc. 1378 Cape St. Claire Road Annapolis, MD 21409 (410) 974-0947

outreach activity or whatever, and you make sure that

22

1	they are forwarded that so they can put up that
2	certificate.
3	DR. HARRIS: I will say this. Anything that
4	you do to recognize plant employees for an
5	accomplishment like that is valuable. You know, many
6	of these plant employees have never received any sort
7	of recognition for anything. So any level of
8	recognition is good. I mean I don't know if that's
9	something that the Agency should offer, if that
10	advances the Agency's mission or not but it's
11	definitely a positive.
12	MR. DETWILER: A half sheet of paper with
13	something that looked quasi official that says nothing
14	more than fill in the blank has completed "X" hours or
15	has been through this, you know, it doesn't take much
16	to do or say.
17	DR. HARRIS: Where does that fit?
18	MR. DETWILER: Motivation, the carrier of
19	the stick. It's a little carrot.
20	DR. HARRIS: Okay. Other comments on that?
21	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: The Agency should be
22	careful to say that we're not providing the training

of the 417 requirement. I don't think there's anything that would preclude us from saying that they participated in this outreach. So I don't think there's nothing that would preclude us from providing a certificate saying someone has participated in the outreach program.

DR. HARRIS: That would come under other suggestions I would think.

Let me see here. This is sort of an add-on kind of end. I'll stick it down here.

Now my question is I would anticipate that for small and very small plants most of the participants are going to be "upper management" and/or "ownership" type people. Is it important to those?

MR. SCHAD: No. That's my answer.

DR. HARRIS: I mean I know it is for the employees. It's very important. Has anything that we've dealt with either -- that has been put forth in this plan or that we've put forth, does any of that address those employees? I just want to be prepared so that when I present this tomorrow and somebody says, who are we going to give these things to, you

1	know, I want to have a little more.
2	MR. DETWILER: Well, it's not the employee.
3	It's the establishment.
4	DR. HARRIS: Okay.
5	DR. GRONDAHL: The only thing I can think of
6	is asking for helping provide feedback, you know, it
7	might be one more thing if they provide feedback,
8	that's the final step before receiving a certificate
9	for completion of whatever it is they're doing. Is
10	that generic enough to accomplish what you had in
11	mind?
12	MR. DETWILER: Do we want some kind of a
13	rating or some kind of a Better Business Bureau this
14	or some kind of a something, you think that this might
15	account for something or add up to something?
16	DR. HARRIS: Okay, guys. It's getting late.
17	We need to start wrapping up here, but let's read
18	back through all of these and see.
19	Here's the first one. Take a look at it.
20	See if you've got any other additions or suggestions
21	or ideas.
22	(Pause.)

1	Are we ready to look at number 2?
2	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.
3	(Pause.)
4	DR. HARRIS: Going once, twice, questions,
5	comments?
6	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Good enough.
7	DR. HARRIS: And Number 3 of the questions.
8	(Pause.)
9	DR. HARRIS: And finally Number 3 4.
10	(Pause.)
11	DR. HARRIS: Are you comfortable?
12	DR. CARPENTER: I am.
13	DR. HARRIS: If we provided the kinds of
13	DR. HARRIS: If we provided the kinds of feedback that you guys find useful. It is to provide
14	feedback that you guys find useful. It is to provide
14	feedback that you guys find useful. It is to provide you with useful stuff. That's what we're here for.
14 15 16	feedback that you guys find useful. It is to provide you with useful stuff. That's what we're here for. So well, there was plenty of opportunity they could
14 15 16 17	feedback that you guys find useful. It is to provide you with useful stuff. That's what we're here for. So well, there was plenty of opportunity they could have thrown it out and said, well, you know, have you
14 15 16 17 18	feedback that you guys find useful. It is to provide you with useful stuff. That's what we're here for. So well, there was plenty of opportunity they could have thrown it out and said, well, you know, have you thought about this?
14 15 16 17 18	feedback that you guys find useful. It is to provide you with useful stuff. That's what we're here for. So well, there was plenty of opportunity they could have thrown it out and said, well, you know, have you thought about this? DR. KELLY: I was waiting to hear that
14 15 16 17 18 19 20	feedback that you guys find useful. It is to provide you with useful stuff. That's what we're here for. So well, there was plenty of opportunity they could have thrown it out and said, well, you know, have you thought about this? DR. KELLY: I was waiting to hear that from

1	DR. KELLY: I can give you some questions
2	and
3	DR. HARRIS: Oh, no, you did. Was there
4	anything else before we call this thing final?
5	I'm going to hit the save button one more
6	time.
7	I'll print a hard copy right now. And then
8	I don't know about the computer. It's not going home
9	with me. So
10	Are we adjourned?
11	UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's what I was
12	going to ask?
13	DR. HARRIS: The Reporter is looking like,
14	hey, are you people done with me or what?
15	(Whereupon, at 5:30 p.m., the meeting was
16	concluded.)
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	

1	CERTIFICATE
2	This is to certify that the attached proceedings
3	in the matter of:
4	NATIONAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON
5	MEAT AND POULTRY INSPECTION
6	SUBCOMMITTEE NUMBER 2
7	STRATEGIC IMPLEMENTATION PLAN FOR ENHANCING
8	OUTREACH TO SMALL AND VERY SMALL PLANTS
9	Washington, D.C.
10	May 23, 2006
11	were held as herein appears, and that this is the
12	original transcription thereof for the files of the
13	United States Department of Agriculture, Food Safety
14	and Inspection Service.
15	
16	
17	
18	Andrew M. Livingston, Reporter
19	FREE STATE REPORTING, INC.
20	
21	
22	