BUILDING DESIGN FOR HOMELAND SECURITY

Unit XII-B Case Study



Unit Objectives

Explain building security design issues to a building owner for consideration prior to a renovation or new construction.

Explain the identification process to arrive at the high risk asset-threat/hazard pairs of interest.

Justify the recommended mitigation measures, explaining the benefits in reducing the risk for the high risk situations of interest.



HAZARDCORP BUILDING

Building

- Functions
- Infrastructure
- Threats/Hazards
 - Design Basis Threat
 - Levels of Protection
- Vulnerabilities
 - Impact
 - Mitigation

Report





HAZARDCORP

50-story mixed use high-rise office building

- 8,000 occupants
- 1,000 visitors
- Over 2,000,0000 square feet of rentable space
- "Neighbors" include:
 - Offices
 - Residential





5-Mile Building Radius







Local Imagery







HazMat Sites







Emergency Response







Building Data

- 50-story building completed in 1987
- Loading dock on SW side
- Retail on lower level
- 8,000 occupants
- 1,000 visitors
- 3 levels of underground parking





HAZARDCORP Occupancy

FLOOR	TENANT OCCUPANCY
49-50	Mechanical Floors
31-48	National financial services company
29-30	Bank offices
27-28	Federal government offices (IRS, DOD, CIA)
26	Mechanical room
25	Office of Emergency Management
23-24	Financial service company
20-22	Insurance company
19	State Employment Commission
15-18	Vacant
14	Financial management company
8-13	Federal government offices (SEC, Secret Service)
6-7	Bank offices
4-5	Storage, switch gear, generators, transformers
3	Open to first floor lobby, rentable meeting space, building management
2	Open to first floor lobby, rentable meeting space
1	Lobby, retail, fuel storage, switchgear, building administration, loading dock
UG1	Parking
UG2	Parking
UG3	Parking



	UG2	
FEMA	UG3	

Car Bomb Blast Effects



Truck Bomb Blast Effects-Collateral



Truck Bomb Blast Effects-Loading Dock



Building Data Structural / Envelope

- 4 perimeter moment frames
- Gravity framing composite steel beams
- Variety of framing connections
- Aluminum / Glass curtain wall exterior cladding
 - First three floors 3/8 inch thermally tempered glass
 - Other glazing ¼ inch or 3/8 inch annealed single pane glass
- Discontinuous columns through the lobby area







Fire Suppression

- Sprinklers on every floor of building
- Standpipes in every stairway, including building and plaza parking
- Yard main loops all around building
- Fire department connections west and north side of building

Electric Power

- 13,800 volt looped service feeds substation in building
- 4th floor transformers 480/277 volt distribution



Generators/Fuel Systems

- Building management and tenant systems
- Located in various parts of building

HVAC

- All air using heat pumps and supplemental electric heat (including lighting)
- Tied to fire suppression whereby floors above and below fire are overpressurized and fire floor is exhausted



Water

- Two feeds, one under loading dock
- Storage tanks on mechanical floors

Natural Gas

4-inch main to first floor restaurants



Communications

- Three T-3 lines from three providers
- Empty conduits for expansion installed
- Tenants have additional services
- VOIP, satellite, and landline phones in building for outside communication
- Fire Watch phone in stairwells



Physical Security

Security personnel

- I person -- Central Security
- 2 rovers

Reception staff

- 2 persons 0600-1800 on business days
- 1 person 1800-0600 on business days or all day on non-business days

Lobby – access to atrium, mailroom, meeting rooms and retail space



Threats/Hazards

Threats include:

Terrorism



- No direct threat specifically identified for HazardCorp Building
- Government, military, finance, and banking tenants in building could be targeted if perceived as soft target
- Collateral damage potential due to nearby potential targets in the area
- Intelligence Collection, especially by cyber attack
 - Government classified information
 - Commercial information



Threats/Hazards

Threats (continued):

Crime

 City has much higher crime rate than national averages in most categories

Natural Hazards

- Hurricanes and tornadoes Almost 100 per year
- Evacuation zone for storm surges
- Earthquakes Infrequent and low intensity -- old seismic zone 2A
- Lightning 25 strikes/year on average



Threats/Hazards

Threats (continued):

HazMat

- Chemical and fuel tank farms across river
- Rail lines across river
- Shipping on river
- 2,000 trucks each day within city
- 100 spills and releases each year in city

Other Technological Hazards

600 water main breaks per year in city



Design Basis Threat

Explosive Blast: Car Bomb 500 lb TNT equivalent. Truck Bomb 5,000 lb TNT equivalent (Murrah Federal Building class weapon)

Chemical: Large quantity petroleum fire toxic plume from tank farm. Large and small quantity HazMat release (chlorine) from tank farm, tanker truck, and rail car.

Biological: Anthrax delivered by mail or in packages, smallpox distributed by spray mechanism mounted on truck or aircraft in metropolitan area

Radiological: Small "dirty" bomb detonation within the 10-mile radius of the HAZARDCORP building



GSA Interagency Security Criteria

Level IV Building – over 450+ employees -- over 150,000 sq ft

- Perimeter Security
- Entry Security
- Interior Security
- Administrative Procedures
- Blast/Setback Standards



DoD Antiterrorism Standards

Level	Potential	Potential Door and	Potential
of Protection	Structural Damage	Glazing Hazards	Injury
Low	Damage – unrepairable. Major deformation of non- structural elements and secondary structural members and minor deformation of primary structural members, but progressive collapse is unlikely.	Glazing will break, but fall within 1 meter of the wall or otherwise not present a significant fragment hazard. Doors may fail, but they will rebound out of their frames, presenting minimal hazards.	Majority of personnel suffer significant injuries. There may be a few (<10 percent) fatalities.



FEMA 426, Adapted from Table 4-1: DoD Minimum Antiterrorism Standards for New Buildings, p. 4-9

DoD Antiterrorism Standards

Location	Building Category	Stand-off Distance or Separation Requirements			
Controlled Perimeter or Parking and Roadways without a Controlled Perimeter	Primary Gathering Building	Applicable Level of Protection	Conventional Construction Stand-off Distance	Effective Stand-off Distance	Applicable Explosives Weight
		Low	45 m 148 ft	25 m 82 ft	Car Bomb



Adapted from DoD Unified Facilities Criteria (UFC), "DoD Minimum Antiterrorism Standards for New Buildings", UFC 4-010-01, 31 July 2002 BUILDING DESIGN FOR HOMELAND SECURITY Unit XII-B-26

UFC 4-010-01 APPENDIX B Dod MINIMUM ANTITERRORISM STANDARDS FOR NEW AND EXISTING BUILDINGS

Standard 1	Minimum Stand-off Distances
Standard 2	Unobstructed Space
Standard 3	Drive-Up/Drop-Off Areas
Standard 4	Access Roads
Standard 5	Parking Beneath Buildings or on Rooftops
Standard 6	Progressive Collapse Avoidance
Standard 7	Structural Isolation
Standard 8	Building Overhangs
Standard 9	Exterior Masonry Walls
Standard 10	Windows, Skylights, and Glazed Doors
Standard 11	Building Entrance Layout
Standard 12	Exterior Doors



Levels of Protection (continued)

UFC 4-010-01 APPENDIX B DoD MINIMUM ANTITERRORISM STANDARDS FOR NEW AND EXISTING BUILDINGS

Standard 13	Mailrooms
Standard 14	Roof Access
Standard 15	Overhead Mounted Architectural Features
Standard 16	Air Intakes
Standard 17	Mailroom Ventilation
Standard 18	Emergency Air Distribution Shutoff
Standard 19	Utility Distribution and Installation
Standard 20	Equipment Bracing
Standard 21	Under Building Access
Standard 22	Mass Notification



Unit XII Case Study Activity

Finalization and Presentation of Group Results

Purpose

- Groups finalize their assessments
- Decide on high priority risk concerns
- Determine appropriate mitigation measures
- Present findings to class

Requirements

Based on findings from previous activities, complete the worksheet table

Prepare to present conclusions and justify decisions to class in a 5- to 7-minute presentation



Basis of Mitigation Measures

Recommendations ultimately require an understanding of benefit (capability) versus cost to implement

Blast Modeling

- Various scenarios run at Tier III level for comparison using Design Basis Threats
 - Truck bomb is worst case
 - Car bomb also analyzed for comparison
 - Some interesting and unexpected results
- More analysis required for final design



FEMA

Basis of Mitigation Measures

Plume Modeling (CBR or HazMat)

- Tier II / Tier III performed for selected Design Basis Threats external to building, less urban canyon effect
- Additional Tier III analysis required inside building
 - Understand internal pressure changes during building operation
 - Understand on HVAC and other changes implemented in response plans affect the building
 - Supports design of CBR measures



Basis of Mitigation Measures

Cost Estimates are ROM (Rough Order of Magnitude)

- Assumes 10% Overhead and 10% Profit
- Assumes Area Cost Factor of 1.0 (DoD) or 100 (RS Means)
 - DoD Range: 0.84 (Huntsville AL) to 1.67 (Anchorage AK)
 - RS Means Range: 82.5 (Baton Rouge LA) to 131.9 (New York NY)
 - Adjusted for July 2006
- Anti-Terrorism / Force Protection equipment and construction costing information is still immature



Vulnerability/Mitigation Site / Vehicle Bomb

Maximize available stand-off

- Plaza side barriers at property line to prevent direct approach into lobby – K12 rating / 408 LF
 - Planters \$ 92K
 - Plinth walls \$207K
 - Bollards \$104K



Vulnerability/Mitigation Site / Vehicle Bomb

Maximize available stand-off

- Other three sides
 - Continue controlled parking on street
 - Signage \$10K
 - Bollards if no controlled parking
 - K12 rating North and South 340 LF \$90K
 - K8 rating West 248 LF \$65K



Site / Vehicle Bomb

Protect loading dock / building

- Hardened vehicle barriers, K12 rating, 3 each
 - Pop-Up \$405K
 - Drop Arm \$150K



Site / Vehicle Bomb

Reroute Traffic

- Traffic Study \$20K
- MOUs with tenants / neighbors / police
- Variable road closure or area-wide access control based upon intelligence (Ring of Steel)
- Change west side alley to north travel direction to avoid queuing on main roads for entry to UG building parking



Site / Vehicle Bomb

Segregate UG parking for access control

- Controlled under building tenants/vetted only
- Public under plaza (public parking is a premium in urban area)
- Hardened vehicle barriers at under building entrance / exit
 - Drop Arms K8 rating, 2 each \$96K
- Signage to denote public and tenant/staff UG parking entrances - \$2K



Architectural / Vehicle Bomb

Access control for loading dock

- Additional security at loading dock, includes screening at curb
 - 2 personnel, 8 hour shift \$188K/year
- Pre-screening away from building
 - Pre-engineered bldg \$36K
 - 2 personnel, 8 hour shift \$188K/year
- Time of day access (2000 to 0400)
 - 4 personnel, 8 hour shift \$376K/year
- Apply individually or collectively



Architectural / Vehicle Bomb

Segregate UG parking for access control

- Electronic or manned access control under building
 - Electronic (Card Scanner & PIN) \$12K
 - Manned
 - Small Shelter \$5K
 - 2 Personnel, 24/7 \$790K/year



Architectural / Vehicle Bomb

Strengthen overhead anchorage elements

- HVAC diffusers, light fixtures, etc.
 - First three floors \$950K
- Canopy at main entrance
 - Requires additional design information
 - \$950K



Architectural + Security / Vehicle Bomb

Move Security Control to 4th floor or install backup location on 4th floor

- >> \$1M
- Alarms, communications, CCTV, building operating systems (SCADA, EMCS), and Fire Control



Architectural / Access Control

Lobby redesign

- Channel all entrances to screening location(s) with up to 12 checkpoints for throughput
- \$2.5M

Close off retail space access to Lobby

- Convert to crash bar with alarm, 3 doors \$1.5K
- Lobby redesign may overcome need

Armed guards manning screening equipment in lobby

 Up to 36 guards with 3 guards per checkpoint at peak times based upon throughput

\$8.7M/year



Structural Systems / Vehicle Bomb

Perform blast analysis – perimeter building columns

- Existing W14x455 steel columns, 96 total
- Upgrade on Floors 1 and 2 Encase in 4,000 psi concrete and ¼" steel wrap \$980K

Harden loading dock to protect rest of building – below achieves low LOP

- 12" R/C, #8-4"O.C. both faces, ½" steel plate on ceiling and floor - \$510K
- Adds protection of fuel tanks under loading dock, evaluate need for additional measures



Column Hardening

Original Columns



Small DBT – 14 ft

Hardened Columns

Large DBT - 18 ft

Small DBT -- 5 ft





Structural Systems / Vehicle Bomb

Segregate UG parking for access control

- Harden columns on all underground levels along first building line nearest public access
 - 4,000 PSI concrete and ¼" steel wrap, 21 columns
 \$635K
 - Consider all columns at all UG parking levels under building based upon progressive collapse
 - Add \$2.6M to above



Structural Systems / Vehicle Bomb

Segregate UG parking for access control

- Hardened wall between vetted and public parking, 248
 LF per level, <u>3 levels totaled below</u>
 - 12" R/C, #8-4"O.C., both faces \$2.06M
 - One vehicle barrier per level, K8 rating \$145K



Structural Systems / Vehicle Bomb

Perform blast analysis atrium columns – harden against progressive collapse

- Existing W14x455 steel columns, 16 total
- Upgrade on Floor 1 only Encase in 4,000 psi concrete and ¼" steel wrap - \$467K

Provide architectural stand-off around columns

- Gypsum board on metal studs
- 1' off column (GSA 6" required)
- 16 columns, first floor only \$50K



Building Envelope / Vehicle Bomb

Perform blast analysis – glazing and frame upgrades

- Existing 172 windows/floor, nominal 5' x 5'
 - Floors 1-3, 3/8" TTG SP
 - Floors 4-8, ¼" DS SP
 - Floors 9-50, 3/8" DS SP
- Upgraded Note Federal floors are 8-13 and 27-28
 - Floors 1-7, 1" TTG LAM SP \$12M
 - Floor 8, 3/8" TTG SP from Floors 1-3 with 15 mil FRF \$560K
 - Floors 9-13, 27-28 Existing with 15 mil FRF \$710K



Original glazing meets GSA minimum

Original Glazing

Large DBT- 678 ft

Small DBT-277 ft

Hardened Glazing









Original glazing requires 15-mil FRF to meet GSA minimum

Original Glazing

Large DBT– 1,707+ ft

Small DBT- 755 ft

Hardened Glazing









Original glazing requires 15-mil FRF w/4-sided attachment to meet GSA minimum

Original Glazing

Large DBT-1,707+ ft

Small DBT- 755 ft

Hardened Glazing

- Large DBT- 366 ft
- Small DBT- GSA 1 / 2





Original glazing requires 15-mil FRF w/4-sided attachment to meet GSA minimum

Original Glazing



Small DBT- 380 ft

Hardened Glazing



Large DBT- 379 ft







Original glazing requires 15-mil FRF w/4-sided attachment to meet GSA minimum

Original Glazing

Large DBT- 970 ft

Small DBT- 359 ft

Hardened Glazing



FEMA





Original glazing requires 15-mil FRF w/4-sided attachment to meet GSA minimum

Original Glazing

Large DBT- 923 ft

Small DBT- 82/174 ft

Hardened Glazing

FEMA









Utility Systems / Vehicle Bomb

- Harden all utilities entering site as transiting UG parking, 1' x 1' cross section
 - 3/8" steel plate welded with access panels and hangars - \$250/LF
- Set up preplanned contingency fuel deliveries for emergency generators with other supplier(s)



Mechanical / CBR Attack

Install emergency shut down switches – all fans

- At each floor accessible to fire wardens \$22K per floor
- Security Control and backup location \$22K per floor in addition to fire warden capability
- Total for building: \$2.2M



Mechanical / CBR Attack

Install elevator controls in Security Control and backup location

- Evacuation support (up or down)
- Shut down to prevent pumping of contaminants throughout building
- Total for 31 elevators: \$775K



Mechanical / CBR Attack (Chemical and Radiological)

Evaluate carbon filters for chlorine-type spills

- Analysis of heavier or lighter than air contaminants
- \$135K per air handler (two to four air handlers per floor)









HZC Chlorine Release Parameters

SITE DATA INFORMATION: Location: JERSEY CITY, NEW JERSEY Building Air Exchanges Per Hour: 0.50 (enclosed office) Time: June 30, 2005 0937 hours EDT (user specified) CHEMICAL INFORMATION: Molecular Weight: 70.91 g/mol Chemical Name: CHLORINE ERPG-3: 20 ppm ERPG-2: 3 ppm ERPG-1: 1 ppm IDLH: 10 ppm Carcinogenic risk - see CAMEO Normal Boiling Point: -29.3° F Ambient Boiling Point: -29.3° F Vapor Pressure at Ambient Temperature: greater than 1 atm Ambient Saturation Concentration: 1,000,000 ppm or 100.0% ATMOSPHERIC INFORMATION: (MANUAL INPUT OF DATA) Wind: 7 mph from 280° true at 3 meters No Inversion Height Stability Class: C Air Temperature: 70° F Relative Humidity: 50% Ground Roughness: open country Cloud Cover: 5 tenths SOURCE STRENGTH INFORMATION: Leak from hole in horizontal culindrical tank Tank Diameter: 8 feet Tank Length: 39.9 feet Tank Volume: 15000 gallons Tank contains liquid Internal Temperature: 70° F Chemical Mass in Tank: 88.0 tons Tank is 100% full Circular Opening Diameter: 6 inches Opening is 6 inches from tank bottom Release Duration: 5 minutes Max Average Sustained Release Rate: 60,900 pounds/min (averaged over a minute or more) Total Amount Released: 174,826 pounds Note: The chemical escaped as a mixture of qas and aerosol (two phase flow).



Railroad Tanker Chlorine Release





Chlorine Concentration at HZC





Chlorine Dose at HZC



Mechanical / CBR Attack (Chemical and Radiological)

Upgrade filters to MERV 11, 12 or 13 to remove particulates / CBR

- Confirm pressure drop can be handled or upgrade fan equipment
- \$50K to \$1.2M+ per floor



Fire Plumes – Smoke & CO



Mechanical / CBR Attack (Chemical and Radiological)

Install chemical/radiological detectors

- Activate HVAC shutdown and alarm
- \$15K to \$100K per floor for each type, with radiological less expensive



Mechanical / CBR Attack

Redesign HVAC for lobby

- Separate system, like mailroom \$620K
- Design safe rooms / shelter-in-place locations with filtered air units operated when shelter activated
 - \$200K per floor for 170 people



Mechanical / CBR Attack (Biological)

Evaluate Ultraviolet Germicidal Irradiation (UVGI)

\$4.9M for complete facility

CBR General

Establish Occupant Emergency Plans for CBR external and internal releases

Part of Building Management overhead



Security Systems / Generic Measures

Expanded and upgraded CCTV coverage

- Perimeter \$415K
- Stairwells (not pan/tilt/zoom) \$800K
 - UG Parking, Lobby, Federal Floors
 - Include coverage of access keypads
- UG parking \$555K
- With appropriate sensors (motion, noise, door contact) to aid monitoring



Security Systems / Generic Measures

Panic / duress alarms – for general public

- Place sign at each keypad
- Reprogram system to indicate duress/problem by pressing 911*
- Keypads linked to CCTV monitoring system for alarm
- Keypads added to plaza UG parking levels with CCTV coverage



Equipment Ops and Maintenance / Vehicle Bomb or Armed attack

Confirm sufficient fuel capacity for emergency generators to cover longest historical outage

- Starting estimate: 0.08 gal/KW/hr
- Once per year measure consumption at normal to high load
- Coordinate timely resupply

