

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of)	
)	
DYNAMIC HEALTH OF FLORIDA, LLC)	PUBLIC
CHHABRA GROUP, LLC)	
DBS LABORATORIES, LLC)	Docket No. 9317
VINEET K. CHHABRA aka VINCENT K. CHHABRA, and)	
JONATHAN BARASH,)	
Respondents.)	

To: Stephen J. McGuire
Chief Administrative Law Judge

**COMPLAINT COUNSEL’S MOTION REGARDING SCHEDULE
AND ADDITIONAL PROVISIONS**

Complaint counsel and counsel for respondents Dynamic Health of Florida, LLC, Chhabra Group, LLC, DBS Laboratories, LLC, and Vineet K. Chhabra (hereafter, “Respondents”)¹ conferred at length regarding a proposed scheduling order in this matter. We were not, however, able to reach agreement regarding the schedule. Accordingly, complaint counsel requests adoption of the following pre-hearing and hearing schedule:

- August 18, 2004 - Complaint Counsel provides preliminary witness list (not including experts) with description of proposed testimony.

- August 23, 2004 - Respondents’ Counsel provides preliminary witness lists (not including experts) with description of proposed testimony.

¹ Jonathan Barash is not a party to this matter. On May 14, 2004, the Commission accepted for public comment a proposed settlement agreement with Mr. Barash.

- September 1, 2004 - Deadline for issuing document requests, requests for admission, interrogatories and subpoenas *duces tecum*, except for discovery for purposes of authenticity and admissibility of exhibits.
- September 8, 2004 - Complaint Counsel provides expert witness list.
- September 13, 2004 - Respondents' Counsel provides expert witness list.
- October 5, 2004 - Complaint Counsel provides expert witness reports.
- October 8, 2004 - Respondents' Counsel provides expert witness reports.
- October 14, 2004 - Close of discovery, other than discovery permitted under Rule 3.24(a)(4), depositions, and discovery for purposes of authenticity and admissibility of exhibits.
- October 20, 2004 - Complaint Counsel to identify rebuttal expert(s) and provide rebuttal expert report(s). Any such reports are to be limited to rebuttal of matters set forth in Respondents' expert reports. If material outside the scope of fair rebuttal is presented, respondents will have the right to seek appropriate relief (such as striking Complaint Counsel's rebuttal expert reports or seeking leave to submit sur-rebuttal expert reports on behalf of Respondents.)
- November 7, 2004 - Deadline for all depositions.
- November 24, 2004 - Deadline for filing motions for summary decision.
- December 7, 2004 - Deadline for filing responses to motions for summary decision.
- December 21, 2004 - Complaint Counsel provides to Respondents' counsel its final proposed witness and exhibit lists, including designated testimony

to be presented by deposition, copies of all exhibits (except for demonstrative, illustrative or summary exhibits), and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.

Complaint Counsel serves courtesy copies on ALJ of its final proposed witness and exhibit lists and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.

December 24, 2004 - Parties that intend to offer into evidence at the hearing confidential materials of an opposing party or non-party must provide notice to the opposing party or non-party, pursuant to 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(b).

December 28, 2004 - Respondents' Counsel provides to Complaint Counsel its final proposed witness and exhibit lists, including designated testimony to be presented by deposition and copies of all exhibits (except for demonstrative, illustrative or summary exhibits), and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.

Respondents' Counsel serves courtesy copies of ALJ of its final proposed witness and exhibit lists and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.

December 31, 2004 - Deadline for filing motions *in limine* and motions to strike.

January 7, 2005 - Deadline for filing motions for *in camera* treatment of proposed trial exhibits.

January 20, 2005 - Exchange and serve courtesy copy of ALJ objections to final proposed witness lists and exhibit lists. Exchange objections to the

designated testimony to be presented by deposition and counter designations.

- January 25, 2005 - Exchange proposed stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity.
- January 28, 2005 - Parties file pretrial briefs.
- February 3, 2005 - File final stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity. Any subsequent stipulations may be filed as agreed by the parties.
- February 10, 2005 - Final prehearing conference to be held at 10:00 a.m. in room 532, Federal Trade Commission Building, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Washington, D.C. The parties are to meet and confer prior to the conference regarding trial logistics and proposed stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity and any designated deposition testimony. Counsel may present any objections to the final proposed witness lists and exhibits, including the designated testimony to be presented by deposition. Trial exhibits will be admitted or excluded to the extent practicable.
- February 15, 2005 - Commencement of hearing.

Complaint counsel also requests that the Additional Provisions set forth in the *Telebrands* procedural order be modified in two important respects. First, we request that the ALJ require that service on opposing counsel be made by electronic mail (formatted in Word or Acrobat) and facsimile. This is important to ensure that complaint counsel receive timely notice of filings, as materials that are mailed to the FTC are irradiated prior to delivery, a process that results in delays of up to seven (7) days. We also recommend that paragraph 5 of the Additional

Provisions be modified to provide that responses to document requests, interrogatories, and requests for admission shall be due within 10 days of service, and that objections to document requests, interrogatories, and requests for admission shall be due within 8 days of service. These provisions are appropriate given the brief time available for discovery in this matter.

Respectfully submitted,

Janet M. Evans
Division of Advertising Practices
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
601 New Jersey Avenue, N.W.
Mail drop NJ-3212
Washington, D.C. 20580
jevans@ftc.gov
(202) 326-2125
fax: (202) 326-3259

**UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION**

In the Matter of)
)
)

DYNAMIC HEALTH OF FLORIDA, LLC)
CHHABRA GROUP, LLC)
DBS LABORATORIES, LLC)
VINEET K. CHHABRA aka VINCENT K. CHHABRA, and)
JONATHAN BARASH,)
Respondents.)

Docket No. 9317

**[Proposed] ORDER REGARDING PREHEARING SCHEDULE
AND OTHER PROVISIONS**

The parties shall comply with the following schedule of proceedings in this matter:

- August 18, 2004 - Complaint Counsel provides preliminary witness list (not including experts) with description of proposed testimony.
- August 23, 2004 - Respondents' Counsel provides preliminary witness lists (not including experts) with description of proposed testimony.
- September 1, 2004 - Deadline for issuing document requests, requests for admission, interrogatories and subpoenas *duces tecum*, except for discovery for purposes of authenticity and admissibility of exhibits.
- September 8, 2004 - Complaint Counsel provides expert witness list.
- September 13, 2004 - Respondents' Counsel provides expert witness list.
- October 5, 2004 - Complaint Counsel provides expert witness reports.
- October 8, 2004 - Respondents' Counsel provides expert witness reports.

- October 14, 2004 - Close of discovery, other than discovery permitted under Rule 3.24(a)(4), depositions, and discovery for purposes of authenticity and admissibility of exhibits.
- October 20, 2004 - Complaint Counsel to identify rebuttal expert(s) and provide rebuttal expert report(s). Any such reports are to be limited to rebuttal of matters set forth in Respondents' expert reports. If material outside the scope of fair rebuttal is presented, respondents will have the right to seek appropriate relief (such as striking Complaint Counsel's rebuttal expert reports or seeking leave to submit sur-rebuttal expert reports on behalf of Respondents.)
- November 7, 2004 - Deadline for all depositions.
- November 24, 2004 - Deadline for filing motions for summary decision.
- December 7, 2004 - Deadline for filing responses to motions for summary decision.
- December 21, 2004 - Complaint Counsel provides to Respondents' counsel its final proposed witness and exhibit lists, including designated testimony to be presented by deposition, copies of all exhibits (except for demonstrative, illustrative or summary exhibits), and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.
Complaint Counsel serves courtesy copies on ALJ of its final proposed witness and exhibit lists and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.
- December 24, 2004 - Parties that intend to offer into evidence at the hearing confidential materials of an opposing party or non-party must provide notice to the opposing party or non-party, pursuant to 16 C.F.R. § 3.45(b).
- December 28, 2004 - Respondents' Counsel provides to Complaint Counsel its final proposed witness and exhibit lists, including designated testimony to be presented by deposition and copies of all exhibits (except for demonstrative, illustrative or summary exhibits), and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.
Respondents' Counsel serves courtesy copies of ALJ of its final proposed witness and exhibit lists and a brief summary of the testimony of each witness.
- December 31, 2004 - Deadline for filing motions *in limine* and motions to strike.
- January 7, 2005 - Deadline for filing motions for *in camera* treatment of proposed trial exhibits.

- January 20, 2005 - Exchange and serve courtesy copy of ALJ objections to final proposed witness lists and exhibit lists. Exchange objections to the designated testimony to be presented by deposition and counter designations.
- January 25, 2005 - Exchange proposed stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity.
- January 28, 2005 - Parties file pretrial briefs.
- February 3, 2005 - File final stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity. Any subsequent stipulations may be filed as agreed by the parties.
- February 10, 2005 - Final prehearing conference to be held at 10:00 a.m. in room 532, Federal Trade Commission Building, 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W., Washington, D.C. The parties are to meet and confer prior to the conference regarding trial logistics and proposed stipulations of law, facts, and authenticity and any designated deposition testimony. Counsel may present any objections to the final proposed witness lists and exhibits, including the designated testimony to be presented by deposition. Trial exhibits will be admitted or excluded to the extent practicable.
- February 15, 2005 - Commencement of hearing.

ADDITIONAL PROVISIONS

1. Service of all papers filed with the Commission shall be made on opposing counsel and two courtesy copies to the Administrative Law Judge by 5:00 p.m. on the designated date. Unless requested, the parties shall not serve courtesy copies on the ALJ of any papers (including discovery requests and responses) that are not required to be filed with the Office of the Secretary.

2. Service on the parties shall be **by electronic mail** (formatted in Word or Acrobat) and shall be followed promptly by delivery of a facsimile copy to the following addresses:

For Complaint Counsel:

Janet Evans
FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION
601 New Jersey Avenue, N.W.
Mail drop NJ-3212
Washington, D.C. 20580
jevans@ftc.gov
(202) 326-2125
fax: (202) 326-3259

For Respondents' Counsel:

Max Kravitz, Esq.
Kravitz & Kravitz LLC
145 East Rich Street
Columbus, OH 43215
mkravitz@kravitzlaw.net
614-464-2000
fax: 614-464-2002

3. All pleadings that cite to unpublished opinions or opinions not available on LEXIS or WESTLAW shall include such copies as exhibits.

4. Compliance with the scheduled end of discovery requires that the parties serve subpoenas and discovery requests sufficiently in advance of the discovery cut-off, that all responses and objections will be due on or before that date, unless otherwise noted. Any motion to compel responses to discovery requests shall be filed within 5 days of impasse if the parties are negotiating in good faith and are not able to resolve their dispute.

5. The parties are limited to a total of 50 document requests, 50 interrogatories, and 50 requests for admissions except that there shall be no limit on the number of requests for admission for authentication and admissibility of exhibits. There is no limit to the number of

sets of discovery requests that parties may issue, so long as the total number of each type of discovery request, including all subparts, does not exceed these limits. Additional discovery may be permitted only for good cause upon application to and approval by the Administrative Law Judge. Responses to document requests, interrogatories, and requests for admission shall be due within 10 days of service. Objections to document requests, interrogatories, and requests for admission shall be due within 8 days of service.

6. The deposition of any person may be recorded by videotape, provided that the deposing party notifies the deponent and all parties of its intention to record the deposition by videotape at least five days in advance of the deposition.

7. The parties shall serve upon one another, at the time of issuance, copies of all subpoenas *duces tecum* and subpoenas *ad testificandum*. Counsel scheduling depositions shall immediately notify all other counsel that a deposition has been scheduled.

Non-parties shall provide copies or make available for inspection and copying of documents requested by subpoena to the party issuing the subpoena. The party that has requested documents from non-parties shall provide copies of the documents received from non-parties to the opposing party within five business days of receiving the documents.

8. The preliminary and final witness lists shall represent counsels' good faith designation of all potential witnesses who counsel reasonably expect may be called in their case-in-chief.

Parties shall notify the opposing party promptly of changes in witness lists to facilitate completion of discovery within the dates of the scheduling order. The final proposed witness list may not include additional witnesses not listed in the preliminary witness lists previously exchanged unless by order of the Administrative Law Judge upon a showing of good cause.

9. The final exhibit lists shall represent counsels' good faith designation of all trial exhibits other than demonstrative, illustrative, or summary exhibits. Additional exhibits may be added after the submission of the final lists only by order of the Administrative Law Judge upon a showing of good cause.

10. At the time an expert is first listed as a witness by a party, the listing party will provide to the other party.

- (a) materials fully describing or identifying the background and qualifications of the expert, list of all publications, and all prior cases in which the expert has testified or has been deposed; and
- (b) transcripts of such testimony in the possession, custody or control of the listing party or the expert.

At the time an expert report is produced, the listing party will provide to the other party all documents and other written materials relied upon by the expert in formulating an opinion in this case.

Each expert report shall include the subject matter on which the expert is expected to testify and the substance of the facts and opinion to which the expert is expected to testify and a summary of the grounds of each opinion.

11. Applications for the issuance of subpoenas commanding a person to attend and give testimony at the adjudicative hearing must comply with 16 C.F.R. § 3.34, must demonstrate that the subject is located in the United States, and must be served on opposing counsel.

12. Witnesses shall not testify to a matter unless evidence is introduced sufficient to support a finding that the witness has personal knowledge of the matter.

13. Fact witnesses shall not be allowed to provide expert opinion.

14. Properly admitted deposition testimony is part of the record and may not be read in open court. Videotape deposition excerpts that have been admitted in evidence may be presented in open court.

15. Motions for *in camera* treatment for evidence to be introduced at trial must meet the strict standards set forth in 16 C.F.R. § 3.45 and explained in *In re Dura Lube Corp.*, 1999 FTC LEXIS 255 (Dec. 23, 1999); *In re Hoechst Marion Roussel, Inc.*, 2000 FTC LEXIS 157 (Nov. 22, 2000) and 2000 FTC LEXIS 138 (Sept. 19, 2000) and must be supported by a declaration or affidavit by a person qualified to explain the nature of the documents.

16. The procedure for marking of exhibits referred to in the adjudicative proceeding shall be as follows: both parties shall number their exhibits with a single series of consecutive numbers. Complaint Counsel's exhibits shall bear the designation CX and Respondents' exhibits shall bear the designation RX. (For example, the first exhibit shall be marked CX-1 for Complaint Counsel.) When an exhibit consists of more than one piece of paper, each page of the exhibit must bear a consecutive control number or some other consecutive page number.

17. The parties shall provide one another, and the Administrative Law Judge, no later than seventy-two hours in advance, a schedule that identifies by day the party's best estimate of the witnesses to be called to testify during the upcoming week of the hearing. The parties further shall provide one another with copies of any demonstrative exhibits twenty-four hours before they are used with a witness.

18. At the final pre-hearing conference, counsel will be required to introduce all exhibits they intend to introduce at trial. Counsel will also be required to give *the originals* of exhibits to the court reporter, which the court reporter will keep.

Ordered:

Stephen J. McGuire
Chief Administrative Law Judge

Date: July __, 2004

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I filed and served the attached **COMPLAINT COUNSEL'S MOTION REGARDING** and **SCHEDULE AND ADDITIONAL PROVISIONS** and **[Proposed] ORDER REGARDING PREHEARING SCHEDULE AND OTHER PROVISIONS** upon the following as set forth below:

Donald S. Clark
Secretary
FTC, Room 172
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, D.C. 20580
via electronic mail and hand-delivery

The Honorable Stephen J. McGuire
Chief Administrative Law Judge
FTC, Room 112
600 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, D.C. 20580
via electronic mail and facsimile

Max Kravitz, Esq.
Kravitz & Kravitz LLC
145 East Rich Street
Columbus, OH 43215
mkravitz@kravitzlawnet.com
614-464-2000
fax: 614-464-2002
via electronic mail and facsimile

Janet M. Evans