



BAY AREA
AIR QUALITY
MANAGEMENT
DISTRICT

BOARD OF DIRECTORS
PUBLIC OUTREACH COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

PATRICK KWOK – CHAIRPERSON
ERIN GARNER
YORIKO KISHIMOTO
MICHAEL SHIMANSKY
BRAD WAGENKNECHT

CAROL KLATT - VICE CHAIRPERSON
SCOTT HAGGERTY
JANET LOCKHART
JOHN SILVA

MONDAY
MARCH 19, 2007
9:30 A. M.

FOURTH FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM
DISTRICT OFFICES

AGENDA

1. **CALL TO ORDER - ROLL CALL**
2. **PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD** (Public Comment on Non-Agenda Items Pursuant to Government Code § 54954.3) *Members of the public are afforded the opportunity to speak on any agenda item. All agendas for regular meetings are posted at District headquarters, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA, at least 72 hours in advance of a regular meeting. At the beginning of the regular meeting agenda, an opportunity is also provided for the public to speak on any subject within the Committee's subject matter jurisdiction. Speakers will be limited to three (3) minutes each.*
3. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF AUGUST 30, 2006 AND OCTOBER 11, 2006**
4. **CONSIDERATION OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CONTRACTORS FOR PUBLIC OUTREACH PROGRAMS** **J.**
Roggenkamp/4646

jroggenkamp@baaqmd.gov

The Committee will consider staff recommendations on contractors for media/employer relations, advertising design, and community outreach.
5. **SPARE THE AIR TONIGHT 2006/2007 – WINTERTIME OUTREACH** **J. Colbourn/5192**
jcolbourn@baaqmd.gov

Staff will present a summary of the 2006/2007 Spare the Air Tonight wintertime outreach campaign.
6. **2007 SPARE THE AIR - SUMMER OUTREACH CAMPAIGN UPDATE** **J.**
Broadbent/5052

jbroadbent@baaqmd.gov

Staff will present a report on the recommendations for the 2007 Spare the Air summer campaign.
7. **COMMITTEE MEMBER COMMENTS/OTHER BUSINESS**
Any member of the Committee, or its staff, on his or her own initiative or in response to questions posed by the public, may: ask a question for clarification, make a brief announcement or report on his or her own activities, provide a reference to staff regarding factual information, request staff to report back at a subsequent meeting concerning any matter or take action to direct staff to place a matter of business on a future agenda. (Gov't Code § 54954.2)

8. **TIME AND PLACE OF NEXT MEETING:** 9:30 A.M., Thursday, May 3, 2007, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

**CONTACT CLERK OF THE BOARDS - 939 ELLIS STREET
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94109**

**(415) 749-4965
FAX: (415) 928-8560
BAAQMD homepage:
www.baaqmd.gov**

- To submit written comments on an agenda item in advance of the meeting.
- To request, in advance of the meeting, to be placed on the list to testify on an agenda item.
- To request special accommodations for those persons with disabilities notification to the Clerk's Office should be given at least three working days prior to the date of the meeting so that arrangements can be made accordingly.

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

Memorandum

To: Chairperson Kwok and Members
of the Public Outreach Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 1, 2007

Re: Public Outreach Committee Draft Minutes

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

Approve attached draft minutes of the Public Outreach Committee meetings of August 30, 2006 and October 11, 2006.

DISCUSSION

Attached for your review and approval are the draft minutes of the August 30, 2006 and October 11, 2006, Public Outreach Committee meetings.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

**Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 771-6000**

DRAFT MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Public Outreach Committee Meeting
9:30 a.m., Monday, August 30, 2006

- 1. Call to Order - Roll Call:** Chairperson Brad Wagenknecht called the meeting to order at 9:35 a.m.

Present: Brad Wagenknecht, Chairperson, Erin Garner (9:45 a.m.), Carol Klatt, Mark Ross, Pamela Torliatt (9:54 a.m.).

Absent: Yoriko Kishimoto, Nate Miley, John Silva.

Also Present: Scott Haggerty (9:49 a.m.), Gayle B. Uilkema.

- 2. Public Comment Period:** There were none.
- 3. Approval of Minutes of May 31, 2006:** Approval of the minutes was deferred until a quorum was present.
- 4. Spare the Air Program Overview:** *Staff updated the Committee on the 2006 Spare the Air Program and presented survey results of the Free Fare Program.*

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO introduced Karen Schkolnick, Program Manager in charge of Public Information.

Mr. Broadbent stated that it is the middle of the Spare the Air season and nine Spare the Air advisories have been issued. The Bay Area has exceeded the national 8-hour standard on 12 days as of August 30th.

Jack Colbourn, Director of Outreach and Incentives, presented the report and stated that the Air District partnered with the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) to fund the Free Fare element of the program. Region-wide, transit ridership increased by 15%. Mr. Colbourn reviewed the results of the survey taken on all Free Fare days and discussed the behaviors that people changed due to the Spare the Air advisory.

Director Erin Garner arrived at 9:45 a.m.

It was noted that emission reductions on the six Free Fare days totaled 8.20 tons. Mr. Colbourn reviewed potential refinements for the 2007 Spare the Air Program and potential funding sources.

Director Scott Haggerty arrived at 9:49 a.m.

The Committee discussed ideas for the 2007 season. Some of the topics included:

- Potential list of stationary sources that could curtail emissions on Spare the Air days, such as refineries, ports, railroads, landfills, and school buses.
- Examples included deliveries to gas stations only during certain times of the day when emissions would be lower.

Director Pamela Torliatt arrived at 9:54 a.m.

- Limiting throughput at gas stations or reducing the price of gas during certain hours of the day.
- Educating people regarding fueling their vehicles during the cooler parts of the day.
- District staff to continue to work with MTC.
- Talk to BART about reducing fares on Spare the Air days.

The Committee provided direction to staff on the items discussed. Staff will bring back recommendations to the Committee for next year's campaign at a future meeting.

Committee Action: None. This report provided for information only.

5. Update on the Youth Outreach Program: *Staff presented a report on the Youth Outreach Program.*

Mr. Colbourn presented the report and stated that the Clean Air Challenge teacher workshops will start again for the spring semester. The Clean Air Challenge curriculum is designed for sixth through twelfth grades. The in-school live theatre program, Smogzilla, that targets kindergarten through sixth grade, will also start again.

The objectives of the program are to provide schools with air quality educational programs and to connect behavior with awareness about environmental issues. The current approach customizes the educational programs for local needs and includes raising funds from corporations. The next steps include: 1) fund raising; 2) updating the Clean Air Challenge curriculum; 3) restructuring the program administration; and 4) evaluating future school programs sponsored by the District.

Director Torliatt requested staff prepare a presentation for the next Committee meeting regarding a project done at Analy High School on reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

Committee Action: None. This report provided for information only.

6. Committee Member Comments: Director Garner discussed offering a special t-shirt when people visit a District booth at an event. If they listen to a brief talk on Spare the Air, they would receive the t-shirt with the stipulation that they put the t-shirt on immediately. This would help get the message out and everyone would be wearing the t-shirt.

Director Ross thanked staff on the good job that has been done on the Spare the Air campaign.

Director Torliatt requested that staff provide an update on how many of the vendors used by the District have a Green Business Program. Brian Bunker, Legal Counsel stated that the Green Business Program is part of the RFP process and vendors receive extra points for having a Green Business Program.

3. **Approval of Minutes of May 31, 2006:** There being a quorum present, Director Uilkema moved approval of the minutes; seconded by Director Ross; carried unanimously without objection.
7. **Time and Place of Next Meeting:** At the Call of the Chair.
8. **Adjournment.** The meeting was adjourned at 10:32 a.m.

Mary Romaidis
Clerk of the Boards

**Bay Area Air Quality Management District
939 Ellis Street
San Francisco, California 94109
(415) 771-6000**

DRAFT MINUTES

Summary of Board of Directors
Public Outreach Committee Meeting
9:30 a.m., Wednesday, October 11, 2006

- 1. Call to Order - Roll Call:** Chairperson Brad Wagenknecht called the meeting to order at 9:37 a.m.

Present: Brad Wagenknecht, Chairperson, Carol Klatt, Mark Ross, Yoriko Kishimoto (9:40 a.m.).

Absent: Erin Garner, Nate Miley, John Silva, Pamela Torliatt.

Also Present: Scott Haggerty (9:51 a.m.).

- 2. Public Comment Period:** There were none.

- 3. Approval of Minutes of August 30, 2006:** There was no approval of the minutes, as there was not a quorum.

- 4. Spare the Air Tonight 2006/2007 Program Overview:** *Staff updated the Committee on the 2006/2007 Spare the Air Tonight – Wintertime Outreach Plan.*

Jack Colbourn, Director of Outreach and Incentives, introduced two new staff members Karen Schkolnick, Program Manager in charge of Public Information and Richard Lew, Community Outreach Manager.

The Spare the Air Tonight program will begin on November 20, 2006 and run through February 16, 2007. The focus of Spare the Air Tonight is to reduce Particulate Matter (PM). The messages include reducing wood burning, reducing driving and protecting public health.

The Santa Clara County wood smoke change-out program expires at the end of November, as there are no additional funds. The number of stoves that were changed out for this program was not readily available but will be presented to the Committee at the next meeting. Chairperson Wagenknecht requested that Mr. Colbourn report back to the Committee on Santa Clara County's success with their wood smoke program.

This years' kick-off event is in conjunction with the Golden State Warriors Basketball team. The partnership event will allow for at least 60 ads, which may include a halftime presentation, details are being finalized.

Director Scott Haggerty arrived at 9:51 a.m.

Staff continues to work on the adoption of the model wood smoke ordinance. PM is 1/20th the size of a human hair and can remain airborne for hours, days or weeks as well as travels deep in the lungs. The health effects may include: coughing, eye irritation, asthma trigger and heart and lung related death. You will continue to hear more about this as we roll out the program.

Advisories calling for Spare the Air Tonight varied from 11 in 1991 to 1 in 2002. EPA has established a new PM standard. Due to the new standard the threshold for calling a Spare the Air Tonight alert will be lower. Considerably more alerts may be called this year than in previous. The various sources of PM include wood burning stoves, power plants, heavy duty diesel engines, various natural sources, cars and trucks, non-road vehicles, forest fires and industrial sources.

This year the District has produced a bilingual Tip Card, providing a similar message as the PM Tip Card. The Air Resources Board (ARB) in conjunction with the District updated the Wood Burning Handbook to make it more Bay Area specific. The Spare the Air Tonight program release is scheduled for November 20, 2006, and will focus on a bigger push in the media during the major winter holidays; Thanksgiving, Christmas and New Years. Mr. Broadbent, Executive Officer, is featured in the wintertime video which provides a message that is similar to the Spare the Air Tonight message.

At present, eight counties have adopted the wood smoke ordinance. Out of 101 Bay Area cities, 41 have adopted the model ordinance. Billboards will be placed on Treasure Island; 101 in the South Bay and McAfee Park. The focus will be “don’t burn wood, “make a long-term investment in your family’s health, switch to natural gas,” “drive less,” “trip-link your errands,” and “register for Air Alerts.”

Committee Action: None. This report was provided for information only.

5. Overview of the new video Burning Cleaner, Burning Better: *Staff provided a briefing and presentation of video.*

Kelly Wee, Director of Compliance and Enforcement, presented the Burning Cleaner, Burning Better video which is a joint project with the Napa County Fire Marshall’s Office. Funding was provided by the Air District. The video will be distributed throughout the nine Bay Area counties. The main purpose of the video is to reach agriculture workers and inform them of the proper use of building better fires, demonstrating proper burning techniques in an easy to view format also with a bilingual option, and minimizing particulate matter generated from agriculture burns. California recognizes that agriculture burning is an essential activity.

The Air District’s Open Burning regulation is one of the oldest rules, adopted in 1960 and amended more than half a dozen times. As part of the Air District’s program to promote compliance assistance to help regulated parties comply with regulations, the Air District is looking towards programs to promote increased compliance in the area of open burning. The Air District has had a longstanding relationship with the California Department of Forestry (CDF); the Napa County Fire Marshall proposed that we partner with them to develop this video. Production and cost of the video which took approximately seven months to complete, at a cost of \$40,000.00.

Since agricultural burning occurs primarily in North and South areas of the Bay Area, those were the areas targeted for the outreach.

At present, 500 copies have been distributed through the Napa County Fire Agriculture Commissioner. The District is working with both Sonoma and Santa Clara Counties. It was noted that Contra Costa County and the Agriculture Commissioner has approached the Air District requesting copies. There are 2,000 videos that have been distributed county by county, as the program moves forward. This is part of a bigger project for additional outreach in open burning, as PM becomes our big concern. Future alternatives to consider would be wood chipping programs and back yard burners.

Committee Action: None. This report was provided for information only.

6. Summary of the Spare the Air – Summer 2006: *Staff presented a summary on the 2006 Spare the Air – Summer program.*

The official Spare the Air Program will come to a close on October 13, 2006. Staff presented a series of slides to the Committee that summarized what occurred over the summer. Discussions centered on ideas generated by the Committee. Staff will come back to the Committee within the next 9 months with suggested refinements to the program.

Mr. Broadbent noted that as the District moves forward, it is anticipated that a similar program in conjunction with MTC and transit providers will continue next year. The program may need to be refined and expanded in other ways, but at least it can essentially help people change their behavior or industries change practices at least for a short period time as we see lower levels of ozone during the summer.

The District is currently working on refining forecasting abilities. Due to the fact that the metrological conditions in the Bay Area are constantly changing, there were days that were expected to exceed standards and did not and then there were instances when there was not a Spare the Air called and there were exceedances.

Committee Action: None. This report was provided for information only.

7. Committee Member Comments: The Committee directed staff to agendize “Safe Routes to School” at a future meeting.

8. Time and Place of Next Meeting: At the Call of the Chair.

9. Adjournment. The meeting was adjourned at 10:35 a.m.

Vanessa Johnson
Executive Secretary

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Chairperson Kwok and Members
of the Public Outreach Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 7, 2007

Re: Recommendations for Contractors for Public Outreach Programs

RECOMMENDED ACTION

Consider recommending Board of Directors' approval for the contracts that assist with public outreach including the following:

- Community Outreach - Community Focus not to exceed \$180,000
- Advertising Design and Production - O'Rorke not to exceed \$400,000
- Media Relations and Employer Program - Allison & Partners not to exceed \$780,000

BACKGROUND

The Air District's Outreach and Incentives Division relies on contractors to assist with various aspects of its public affairs and outreach programs. The Division recently completed a Request for Proposal (RFP) process to solicit responses for three (3) contracts: Community Outreach, Advertising Design and Production, and Media Relations and Employer Program.

- **Community Outreach:** To continue to manage eight resource teams comprised of representatives of environmental groups, businesses, public agencies, environmental and health organizations, and other interested parties to achieve specific Air District goals.
- **Advertising Design and Production:** To develop professional quality broadcast and print advertising/educational materials for a variety of District programs.
- **Media Relations and Employer Program Management Services:** To provide media relations services and employer program management services and promote agency activities.

DISCUSSION

RFPs were released on February 1, 2007 and responses were due on February 13, 2007. On that date, three responses were received for both the Community Outreach and the Media Relations and Employer Program RFPs. Since only one response was received for the Advertising Design and Production RFP, staff re-released the RFP from February 20th through February 26th. A total of two proposals were received for the Advertising Design and Production RFP.

This year the Division has streamlined the contracts to save money and provide greater flexibility in contractor services to include climate change and wood smoke outreach. The contracts will have a term of twelve months, which may be extended for a second term of twelve months at the District’s sole discretion. After evaluating proposals, conducting interviews and checking references, staff recommends the Board approve the following contracts:

Community Outreach – Community Focus has experience facilitating eight community based teams in the Bay Area. They have demonstrated experience working with Bay Area grassroots teams to form partnerships around a variety of issues. Staff recommends that Community Focus be awarded the Community Outreach contract (see Table 1).

Advertising Design and Production - O’Rorke has a solid background in social marketing and advertising. They have experience working with local government agencies to produce television, radio and print advertisements. Staff recommends that O’Rorke be awarded the Advertising Design and Production contract (see Table 2).

Media Relations and Employer Program Management Services - Allison & Partners has strong expertise in media relations, an extensive network of media contacts, and direct experience recruiting employers and schools. Staff recommends that Allison & Partners be awarded the Media Relations and Employer Program Management Services contract (see Table 3).

EVALUATION

Creative Criteria/Proposal. This category evaluated the responsiveness of the proposal clearly stating an understanding of the work to be performed and comprehensiveness of the proposal to address the objective. This category also evaluated the overall experience and accomplishments of the consulting team and project management staffing.

Cost Proposal. Costs were evaluated for adequacy in relation to the outlined scope of the project.

Green Operating Practices and Local Businesses. The District supports green operating practices and local businesses and gives a preference to local businesses engaged in green business practices. Proposals were evaluated to determine the extent of bidder’s commitment to environmentally sound operational practices.

The scoring and total points for each of the RFP’s criteria is contained in the following tables.

**Table 1
Community Outreach Services**

Evaluative Criteria	PMC	Techlaw	Community Focus
Proposal (25 points)	12.5	19.5	23
Community Outreach Expertise (25 points)	19	18.5	21.5
Project Management Staffing (15 points)	11	11	11.5
Cost Proposal (25 points)	13	16	17.5
Green Operating Practices (5 points)	2.5	3.5	4
Local Businesses (5 points)	2.5	3	4.5
Total Points	60.5	71.5	82

Table 2
Advertising Design and Production Services

Evaluative Criteria	O'Rorke, Inc	Gigantic Idea Studio
Proposal (25 points)	23	10
Creative Expertise (15 points)	14	6
Project Management Staffing (10 points)	9	5.5
Previous Experience (10 points)	9.5	5
Cost Proposal (30 points)	25	25
Green Operating Practices (5 points)	5	3.5
Local Businesses (5 points)	3.5	3.25
Total Points	89	58.25

Table 3
Media Relations and Employer Program Management Services

Evaluative Criteria	O'Rorke, Inc	Allison & Partners	Fleishman Hillard
Proposal (25 points)	22	23	16.5
Media Expertise (15 points)	12	13	9.5
Project Management Staffing (10 points)	5.5	8.5	7
Previous Experience (10 points)	8	8.5	7
Cost Proposal (30 points)	21	27.5	23.5
Green Operating Practices (5 points)	5	4.5	3.5
Local Businesses (5 points)	3.5	3.5	3
Total Points	79	88	70

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

Funding for activities conducted from March 2007 through June 30, 2007 was included in the current budget. Activities after July 1, 2007 will be included in the FY 2007/08 budget. The funding for the activities covered by these contracts comes from three sources. Federal funding includes a \$1 million Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (CMAQ) grant. Local funding is through the Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) program. The remaining portion of the funds is from General Revenues.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Karen Schkolnick
Reviewed by: Jack M. Colbourn

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Chairperson Kwok and Members
of the Public Outreach Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 7, 2007

Re: Spare the Air Tonight 2006/2007 – Wintertime Outreach Program Summary

RECOMMENDED ACTION

For information only.

BACKGROUND

Staff will present a summary of the Air District's wintertime outreach campaign. The campaign began on November 20, 2006 and ended on February 16, 2007. During this season the District issued 30 Spare the Air Tonight advisories, the highest number on record.

DISCUSSION

The US EPA adopted more stringent Particulate Matter (PM_{2.5}) standards last September, lowering the national 24-hour standard from 65 micrograms/m³ down to 35 micrograms/m³. In response to this more protective health-based standard, and sustained periods of dry and cold weather, the District issued a total of 30 Spare the Air Tonight advisories. Preliminary monitoring data reports 27 exceedances of the revised national 24-hour health-based PM_{2.5} standard.

The Outreach and Incentives Division conducted outreach efforts to increase public awareness about the sources of wintertime air pollution and to promote the Clean Air Choices individuals can make to protect air quality.

News Media

The campaign generated approximately 91 print and 240 television and radio stories, resulting in an estimated 16,677,701 media impressions with a comparable ad value of \$558,880. This was the most media coverage received in the history of the Spare the Air Tonight program. The outreach program also targeted asthma and health clinics and employer partners.

Paid and Free Advertising

- Kick-off event in partnership with the Golden State Warriors held on November 20th with more than 60 radio spots airing on KNBR November through March.
- Video commercial featuring Executive Officer aired 312 times on local cable stations.
- Thirty-one radio ads ran on KLLC-FM and Star FM and 40 spots on KMKY-AM during Thanksgiving week.
- Silicon Valley 101 billboard in December and January and a banner placed on Treasure Island in January.

Surveys

Surveys were conducted each day after a Spare the Air Tonight episode. This season, 988 surveys were completed. The purpose of the survey was to gauge the public's attitude and behavior with respect to burning wood, their awareness of the Spare the Air Tonight program, and the impact the program has had on awareness, opinions and behavior relevant to particulate matter, burning wood, and air quality. The following are highlights of the survey results:

- 74 percent of Bay Area adults perceive that there are negative health effects associated with breathing wood smoke.
- 24 percent of respondents indicated that their neighborhood periodically experiences air pollution from wood smoke.
- 45 percent of households in the District contain at least one wood burning device.
- 50 percent of all households that burn wood indicate that they primarily do so for ambiance rather than heat.
- Nearly 9 percent of households with at least one wood-burning heating device were "reducer" households. These reported not burning any wood or a reduction in burning wood this winter because of the Spare the Air Tonight campaign/air quality information, or because of health concerns paired with having encountered Spare the Air Tonight campaign information.
- 56 percent of respondents had heard, read or seen a news story, advertisement, and/or public service announcement about Spare the Air this winter.
- The proportion of those who had a favorable opinion (as opposed to a neutral or a negative opinion) climbed to 55 percent for the District and 72 percent for the Spare the Air Tonight campaign as compared with the 2005 results of 51 percent and 64 percent, respectively.

Air Alerts and Website

- Historically, AirAlerts registration decrease in the wintertime. However, during this season AirAlerts reached an all time high with over 47,000 registrants, an increase from the 2006 summertime count of 40,000.
- The www.sparetheair.org web page was updated following each advisory.

BUDGET CONSIDERATIONS/FINANCIAL IMPACT

Funding for the campaign was included in the 2006-07 budget.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Luna Salaver
Reviewed by: Karen Schkolnick/Jack M. Colbourn

BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT
Memorandum

To: Chairperson Kwok and Members
of the Public Outreach Committee

From: Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Date: March 7, 2007

Re: 2007 Spare the Air - Summer Campaign Update

RECOMMENDED ACTION

For information only.

BACKGROUND

The Spare the Air program was established in 1991 to educate the public about air pollution and to promote long-term individual behavior changes that improve air quality. The 2006 Spare the Air campaign was the most successful to date in terms of public recognition and public participation. In addition, the expansion of the free transit program in 2006 to include 26 operators and six full free transit days provided an opportunity to explore the region-wide impact of the free transit incentive.

Suggestions for future improvement were received from the transit partners, media, public and District Board members. In consideration of this stakeholder feedback, staff has developed the following program refinements for 2007:

- Focus message on promotion of clean air choices and positive, long-term behavior change;
- Increase program measurement to begin the process of estimating long-term behavior change and assessing long-term program impact;
- Expand program to include private partners; and
- Refine free transit incentive to include four (4) full-day rides on regional bus systems and the same number of partial-day commutes on BART, Caltrain and the ferries.

DISCUSSION

The program cost-effectiveness reported by the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) was \$410,800/ton compared to \$60,000 to \$100,000/ton reported by the District. This large discrepancy originated in a difference in methodology used by each agency: MTC's methodology only covers emission reductions for the six days of free transit, while the District's includes on-going reductions estimated over a twelve-month period. The cost-effectiveness further improves to \$7,300 to \$12,000/ton when only District TFCA-funding is considered.

Staff proposes to increase the frequency of surveying to include non-Spare the Air days. Other measurement tools will also be employed to ensure that data collection is sufficient for beginning to

estimate long-term behavior change, which is the main objective of the Spare the Air program, and more accurately determining cost-effectiveness.

For the 2007 season, MTC has approved \$7.5 million in funding for the free transit incentive program. While the bus operators prefer a full day of free rides, Caltrain, BART and the ferries experienced operational and security problems (unruly youth and delayed trains and ferries) that they associated with full-day free rides. Caltrain, BART and ferries have opted to offer free transit for partial-days. To cover the remaining cost of four days of free rides (full-day and partial-day), the District will need to provide \$1.0 million in TFCA funds.

Staff is exploring opportunities to partner with the private sector and pursue incentives and funding to augment this summer's and future campaigns.

BUDGET CONSIDERATION/FINANCIAL IMPACT

Funding for Spare the Air activities from March 2007, through June 30, 2007, was included in the current budget. Activities after July 1, 2007, will be included in the proposed FY 2007/08 budget. The largest source of funding for the program comes from the Congestion Mitigation Air Quality (CMAQ) program. Federal funding includes a \$1 million CMAQ grant which is administered locally by Caltrans on behalf of the Federal Highway Administration. Local funding is through the Transportation Fund for Clean Air (TFCA) program. The remaining non-motor vehicle portion of the funds is from General Revenues.

Respectfully submitted,

Jack P. Broadbent
Executive Officer/APCO

Prepared by: Luna Salaver
Reviewed by: Karen Schkolnick/Jack M. Colbourn