

**BAY AREA AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT  
939 ELLIS STREET  
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA 94109  
(415) 771-6000**

**APPROVED MINUTES**

Summary of Board of Directors  
Mobile Source Committee Meeting  
9:30 a.m., Thursday, May 20, 2004

1. **Call to Order – Roll Call:** Chairperson Shelia Young called the meeting to order at 9:45 a.m.

**Roll Call:** Shelia Young, Chairperson; Roberta Cooper, Julia Miller, Pam Torliatt.

**Absent:** Jerry Hill, Jake McGoldrick, John Silva, Tim Smith.

**Also Present:** Scott Haggerty.

2. **Public Comment Period:** There were no public comments.
3. **Approval of Minutes of April 8, 2004:** Director Miller moved approval of the minutes; seconded by Director Cooper; carried unanimously without objection.
4. **Direct Mail Service Contractor Selection for the Vehicle Buy-Back Program:** *The Committee considered recommending Board of Directors approval of Ad Mail as the contractor for the FY 2003/2004 Vehicle Buy-Back Program direct mail service provider and authorization to the Executive Officer to execute a contract for up to \$90,000 to provide such service.*

Vanessa Mongeon, Environmental Planner, presented the report and reviewed the Vehicle Buy-Back (VBB) Program and stated that direct mail is the most effective method of generating participation in the VBB Program. Ms. Mongeon reviewed the bid proposal process and the criteria used to select the direct mail service provider. Ms. Mongeon noted that the quality of the sample letterhead and envelopes from Ad Mail were superior to the samples submitted by the other two low-bidders. Based on the evaluation of the proposals, staff recommends Board approval of Ad Mail for the fiscal year 2003/2004 direct mail services. In addition, staff recommends the Board authorize the Executive Officer to execute a contract for up to \$90,000 with Ad Mail, with the option to renew the contract for one additional year. In response to a question from Director Miller, Ms. Mongeon stated that the cost of postage is included in the bid price.

**Committee Action:** Director Cooper moved that the Committee recommend the Board approve the staff recommendations as stated above; seconded by Director Torliatt.

Chairperson Young noted that there is only a few thousand dollars difference between the three low bidders and since the quality of the letterhead was one of the deciding factors, she requested that, in

the future, staff provide the Committee with samples of the letterhead if it becomes an issue. The motion then carried unanimously without objection.

##### **5. Proposed Modifications to the California Air Resources Board Fleet Rule for Transit**

**Agencies:** *The Committee considered recommending Board of Directors' approval of comments on proposed modifications to the Air Resources Board's fleet rule for transit agencies.*

Juan Ortellado, Grants Programs Manager, presented the report and provided background information on the fleet rule, which was adopted by the California Air Resources Board (CARB) in February 2000 and amended in 2002. The purpose of the rule is to reduce emissions from transit buses [mainly oxides of nitrogen (NO<sub>x</sub>) and particulate matter (PM<sub>10</sub>)]. The amendment made in October 2002 added test procedure for CARB certification of hybrid electric buses. The rule also adopts a zero-emission bus (ZEB) rule demonstration program that is applicable to agencies with more than 200 buses on the diesel compliance path. Mr. Ortellado stated that the five transit agencies that are eligible for the ZEB demonstration program are located in the Bay Area. All the transit agencies, except MUNI, have chosen fuel-cell powered buses to comply with the ZEB rule.

New buses can comply by the diesel compliance path, or by alternative fuel path. In California, 44 out of more than 70 transit agencies have elected the diesel compliance path. In-use fleet buses are required to achieve a fleet-wide NO<sub>x</sub> emissions average and to reduce PM<sub>10</sub> emissions by a specified percent from a 2002 baseline fleet average. All of the Bay Area transit operators meet the fleet-wide NO<sub>x</sub> average requirements and are implementing the PM<sub>10</sub> requirements. Mr. Ortellado reviewed the 2004-2006 standards for new buses.

Mr. Ortellado noted that there are no certified diesel bus engines that meet the 2004-2006 NO<sub>x</sub> standard, but that the diesel engines with filters meet the PM<sub>10</sub> standard. The gasoline hybrid and natural gas bus engines meet both the 2004-2006 NO<sub>x</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> standards. Transit agencies on the diesel path can purchase alternative fuel buses. The ZEB rule has not been implemented because ZEBs are not readily available and they are more expensive in low volume.

CARB is proposing to modify the fleet rule to: 1) add 2004-2006 diesel hybrid electric buses (HEB) standards; 2) have CARB approve each diesel HEB purchase; 3) require emission reduction to offset the difference between diesel HEBs NO<sub>x</sub> certification emission and the current NO<sub>x</sub> standard; 4) reduce ZEB demonstration program to three buses per project; and 5) revise the start of the ZEB demonstration project to February 28, 2006.

Staff supports the proposed changes to the current rule, including offering a range of compliance options for those transit agencies on the diesel compliance path. Staff also recommends that the ARB rule require transit operators to further reduce NO<sub>x</sub> emissions through replacement, repowers, and retrofits. Staff recommends Board approval of staff comments on CARB's proposed modifications to the Public Transit Bus Fleet Regulation. Upon Board approval, District staff will be providing written comments to CARB before their June 24<sup>th</sup> meeting.

Jack Broadbent, Executive Officer/APCO added that transit situation in the Bay Area is unique and that is one reason the transit agencies are taking the diesel path. Transit agencies in other areas of California, such as Sacramento and Los Angeles, have invested in compressed natural gas (CNG) vehicles.

The following individuals came forward to speak on this agenda item:

Marty Meller  
San Francisco MUNI  
San Francisco, CA 94107

Gene Walker  
Golden Gate Bridge Highway  
& Transportation District  
San Rafael, CA 94901

José Cisneros  
San Francisco MUNI  
San Francisco, CA 94103

Sam Altshuler  
Pacific Gas & Electric  
San Francisco, CA

Mr. Cisneros presented a graph that indicates MUNI reduced PM emission 88% between 1997 and 2003.

There was discussion on the use of biodiesel engines as an alternative for agencies on the diesel compliance path and it was noted that several agencies are looking at them as an alternative. There was also discussion on the formation of NO<sub>2</sub> emissions, and the resulting health effects, when buses are retrofitted with the after treatment devices. Peter Hess, Deputy APCO, stated that when the District's comment letter is sent to CARB, the letter could request that CARB look at the NO<sub>2</sub> issue to make sure there are no health issues.

**Committee Action:** Director Torliatt moved that the Committee recommend the Board approve the staff comments on CARB's proposed modifications to the Public Transit Bus Fleet Regulation, including the additional comments on the need for consideration by CARB of the potential health effects of NO<sub>2</sub> emissions and the certification of bio-diesel fuel; seconded by Director Cooper; carried unanimously without objection.

**6. Referral from Committee:**

Staff reported on the referral from the April 8, 2004 Committee meeting.

**Committee Action:** None. This report provided for information only.

**7. Committee Member Comments.** Director Torliatt reported on the Bike to Work events in Petaluma and noted that there was an emphasis on bike safety.

**8. Time and Place of Next Meeting:** 9:30 a.m. Thursday, June 10, 2004, 939 Ellis Street, San Francisco, CA 94109

**9. Adjournment:** 10:41 a.m.

*/s/ Mary Romaidis*

Mary Romaidis  
Clerk of the Boards