

Modern Medicine Seminar:

MEDICAL KNOWLEDGE/MEDICAL JUDGEMENT

101-458A

Prof. G. Weisz

Don G. Bates Seminar Room

3647 Peel #101

McGILL UNIVERSITY VALUES ACADEMIC INTEGRITY. THEREFORE ALL STUDENTS MUST UNDERSTAND THE MEANING AND CONSEQUENCES OF CHEATING, PLAGIARISM AND OTHER ACADEMIC OFFENCES UNDER THE CODE OF STUDENT CONDUCT AND DISCIPLINARY PROCEDURES (see www.mcgill.ca/integrity for more information).

COURSE REQUIREMENTS

All students should have taken History 349A. It is recommended that they have also taken a second course in medical history.

Students will be required to write a term paper of 20-25 pages in length on a topic related to medical judgment, broadly conceived. In several weeks you will receive a handout explaining how to go about preparing this essay. This paper will count for 70 % of your final grade.

Class participation will count for 30%. Participation includes attendance; performance of assigned tasks - notably one oral report analyzing a specific set of readings - and contribution to discussions.

The readings in this course are meant to provide an understanding of selected topics in the history of medical knowledge and judgement. Medical judgement includes a vast

number of elements ranging from the ability to diagnose patients and prescribe remedies, to patient choice of practitioners, to governmental decisions about environmental safety. The papers we will read discuss some of these issues and, at the same time, exemplify different approaches and methodologies in the field of medical history. In most units there is a final reading that is a primary historical source. That means that it has been written by historical actors rather than historians. These kinds of sources provide the basis for all historical interpretation. The readings are available in the form of a course pack that can be purchased at the McGill Bookstore.

For a more general framework for understanding the history of medicine we rely on History 349A. You should at some point look over the materials from this latter course.

In this seminar we will focus particularly on understanding readings. Each week one student will present a 15 to 20 minute introduction to the readings. This should describe the central themes of the texts discussed and their relationships to each other and to earlier texts that we have read. You will be provided with guidelines for preparing these presentations. Focus questions for all the readings will be on the course page in WebCT and ALL students will be expected to answer them.

One of the main goals of this course is to teach you how to read historical articles.

Students should look at this web page on a regular basis (at a minimum every Tuesday) as I will regularly be adding material to it. You should also check the email associated with this page

Schedule of Readings

Session 1 - Sept. 4 : Medical Judgement: Breast Implant film

NO READINGS

Session 2 - Sept. 11: General Perspectives on Traditional Medicine

Charles S. Rosenberg, "The Therapeutic Revolution," *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 20(1977), 485-506.

K. Codell Carter, *The Rise of Causal Concepts of Disease* (2003), 10-23

N.D. Jewson, "Medical Knowledge and the Patronage System in 18th Century England," *Sociology*, 8(1974), 369-85.

PRIMARY TEXT: Richard Blackmore, *A Discourse Upon the Plague* (1722), 7-11.

Session 3 - Sept. 18 : THE 18TH-CENTURY – Diagnosis and Therapy

Shapin, Steven, "Trusting George Cheyne: Scientific Expertise, Common Sense, and Moral Authority in Early Eighteenth-Century Dietetic Medicine" *Bulletin of the History of Medicine*, 77(2003), 263-97.

Laurence Brockliss, *A Consultation by Letter in Early Eighteenth-century France, @ in French Medical Culture in the 19th Century*(1994), 79-117

Malcolm Nicholson, "The Art of Diagnosis: Medicine and the Five Senses," in Companion Encyclopedia of the History of Medicine, eds. W.F. Bynum and Roy Porter, (1993), vol. 2, 801-823

PRIMARY TEXT: G. Armstrong, An Essay on the Diseases most Fatal to Infants (1771), 78-84.

Session 4 – Sept. 25 : The Paris School, Modes of Reasoning

G. Weisz, "Academic Debate and Therapeutic Reasoning," in The Medical Mandarins: The French Academy of Medicine in the 19th and 20th Centuries (1995), chapter 7, 159-188

J.V. Pickstone, "Museumological Science? The Place of the Analytical /Comparative in Nineteenth Century Medicine," Hist. Sc., 32(1994) 111-138

Alex Dracoby, "Ethics and Experimentation on Human Subjects in Mid-Nineteenth-Century France: The History of the 1859 Syphilis Experiments," Bull. Hist. Med.

PRIMARY TEXT: Claude Bernard, Experimental Medicine (1949) pp.15-19, 112-115
129-40

Session 5 – Oct. 2: Epidemiological Judgement

E. Ackerknecht, "Anticontagionism between 1821 and 1867," *Bull. Hist. Med.*, 22(1948), 562-93

E.A. Heaman, "The Rise and Fall of Anticontagionism in France," *Can. Bull. of Med. Hist.*, 12(1995), 3-25.

C. Hamlin, "Predisposing Causes and Public Health in Early 19th-Century Medical Thought," *Soc. Hist. Med.*, 5(1992), 43-70.

PRIMARY TEXT: Report of the Commission Appointed by the Sanitary Board of the City Councils to Visit Canada (1832), 5-18, 36-37.

Session 6 – Oct. 9: Bacteriological Science

Nancy Tomes, *The Gospel of Germs: Men, Women and the Microbe in American Life* (1998), 23-47 (notes: 275-281).

Michael Worboys, *Spreading Germs: Disease Theories and Medical Practice in Britain, 1865-1900* (2000), 193-221, 227-233.

Bert Hansen, *A New Images of a New Medicine: Visual Evidence for the Widespread Popularity of Therapeutic Discoveries in America after 1885*, @ *Bull. Hist. Med.* 73(1999), 629-678.

PRIMARY TEXT: A Pasteur and Hervieux on Puerperal Fever, @ in *Childbed Fever: A Documentary History*, ed., Irvine Loudon (1995), 109-122.

Session 7 – Oct. 16 : : Judging Women

Carroll Smith-Rosenberg and Charles Rosenberg, "The Female Animal: Medical and Biological View of Women and her Role in Nineteenth-Century America," *J. of Amer. Hist.*, 60(1973), 332-356

R. M. Morantz and S. Zschoche, "Professionalism, Feminism, and Gender Roles: A Comparative Study of Nineteenth-Century Medical Therapeutics," *J. Amer. Hist.*, 67(1980), 568-588.

Susan E. Bell "Changing Ideas: The Medicalization of Menopause," *Soc. Sc. Med.*, 24(1987), 535-542.

PRIMARY TEXT: Goodel, W., *Lessons in Gynecology* (1887), 190-199, 526-543

Session 8–Oct. 23 : Objectifying Diseases

Stanley Joel Reiser, "The Science of Diagnosis: Diagnosis Technology, in *Companion Encyclopedia of the History of Medicine*, eds. W.F. Bynum and Roy Porter, (1993), vol. 2, 826-851

Peitzman, Steven J., "From Dropsy to Bright's Disease to End-stage Renal Disease," *Milbank Quarterly*, 67 (1989):16-32.

Thomas Schlich, "Changing Disease Identities: Cretinism, Politics and Surgery (1844-1892), *Medical History* 38(1994), 421-223

PRIMARY TEXT: Jerome Groopman, "Hurting All Over," *The New Yorker*, Nov. 13, 2000, 78-92.

Collection of scientific abstracts on fibromyalgia.

Session 9– Oct. 30 : From Counting to Clinical Trials

J. Rosser Matthews, *Quantification and the Quest for Medical Certainty* (1995), 86-114 (notes:165-169).

Harry Marks, *A Trust and Mistrust in the Marketplace: Statistics and Clinical Research, 1945-1960* @ *History of Science*, 38(2000), 343-355.

Marc Berg, "Turning a Practice into a Science: Reconceptualizing Postwar Medical Practice," *Social Studies of Science*, 25(1995), 437-76.

PRIMARY TEXT:

Evidence-Based Medicine: A New Approach to Teaching the Practice of Medicine, @ *JAMA* 268(1992), non-paginated.

Collection of Articles on Evidence-based Medicine

Session 10–Nov. 6 : Human Experimentation-I

Susan Lederer, *Subjected to Science: Human Experimentation in America before the Second World War*, (1995), xiii-xvi, 1-26.

Jenny Hazelgrove, “The Old Faith and the New Science: The Nuremberg Code and Human Experimentation Ethics in Britain,” *Soc. Hist. Med.*, 15(2002), 109-136.

Roger Cooter, “The Ethical Body,” in *Companion to Medicine in the Twentieth Century*, eds., R.Cooter and J. Pickstone (2003), 451-468.

PRIMARY TEXT: A Selected Letters Between the United States Public Health Service, the Macon County Health Department and the Tuskegee Institute, 1932-1972, @ in *Tuskegee=s Truths: Rethinking the Tuskegee Syphilis Study*, ed. Susan Reverby (2000), 73-109.

Session 11 – Nov. 13 : Clinical Trials and Social Contexts

Harry Marks, *The Progress of Experiment: Science and Therapeutic Reform in the United States, 1900-1990* (1997) 197-228.

Steven Epstein, “Activism, Drug Relation, and the Politics of Therapeutic Evaluation in the AIDs era: A Case Study of ddc and the ‘Surrogate Markers’ Debate,” *Social Studies of Science*, 27(1997), 691-726

Pat Kaufert, "Women and the Debate Over Mammography: And Economic, Political and Moral History," in *Gender and Health: An International Perspective*, eds., C.R. Sargent and C. B. Brettel, (1996)

Primary Text: Ted J. Kaptchuk, *A Powerful Placebo: The Dark Side of the Randomised Controlled Trial*, @ *The Lancet*, 351(1998), 65-68.

D. Smith et al., "Fatal Imbalance: The Crisis in Research and Development for Drugs for Neglected Diseases," *Médecins Sans Frontières*, Vol. 2001, Sept. edition.

Jon Thomson et. al., *The Olivieri Report*, CAUT Series (2001), 3-15.

Session 12]—Nov.20:

Gevitz, Norman, "Unorthodox Medical Systems," in *Companion Encyclopedia of the History of Medicine*, vol. 1, eds. W.F. Bynum, and R. Porter (1993), 603-633.

Charles Rosenberg, *Holism in Twentieth-Century Medicine*, @ in C. Lawrence and G. Weisz, *Greater than the Whole: Holism in Western Biomedicine, 1920-1950* (1998), 335-356.

David Cantor, "The Diseased Body," in *Companion to Medicine in the Twentieth Century*, eds., Roger Cooter and John Pickstone (2003), 347-83.

Primary Text:

Reed Abelson and Patrician Lee Brown, "Alternative Medicine is Finding its Niche in Nation's Hospitals," *New York Times*, April 15 2002.

Su Mason, et al., "Evaluating Complementary Medicine: Methodological Challenges of Randomised Controlled Trials," *Br. Med. J.*, 325(2002), 832-34.

Karen Adams et al., "Ethical Considerations of Complementary and Alternative Medical Therapies in Conventional Medical Settings," *Annals of Internal Medicine* 137(2002), 660-64

Session 13 – Nov. 27: Discussion of Term Papers