

1090 History of Public Health in the United States

Time: Mondays 5:50-7:40 p.m. Autumn 2001

Faculty: Dr. Anne-Emanuelle Birn

Summary

This seminar explores the social history of medical care and public health from the perspective of patients, providers, researchers, activists, government officials, educators, managers, and community enclaves. Major discussion themes include: conceptions and constructions of health and disease; the origins of modern public health; the Flexner Report and the organization of scientific medicine; AIDS and the history of epidemics; the interplay of race/ethnicity, gender, class and health care; the changing social role and function of the hospital; imperialism and public health; and the role of government in the organization and financing of health services.

Objectives

1. To become familiar with a sample of recent scholarship on the social history of health care.
2. To increase the ability to think critically about basic assumptions and conceptual frameworks in analyzing health issues, past and present.
3. To develop the ability to view contemporary problems in historical perspective.
4. To develop skills in oral presentations and debate and in writing about historical issues.

Email and University Portal System Requirement

All students must have a working e-mail address and check it regularly (i.e., 2-3 times per week). This course will also use the new on-line portal system. Be sure to register at www.dialnsa.edu/newacct and enter your name and NSU ID number.

Organization

Approximately half of the class meetings will be devoted to a lecture providing background information and analysis of the topic, followed by group discussion. The other meetings will run as seminars. Students are asked to read approximately 60 pages per week (on average 1 hour of reading) and prepare a 1-page discussion of the readings to be handed in at each class. The success of the discussions will depend on everyone doing at least the minimum reading required.

During the course of the semester, each member of the class will take responsibility for introducing two of the articles with a brief oral report (not more than 10 minutes); a one-page outline of the presentation must be prepared for distribution in the class. These reports should raise specific questions for group discussion and should not be simply a summary of the material. Normally, two or three presentations will be made at each discussion meeting. Students may work together on their in-class presentations.

Additional Assignments

1a) There will be a take-home examination, to be given out in class on Monday December 3, 2001. Exam papers are due at the beginning of class on Monday **December 17, 2001**.

1b) Students may write a 20 page research paper in lieu of the take-home examination. Students interested in writing a research paper must meet with me **by** Monday October 15, 2001 to discuss the topic and source materials. Research papers are due at the same time as the exam.

2) Students are also required to visit a museum in the New York area that examines some aspect of the social history of health and disease. Examples include the Museum of Immigration on Ellis Island, the Tenement Museum on the Lower East Side, the Museum of the City of New York, the Museo del Barrio in East Harlem, and the old smallpox hospital on Roosevelt Island. Students will be required to write a 2-page paper linking the visit to class discussions and readings. This assignment is due **November 26, 2001**.

Grades:

30 percent	exam/final paper
15	museum paper
25	in-class presentation
30	overall participation in seminars/weekly discussion papers

Books: Course books may be purchased at Barnes & Noble Bookstore, textbook section, 18th St. and 5th Ave. (Tel 212-675-5500). **The books will also be available on reserve at Fogelman Library.**

Required:

Judith Walzer Leavitt and Ronald Numbers, editors. Sickness and Health in America: Readings in the History of Medicine and Public Health. Third edition, revised. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1997.

Recommended:

Susan Sontag. Illness as Metaphor & AIDS and its Metaphors. New York: Anchor Books, 1990.

Arthur Miller. An Enemy of the People: An Adaptation of the Play by Henrik Ibsen. New York: Penguin Books, 1979.

Readings: **The required journal article readings are available as a packet of photocopied materials. Please note that the chapters assigned from the required books will NOT be included in the package of photocopied articles. The packet may be purchased from Unique Copy Center at 74 5th Ave. (Tel. 924-9792). Be sure to bring the course name and number (and my name) with you when you go to the copy store (hours: Mon. -Thurs. 8 am - 11 pm; Fri. 8 am - 10 pm; Sat./Sun. 10 am - 8 pm). The photocopied materials will also be available in Fogelman Library (basement of 65 5th Ave.), where you may photocopy them yourself. Supplementary materials may also be handed out in class during the course of the semester.**

Background Those of you who would like to begin by reading some basic texts in the history of medicine and public health should consult:

Dorothy Porter. Health, Civilization, and the State: A History of Public Health from Ancient to Modern Times. New York: Routledge, 1999.

George Rosen. A History of Public Health. Expanded edition with an Introduction by Elizabeth Fee and Biographical Essay and New Bibliography by Edward T. Morman. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1993.

John Duffy. The Sanitarians: A History of American Public Health. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1990.

Paul Starr. The Social Transformation of American Medicine. New York: Basic Books, 1982.

Schedule of Classes

1. **September 10, 2001 Introduction: Historical Methods and Perspectives**

Required Reading:

- * Charles E. Rosenberg, "Framing Disease: Illness, Society, and History," in Framing Disease: Studies in Cultural History, Charles E. Rosenberg and Janet Golden, eds., New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1992, pp. xiii-xxvi.
- * Elizabeth Fee, "Henry E. Sigerist: His Interpretations of the History of Disease and the Future of Medicine," in Framing Disease: Studies in Cultural History, Charles E. Rosenberg and Janet Golden, eds., New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1992, pp. 297-317.

Study Questions:

1. What are some of the tools that can help us analyze sickness from a historical perspective?
2. How might we reconcile scientific and cultural understandings of disease?
3. In what ways was Sigerist influenced by the historical moment?

2. **September 17 (date subject to change) Medical Care in the Nineteenth Century U.S. (Lecture)**

Required reading:

- * David Rosner, "Health Care for the 'Truly Needy': Nineteenth-Century Origins of the Concept," Health and Society, 60, 1982, pp. 355-385.
 - * Charles E. Rosenberg, "The Therapeutic Revolution: Medicine and Social Change in 19th-Century America," Sickness and Health in America, 2nd edition, ed. Judith Leavitt and Ronald Numbers, Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1985, pp. 39-52.
 - * Nancy Krieger, "Shades of Difference: Theoretical Underpinnings of the Medical Controversy on Black/White Differences in the United States, 1830-1870," International Journal of Health Services, 17, 1987, pp. 259-278.
- * **Starred articles are in packet of photocopied readings.**

Study Questions:

1. In the 19th century who got what kind of medical care and why?
2. How did the notions of patient and sickness change over time?

3. September 24 Conceptions of Disease (Seminar)

Required reading (three of the following):

Susan Sontag. Illness as Metaphor and AIDS and Its Metaphors. New York: Anchor Books, 1990, pp. 3-88.

- * Anne-Emanuelle Birn. A Six Seconds Per Eyelid: The Medical Inspection of Immigrants at Ellis Island, 1892-1914. @ Dynamis, 1997, 17:281-316.

Bert Hansen, American Physicians = >Discovery= of Homosexuals, 1880-1900: A New Diagnosis in a Changing Society, @ Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, revised, Judith Walzer Leavitt and Ronald L. Numbers, eds., pp. 13-31.

- * Barbara Ellen Smith, "Black Lung: The Social Production of Disease," International Journal of Health Services, 11, 1981, pp. 343-359.

Study Questions:

1. What is a socially constructed disease?
2. What is the role of social images and stereotypes in each of these cases? How do they differ?

4. October 1 Venereal Diseases, AIDS, and the Politics of Health and Sickness (Seminar)

Required reading (three of the following):

- * Elizabeth Fee, "Sin vs. Science: Venereal Disease in Twentieth Century Baltimore," in AIDS: The Burdens of History, pp. 121-146.

- * Allan M. Brandt, "AIDS: From Social History to Social Policy," in AIDS: The Burdens of History, pp. 147-171.

- * Gerald M. Oppenheimer, "In the Eye of the Storm: The Epidemiological

Construction of AIDS," in AIDS: The Burdens of History, pp. 267-300.

- * Guenter B. Risse, "Epidemics in History: Ecological Perspectives and Social Responses," in AIDS: The Burdens of History, pp. 33-66.
- * Rachel Swarns, "Dissent on AIDS by South Africa's President: Thoughtfulness or Folly?" New York Times, July 8, 2000.

Study Questions:

1. Are/were Asexual@ diseases different from others?
2. What have and haven=t we learned about std's and why?
3. What is universal and what is local in the human response to epidemics?
4. Why have Thabo Mbeki's reflections on AIDS stirred such controversy?

5. October 8 The Early Public Health Movement (Lecture)

Required reading (four of the following):

- * Max von Pettenkofer, The Value of Health to A City: Two Popular Lectures. Translated with an introduction by Henry E. Sigerist. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1941, pp 15-52.

Gretchen A. Condran, Henry Williams, and Rose A. Cheney, "The Decline of Mortality in Philadelphia from 1870 to 1930: The Role of Municipal Services," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 452-466.

- * Elizabeth Blackmar, Accountability for Public Health: Regulating the Housing Market in Nineteenth Century New York City,@ in David Rosner, ed., Hives of Sickness: Public Health and Epidemics in New York City, New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1995, pp. 42-64.

Judith Walzer Leavitt, Typhoid Mary= Strikes Back: Bacteriological Theory and Practice in Early 20th-Century Public Health,@ in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 555-574.

Arthur Miller, An Enemy of the People: An Adaptation of the Play by Henrik Ibsen, New York: Penguin Books, 1979.

- * Bert Hansen, "The Image and Advocacy of Public Health in American Caricature and Cartoons from 1860-1900," American Journal of Public Health, 87, 1997, 1798-1807.

Study Questions:

1. What were the most important factors affecting mortality levels, according to these authors? What kind of evidence do they use?
2. How did new scientific and medical developments modify these arguments?
3. Which cartoon do you find most compelling and why?

6. October 15 The Making of Modern Medicine: Dissent, Diffusion, Defiance (Lecture)

Students wishing to write a paper in lieu of the exam must meet with Prof. Birn by this date.

Required reading:

Nancy J. Tomes, "The Private Side of Public Health: Sanitary Science, Domestic Hygiene, and the Germ Theory, 1870-1900," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 506-528.

- * James Harvey Young, "Patent Medicines and the Self-Help Syndrome," in Sickness and Health in America, 2nd edition, pp. 71-78.

Study Question:

What did the new public health and the modernization of medicine do for/to the layperson in quotidian life?

7. October 22 Race/Ethnicity and Health in the United States (Part I: Film)

In-class screening of "Miss Evers' Boys" (or see it on your own)

Required Reading: See October 29

8. October 29 Race/Ethnicity and Health in the United States (Part II: Seminar)

Required reading for October 22 and 29:

- * Zora Neale Hurston, "My Most Humiliating Jim Crow Experience," in I Love Myself When I am Laughing...and Then When I Am Looking Mean and Impressive, Alice Walker, ed. New York: Feminist Press, 1977, pp. 163-4.

Allan M. Brandt, "Racism and Research: The Case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd ed., pp. 392-404.
- * Thomas W. Murrell, "Syphilis and the American Negro: A Medico-Sociologic Study," Journal of the American Medical Association, 54, 1910, pp. 846-849.
- * Stephen B. Thomas and Sandra Crouse Quinn, "The Tuskegee Syphilis Study, 1932 to 1972: Implications for HIV Education and AIDS Risk Education Programs in the Black Community," American Journal of Public Health, 81, 1991, pp. 1498-1504.
- * Testimony by Four Survivors from the United States Senate Hearings on Human Experimentation, 1973" reprinted in Susan M. Reverby, ed. Tuskegee's Truths: Rethinking the Tuskegee Syphilis Study, Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2000, pp. 136-149.
- * Susan M. Reverby, "Rethinking the Tuskegee Syphilis Study: Nurse Rivers, Silence, and the Meaning of Treatment," reprinted in Susan M. Reverby, ed. Tuskegee's Truths: Rethinking the Tuskegee Syphilis Study, Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2000, pp. 365-385.
- * Darlene Clark Hine, "Reflections on Nurse Rivers," reprinted in Susan M. Reverby, ed. Tuskegee's Truths: Rethinking the Tuskegee Syphilis Study, Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2000, pp. 386-395.

Plus two of the following:

- * Vanessa Gamble, "Under the Shadow of Tuskegee: African Americans and Health Care," American Journal of Public Health, 87, 1997, pp. 1773-1778.
- * Deborah Dwork, "Health Conditions of Immigrant Jews on the Lower East Side of New York: 1880-1914," Medical History, 25, 1981, pp. 1-40.
- * Alan M. Kraut, "Healers and Strangers: Immigrant Attitudes Toward the

Physician in America--A Relationship in Historical Perspective," Journal of the American Medical Association, 263, 1990, pp. 1807-1811.

- * Joan B. Trauner, "The Chinese as Medical Scapegoats in San Francisco," California Historical Quarterly, 57, 1978, pp. 70-87.

Study Questions:

1. How has the media diffusion of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study widened the audience for medical history, particularly among African-Americans? In what ways is this problematic?
2. Why/how has race/ethnicity been used historically as a marker of disease? Is medical discrimination different from other forms?

9. November 5 The Flexner Report (Seminar)

Required reading:

Robert P. Hudson, "Abraham Flexner in Perspective: American Medical Education, 1865-1910," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd ed., pp. 200-210.

- * Howard S. Berliner, "A Larger Perspective on the Flexner Report," International Journal of Health Services, 5, 1975, pp. 573-592.
- * Howard Epps, "The Howard University Medical Department in the Flexner Era: 1910-1929," Journal of the National Medical Association, 81, 1989, pp. 885-911.
- * For an inside view of controversy within the history of medicine, see the four conflicting reviews of E. Richard Brown's Rockefeller Medicine Men in Bulletin of the History of Medicine, 54, 1980, pp. 131-140 and pp. 589-593; and 55, 1981, pp. 434-437. Also see Saul Benison, "Ideology über alles: An Essay Review," Journal of the History of Medicine, 37, 1982, pp. 83-90.

You should also glance through:

Abraham Flexner, Medical Education in the United States and Canada. Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, Bulletin No. 4, New York, 1910. It is available online (using Acrobat) at the following address:
http://www.carnegiefoundation.org/eLibrary/docs/flexner_report.pdf

Study Questions:

1. What did the Flexner Report want and why?
2. What assumptions did Flexner hold about medical education=s social function?
3. Is there such a thing as Acapitalist medicine@?

10. November 12 The Making of the Modern Hospital (Lecture)

Required reading (three of the following):

Morris J. Vogel, "Patrons, Practitioners, and Patients: The Voluntary Hospital in Mid-Victorian Boston," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 323-333.

Charles E. Rosenberg, "Social Class and Medical Care in 19th-Century America: The Rise and Fall of the Dispensary," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 309-322.

Vanessa Northington Gamble, "Roots of the Black Hospital Reform Movement," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 369-391.

Gerald N. Grob, "The Severely and Chronically Mentally Ill in America: Retrospect and Prospect," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd ed, pp. 334-348.

Study Questions:

1. What were the major changes that U.S. hospitals underwent from the late 19th to the early 20th century?
2. How does each author problematize the hospital?

11. November 19 Women as Care-Givers (Seminar)

Required reading (three of the following):

- * Christopher Keane, "Managerial Hegemony, Cultural Change, and the Transformation of Infant Care Advice in the United States in the 20th Century," International Journal of Health Services, 2001, 31(1), pp. 271-290.

- * Darlene Clark Hine, "Co-Laborers in the Work of the Lord: Nineteenth-Century Black Women Physicians," in "Send Us a Lady Physician": Women Doctors in America, 1835-1920, Ruth J. Abram, ed. New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 1985, pp. 107-120.
 - * Karen Buhler-Wilkerson, "Bringing Care to the People: Lillian Wald's Legacy to Public Health Nursing," American Journal of Public Health, 83, 1993, pp. 1778-1786; and Susan M. Reverby, "From Lillian Wald to Hillary Rodham Clinton: What Will Happen to Public Health Nursing?" American Journal of Public Health, 83, 1993, pp. 1662-1663.
 - * Elizabeth Temkin, Driving Through: Post-Partum Care During World War II,@ American Journal of Public Health, 89, 1999, pp. 587-595.
- Regina Markell Morantz, "The Connecting Link: The Case for the Woman Doctor in 19th-Century America," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 213-224.
- Laurel Thatcher Ulrich, Martha Moore Ballard and the Medical Challenge to Midwifery,@ in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 72-84.
- * Susan Smith, The Public Health Work of Poor Rural Women: Black Midwives in Mississippi,@ in Sick and Tired of Being Sick and Tired, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1995, pp. 118-148.

passim: Committee for the Study of Nursing Education (Goldmark Report), Nursing and Nursing Education in the United States. Macmillan: New York, 1923.

Study Questions:

1. What do maternity and maternal and child health have to do with community and the state?
2. How do class and race/ethnicity distinctions in the United States influence the emergence of women healers?

12. November 26 **Financing Health Care: Some Historical Precedents to Contemporary Debates** (Seminar/Slide show)

MUSEUM PAPER DUE

Required reading (three of the following):

Ronald L. Numbers, "The Third Party: Health Insurance in America," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 269-283.

- * Barbara Bridgman Perkins, "An Economic Organization of Medicine and the Committee on the Costs of Medical Care," @ American Journal of Public Health, 88, 1998, 1721-6.
- * Elizabeth Fee, "The Evolution of Health Care and Health Care Financing as Seen from the 21st Century," in Health Care Financing: The Next Fifty Years. New York: Empire Blue Cross and Blue Shield, 1986, pp. 143-153.
- * Henry Sigerist, "From Bismarck to Beveridge: Developments and Trends in Social Security Legislation," in Henry E. Sigerist on the Sociology of Medicine, edited by Milton Roemer. New York: MD Publications, 1960, pp. 118-138.

plus

- * Vicente Navarro, "Swaying the Health Care Task Force," The Nation 257, 1993, pp. 245-9.
- * Tom Hamburger and Ted Marmor, "Dead on Arrival: Why Washington's Power Elites Won't Consider Single Payer Health Reform," The Washington Monthly, 25, 1993, pp. 27-32.

Study Questions:

1. Why is the U.S. the only industrialized country that does not have universal health insurance coverage?
2. Were the Clinton health reform efforts Adéjà vu all over again@?

13. December 3 International Health and Imperialism (Lecture/Slides)

TAKE-HOME EXAMS WILL BE HANDED OUT AT THE END OF CLASS

Required reading:

- * David Arnold, "Introduction: Disease, Medicine and Empire," in Imperial Medicine and Indigenous Societies, David Arnold, ed., Manchester England: Manchester University Press, 1988, pp. 1-26.
- * Anne-Emanuelle Birn, "Skirting the Issue: Women and International Health in Historical Perspective," American Journal of Public Health, 89, 1999, pp. 399-407.
- * Helen Epstein, "Time of Indifference," New York Review of Books, April 12, 2001.
- * Luis Avilés, "Epidemiology as Discourse: The Politics of Development Institutions in the *Epidemiological Profile* of El Salvador," Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health, 2001, 55: 164-171 and further debate in journal.
- * Paul Farmer and Didi Bertrand, "Hypocrisies of Development and the Health of the Haitian Poor," in Jim Yong Kim et al, eds. Dying for Growth: Global Inequality and the Health of the Poor, Common Courage Press, 2001, pp. 65-89.

Study Questions:

1. Is international public health necessarily imperialist?
2. Is development a necessary precursor to health improvements?

14. December 10 Class, Politics, and Health Care (Seminar)

Required reading (three of the following):

- * Brian Greenberg, "Coming of Age: Local 1199 in the 1960s," in The American General Hospital: Communities and Social Contexts, Diana Elizabeth Long and Janet Golden, eds. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1989, pp. 170-187.

David Rosner and Gerald Markowitz, "The Early Movement for Occupational Safety and Health, 1900-1917," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 467-482.
- * B.S. Warren and Edgar Sydenstricker, "The Relation of Wages to the Public Health,"

American Journal of Public Health, 8, 1918, pp. 883-887.

- * Lynne Page Snyder, "The Death-Dealing Smog over Donora, Pennsylvania: Industrial Air Pollution, Public Health Policy, and the Politics of Expertise, 1948-1949," Environmental History Review, 1994, 18(1):117-139.

Study Question:

How do the intermingling of class power and politics shape health policy developments?
What else is at play?

**15. December 17 Health: Personal, Societal, or Government Responsibility?
(Seminar and Bacchanalia)**

FINAL EXAMS/FINAL PAPERS DUE

Reading:

- * Hilary Graham, "Behaving Well: Women's Health Behaviour in Context," in Women's Health Counts, edited by Helen Roberts. London: Routledge, 1990. pp. 195-219.
 - * Jessica Warner, "Shifting Categories of the Social Harms Associated with Alcohol," American Journal of Public Health, 87, 1997, 1788-1797.
- Allan M. Brandt, "The Cigarette, Risk, and American Culture," in Sickness and Health in America, 3rd edition, pp. 494-505.

Study Question:

Do parties make you sicker or healthier?