

Contents

Preface	iii
Acknowledgments	ix
Executive Summary	E-1
1. Overview	1-1
1.1 Project Objectives and Scope.....	1-2
1.2 Methodology	1-4
1.2.1 Constructing the Timeline of R&D Costs and Benefits	1-6
1.2.2 Measuring the Impact of ATP on Social Returns.....	1-6
1.2.3 Determining Medical Benefits to Patients.....	1-7
1.2.4 Estimating Changes in Health Care Costs.....	1-10
1.2.5 Estimating Private Return on Investment	1-10
1.2.6 Calculating Measures of Economic Return	1-11
1.3 Case Studies of Seven ATP Projects in Tissue Engineering.....	1-12
1.3.1 Human Stem Cell and Hematopoietic Expansion Systems	1-14
1.3.2 Structurally New Biopolymers Derived from Alpha-L Amino Acids	1-15
1.3.3 Disease Treatment Using Living Implantable Microreactors	1-16
1.3.4 Treatment of Diabetes by Proliferated Human Islets in Photocrosslinkable Alginate Capsules	1-17
1.3.5 Fabrication of Clinical Prosthesis from Biomaterials	1-17

1.3.6	Application of Gene Therapy to Treatment of Cardiovascular Diseases	1-18
1.3.7	Universal Donor Organs for Transplantations	1-19
1.4	Summary of Specific Findings	1-20
1.4.1	Summary of Results	1-21
1.4.2	Sources of Project Variations	1-24
1.4.3	Methodological Limitations	1-25
1.5	Conclusions.....	1-27

2. Methodology 2-1

2.1	The Timeline of R&D Investment Costs and Benefits	2-2
2.1.1	The R&D Phase	2-4
2.1.2	The Commercialization Phase	2-4
2.1.3	The Production Phase.....	2-6
2.2	Measuring the Impact of ATP on Technology Development.....	2-7
2.2.1	ATP's Acceleration of R&D.....	2-7
2.2.2	ATP's Impact on the Probability of Success.....	2-9
2.2.3	Widening the Scope of an ATP Project	2-12
2.3	Evaluating Medical Benefits to Patients	2-13
2.3.1	Valuing Per-Patient Changes in Health Outcomes	2-13
2.3.2	Determining the Number of Beneficiaries	2-26
2.4	Estimating Changes in Health Care Costs	2-30
2.5	Calculating Returns to Private Companies	2-31
2.5.1	Determining R&D Investment.....	2-32
2.5.2	Determining Costs of Commercialization and Production	2-33
2.5.3	Calculating Revenues	2-35
2.5.4	Estimating the Probability of Technical Success ...	2-35
2.6	Calculating Measures of Economic Return.....	2-36
2.6.1	Constructing the Time Profile of Benefits and Costs for Each Scenario	2-37
2.6.2	Choosing Measures of Economic Return.....	2-38
2.6.3	Choosing a Discount Rate	2-40
2.6.4	Conducting Sensitivity Analysis	2-42

2.7	Methodological Challenges and Limitations.....	2-42
2.7.1	Characterizing New and Defender Technologies.....	2-42
2.7.2	Modeling Medical Benefits.....	2-43
2.7.3	Forecasting Market Penetration.....	2-44
2.7.4	Estimating Company Costs and Revenues	2-44
2.7.5	Calculating Social and Private Returns.....	2-45

3. Tissue Engineering Case Studies 3-1

3.1	Case Study Applications.....	3-1
3.1.1	Human Stem Cell and Hematopoietic Expansion Systems	3-3
3.1.2	Structurally New Biopolymers Derived from Alpha-L Amino Acids	3-10
3.1.3	Disease Treatment Using Living Implantable Microreactors	3-17
3.1.4	Treatment of Diabetes by Proliferated Human Islets in Photocrosslinkable Alginate Capsules	3-26
3.1.5	Fabrication of Clinical Prosthesis from Biomaterials	3-32
3.1.6	Application of Gene Therapy to Treatment of Cardiovascular Diseases	3-38
3.1.7	Universal Donor Organs for Transplantations	3-45
3.2	Case Study Results	3-52
3.2.1	Private and Social Return on Investment in ATP Tissue Engineering Projects	3-52
3.2.2	Sources of Project Variations	3-58
3.2.3	Methodological Limitations	3-59
3.3	Conclusions and Potential Improvements.....	3-62
3.3.1	Developing, Applying, and Improving the Methodology.....	3-63
3.3.2	Summary of Social Returns from Seven ATP Projects in Tissue Engineering.....	3-66

References R-1

Appendixes

A	Market Diffusion Interview Materials, Summaries, and Results	A-1
B	Sensitivity Analysis.....	B-1

Figures

Figure 1-1	Elements Determining Social Return on Public Investment and Social Return on Investment.....	1-5
Figure 1-2	Valuing Per-Patient Changes in Health Outcomes.....	1-9
Figure 2-1	The Timing of Costs and Benefits from Investments in New Technologies	2-3
Figure 2-2	The Total and Marginal Probability of Technical Success.....	2-5
Figure 2-3	Impact of Acceleration on Social Returns.....	2-8
Figure 2-4	The Firm’s Optimal Level of R&D Effort	2-10
Figure 2-5	Impact of ATP Funding on R&D Effort.....	2-11
Figure 2-6	Chronic Disease Model of Health and Cost Impacts of New Technologies	2-15
Figure 2-7	Acute Illness and Injury Model of Health and Cost Impacts of New Technologies.....	2-17
Figure 2-8	The Classic Diffusion Curve.....	2-27
Figure 2-9	Bass (Mixed-Influence) Diffusion Model	2-27
Figure 3-1	Cancer Diagnosis Model.....	3-42

Tables

Table 1-1	Overview of ATP Projects Included in this Study.....	1-13
Table 1-2	Expected Social Return on Public Investment: ATP Projects in Tissue Engineering for a Single Preliminary Application	1-21
Table 1-3	Social Return on Investment and Social Return on Public Investment: ATP Projects in Tissue Engineering for a Single Preliminary Application	1-22
Table 1-4	Impact of ATP Funding on the Development of Medical Technologies for Seven Tissue Engineering Projects	1-23
Table 1-5	Composite Private Returns: ATP Projects in Tissue Engineering for a Single Preliminary Application.....	1-24
Table 2-1	Comparison of QALY Utility-Weights for Different Health States.....	2-23
Table 2-2	Alternative QALY Values	2-25
Table 3-1	Sources of Outcome and Cost Data	3-2
Table 3-2	Model Assumptions for “Human Stem Cell and Hematopoietic Expansion Systems”	3-4
Table 3-3	Expected Market Penetration of Aastrom’s CPS	3-8
Table 3-4	Model Assumptions for “Structurally New Biopolymers Derived from Alpha-L Amino Acids”.....	3-11
Table 3-5	Number of Patients with Injuries Repairable with Integra’s Fracture Fixation Materials.....	3-15
Table 3-6	Number of Patients Treated with Integra’s Bioabsorbable Fracture Fixation Products	3-15
Table 3-7	Costs of Materials and Procedures for Fracture Fixation.....	3-15
Table 3-8	Model Assumptions for “Disease Treatment Using Living Implantable Microreactors”	3-18

Table 3-9	Annual Health States, QALYs, and Cost for the Diabetes Model	3-21
Table 3-10	Transition Matrixes for the Diabetes Model: Conventional Treatment	3-22
Table 3-11	Expected Market Penetration for BioHybrid’s Diabetes Treatment	3-24
Table 3-12	Model Assumptions for “Treatment of Diabetes by Proliferated Human Islets in Photocrosslinkable Alginate Capsules”	3-28
Table 3-13	Expected Market Penetration for the VivoRx Diabetes Treatment Technology	3-30
Table 3-14	Model Assumptions for “Fabrication of Clinical Prostheses from Biomaterials”	3-33
Table 3-15	Expected Market Penetration for the Tissue Engineering’s ADMAT Material for Repairing the ACL	3-36
Table 3-16	Model Assumptions for “Application of Gene Therapy to Treatment of Cardiovascular Disease”	3-39
Table 3-17	Expected Market Penetration for Progenitor’s Tumor Imaging Technology	3-43
Table 3-18	Model Assumptions for “Universal Donor Organs for Transplantation”	3-46
Table 3-19	Expected Market Penetration of UniGraft Hearts	3-49
Table 3-20	Expected Social Return on Public Investment: ATP Tissue Engineering Projects for a Single Preliminary Application.....	3-52
Table 3-21	Social Return on Investment and Social Return on Public Investment: ATP Tissue Engineering Projects for a Single Preliminary Application	3-53
Table 3-22	Impact of ATP Funding on the Development of Medical Technologies for Seven Tissue Engineering Projects	3-55
Table 3-23	Impact of Acceleration Effect on Social Return on Public Investment.....	3-55
Table 3-24	Composite Private Returns: ATP Projects in Tissue Engineering for a Single Preliminary Application.....	3-56
Table 3-25	Limitations of the Health Benefits Models	3-60